

AM
1934
S

**Boston University
College of Liberal Arts
Library**

THE GIFT OF

the Author

378.744

BO

AM 1934

S
C1

52111

B O S T O N U N I V E R S I T Y
G R A D U A T E S C H O O L

Thesis

M U N I C I P A L G O V E R N M E N T I N B O S T O N
1 8 2 2 -- 1 9 3 4

by

Nathaniel Morton Safford, Jr.
(A.B., Harvard University, 1930)

submitted in partial fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts

1934

POST OFFICE
NEW YORK

1901

52111

NEW YORK

Postmaster
(New York, N.Y.)

Postage paid
to the order of
the Postmaster

1901

INDEX

	Page
<u>Chapter I. Politics.</u>	1
1. Public Opinion - Is There Any?	1
2. Social Groupings	1
3. The Tools	2
4. Who the Interests Are and What They Want .	2
5. How They Get What They Want	3
6. Why Do the People Let Them Get Away With It?	3
7. The Ways of the Politician	4
8. Why Isn't More Disclosed?	6
9. Personalities and Parties	6
10. Organizations: Taxpayers' Leagues, Economy League, City Club, etc. . .	7
11. Bases of Election	10
<u>Chapter II. Relationship of Boston to State and County</u> .	12
1. Boston the City and Boston the Metropolitan Area	12
2. United States Census Treatment of the Boston Area	12
3. The Lack of Coordination within the Metro- politan Area	13
4. Stumbling Blocks to Annexation or Coordin- ation of Facilities	14

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2017 with funding from
Boston Library Consortium Member Libraries

	Page
5. Means Other than Annexation Were Used for Handling Specific Services	15
6. Does Metropolitan District Commission Meet with Favor?	17
7. The Metropolitan Planning Division	18
8. The Metropolitan Transit District	19
9. General Comments on "Metropolitanization" .	20

Chapter III. Evolution 21

1. Colonial History	21
2. Change from Town to City	22
3. The First Charter	22
4. Revision of 1854	24
5. Revision of 1885	25
6. Charter of 1909	26
7. Mayor Mathews	27

Chapter IV. Present Structure of Government 28

1. Historical Growth	28
2. The Mayor and his Election	28
3. Mayor's Legislative Powers	29
4. Mayor's Appointing Powers	30
5. The City Council	30
6. The School Committee	31
7. Departments under State Authority	32
8. Two Mixed Units of Organization	33

1. General Comments on "Heterocyclic Compounds"	20
2. The Heterocyclic Compound Series	10
3. The Heterocyclic Compound Division	12
4. Test with Heavy	17
5. Does Heterocyclic Compound Division	15
6. Heterocyclic Compound Series	15
7. Heterocyclic Compound Series	15
8. Heterocyclic Compound Series	15

Chapter III. Overview

1. Localized Series	21
2. Change from Town to City	22
3. The First Chapter	23
4. Revision of 1854	24
5. Revision of 1854	25
6. Revision of 1854	26
7. Local Series	27

Chapter IV. Present Structure of Government

1. Historical Growth	28
2. The Mayor and the Director	29
3. Mayor's Executive Powers	30
4. Mayor's Executive Powers	30
5. The City Council	30
6. The School Board	31
7. Representative under State Authority	32
8. The Fixed Units of Organization	32

	Page
9. Departments Whose Officials are All or in Part Appointed by the Mayor . . .	34
10. The Future of Administration	35

<u>Chapter V. Graft, Corruption and Waste</u>	36
---	----

1. Idea of Graft as being Necessary and Unimportant	36
2. The Bill for an Investigation	36
3. Hearing on the Bill to Investigate	37
4. The Bill to Investigate is Traded for a Cut in Salaries	38
5. Certain Fundamentals are Involved	39
6. The Problem before the Turn of the Century.	39
7. What is Involved in the Problem Today . . .	41
8. Conclusions: That Corruption has been Rampant	49

<u>Chapter VI. Finance</u>	51
----------------------------	----

1. Elements in the Problem of Boston's Financial Administration	51
2. The Budget	52
3. The Budget as Acted upon by the City Council	54
4. The City Accounts and Audits	56
5. The Departmental Reports	59
6. Expenditures and their Relations to the Tax Bill	60

9. Amendments to the Bill of 1934 . . . 54
10. The future of administration . . . 55

Chapter V. Social, Economic and Labor

1. The Social and Economic Situation . . . 56
2. The Bill for an Investigation . . . 57
3. Hearings on the Bill for Investigation . . . 58
4. The Bill for Investigation is Passed for a
Vote in Salaries . . . 59
5. Certain Amendments are Introduced . . . 60
6. The Problem before the House of the Country . . . 61
7. What is Involved in the Problem Today . . . 62
8. Conclusion: The Government has been
Remounted . . . 63

Chapter VI. Finance

1. Remarks in the House of Representatives
Financial Administration . . . 64
2. The Budget . . . 65
3. The Budget as acted upon by the City
Council . . . 66
4. The City Accounts and Assets . . . 67
5. The Departmental Reports . . . 68
6. Expenditures and their relations to the

	Page
7. The City Treasurer	61
8. Summary and Criticism	62
9. Final Note on Civic Education	101
<u>Chapter VII. Reorganization.</u>	65
1. The Possibilities for Improvement	65
2. Reasons that Compel a Halt being Called on Expenditures	65
3. Waste and Overmanning	69
4. Consolidation	70
<u>Chapter VIII. Health and Hospital Activities, Public and Private.</u>	76
1. Change in Viewpoint Adopted	76
2. The General Problem	76
3. Hospitals, Physicians and Nurses	77
4. Boston's Health Department	80
5. Health Education	83
6. The Problem and the Need	91
<u>Chapter IX. "The Future"</u>	93
1. Helps to City Administration	93
2. Bureau of Research	93
3. City, County and Regional Planning	96
4. Possibilities of City Manager	98
5. Mechanical Appliances	98
6. Cooperation between Departments	99

7. The City Treasurer	51
8. Summary and Criticism	52

Chapter VII. Reorganization. 53

1. The possibilities for improvement	54
2. Reasons that compel a half hearted effort	55
3. Waste and overworking	56
4. Corollaries	57

Chapter VIII. Health and Hospital Activities, Public and Private. 58

1. Change in viewpoint adopted	58
2. The general problem	59
3. Hospitals, Physicians and Nurses	60
4. Boston's Health Department	61
5. Health Education	62
6. The Problem and the Need	63

Chapter IX. "The Future" 64

1. Steps to City Administration	64
2. Bureau of Research	65
3. City, County and Regional Planning	66
4. Possibilities of City Manager	67
5. Technical Appliances	68
6. Cooperation between Departments	69

7. Rapid Change in the Field of Corporation

Law, Home Rule and Housing 100

8. Faint Hope for Civic Education 101

9. The Portents 101

Summary

102

Bibliography

103

8. Social Groupings.

We have a city today with many social groups some competing, some cooperating with each other.² In the matter of religion, the preponderance is with the Catholic group; the minority Protestant and Jewish.

From the economic point of view there are two classes of people - the few and the many. The few, who own and control industry and commerce and real estate, the many who are sometimes referred to as the "wage-slaves." The many are not politically one - the importance of religious, fraternal and labor organizations is obvious. The Catholics tend to unite in

2. Harvey, Chester C. "Urban Democracy" p. 150-151.

7. Rapid Change in the Field of Corporation	100
Law, Home Rule and Housing	101
8. Point Hope for Civic Education	101
9. The Parents	101

Summary

102

Bibliography

103

Chapter I. Politics

1. Public Opinion - Is There Any?

At the time when certain respectable citizens of Boston, masquerading as savages, dumped some cases of tea into the harbor, the town may have been small enough to have had a unified public opinion. Judging from the tumultuous sessions of annual meetings still being held in New England towns, it is extremely unlikely that any such condition ever prevailed. To expect a unified, vigilant, aggressive and intelligent public opinion under such complex conditions as exist in 1934, is out of the question. Social, political, economic, religious and other groupings tend away from unity.

2. Social Groupings.

We have a city today with many social groups some competing, some cooperating with each other.¹ In the matter of religion, the preponderance is with the Catholic group; the minority Protestant and Jewish.

From the economic point of view there are two classes of people - the few and the many. The few, who control industry and commerce and real estate, the many who are sometimes referred to as the "wage-slaves." The many are not politically one - the importance of religious, fraternal and labor organizations is obvious. The Catholics tend to unite in

1. Maxey, Chester C. "Urban Democracy" p. 150-151.

Chapter I. Politics

I. Public Opinion - Is There Any?

At the time when certain respectable citi-

zens of Boston, masquerading as savages, dumped some cases of tea into the harbor, the town may have been small enough to have had a unified public opinion. Judging from the tumultuous sessions of annual meetings still being held in New England towns, it is extremely unlikely that any such condition ever prevailed. To expect a unified, vigilant, aggressive and intelligent public opinion under such complex conditions as exist in 1934, is out of the question. Social, political, economic, religious and other groupings tend away from unity.

2. Social Groupings.

We have a city today with many social

groups some competing, some cooperating with each other. In the matter of religion, the preponderance is with the Catholic group; the minority Protestant and Jewish.

From the economic point of view there are

two classes of people - the few and the many. The few, who control industry and commerce and real estate, the many who are sometimes referred to as the "wage-slaves." The many are not politically one - the importance of religious, fraternal and labor organizations is obvious. The Catholics tend to unite in

economic and political groupings, as do the Protestants and Jews. The motivation is often personal and local.

3. The Tools.

The important factor in the game of politics is, of course, the politician. Just as with the people there are species and subdivisions, Democrats and Republicans, Lomasney men, Curley men and Innes men.

Many writers assume that the politician is simply a "broker", a tool that can be bought by the highest bidder.¹ Men who are masters of organization, who can convert the peoples' ignorance and inertia into majorities at the polls.

The "interests" of the city have "worked through" the various incumbent administrations. They have not necessarily elected them. To be sure the interests may have hedged their future success by donating campaign sums to all likely winners, but that they have deliberately run and elected more than one important candidate in the last thirty years can not be proved and is highly doubtful.

4. Who the Interests Are and What They Want.

Banks who want to be the depositaries and brokers for the city, manufacturers and jobbers who want to sell goods to the city, contracting companies who have services to sell, insurance agencies, bonding agencies, illegal enterprises (bootlegging, prostitution, gambling, and racketeering) that need protection, plus a vast number of small fry who want to be in on this, that, and the other thing.² Many hands grasp at the city pocketbook.

1. Maxey, ibid. p. 159.

2. Ibid. p. 160

5. How They Get What They Want.

The party boss, the machine, are terms that are usually used in connection with this angle of the discussion. In books about politicians who have "gotten there", of newspaper men who retrospect, of reformers, of some big business men, there is constant reference to some one's going to the boss, getting him to swing the machine for some given person or project. To many a reader this is a little far fetched; it happened twenty years ago, or it happened in another city, or the names are strange. Stories of political deals are continually circulating around the city.

The actual way in which the politician and his constituents arrange matters may take a number of different forms. A contractor may build a house for considerably less than cost, thus the politician who buys the house is getting something for less than the article's worth, yet no money or bribe as such can be imputed to either party. Another method is for the politicians in power to arrange for street widenings with consequent damages to abutting land - the owners of the abutting land are of course the politicians' friends. Still another method is for those who wish favors to give to the political office holders trips to Florida and their expenses paid at sumptuous hotels. Again friends and relations of those in office may be engaged in some business with which the city may find it convenient to deal, bonding and insurance for example. The ways are many and devious.

6. Why Do the People Let Them Get Away with It?

As will be pointed out later the people of Boston are not well organized either for or against any general political end.¹ Uninterestedness, ignorance, and the tradition of honest graft with its newer modifications, are the real reasons that the organized interests, working through the politicians do get away with it. Part and parcel of this is the propensity or the natural susceptibility of most citizens to play ball with the politicians because of the small favors forthcoming. This may run all the way from the fixing of automobile tags or the allowing of water bills to run unpaid for several years, to the district attorney's non-prosecuting of serious criminal offenses.

7. The Ways of the Politician.

It is possible for the public utilities to be held up by the politicians. Let us suppose that a transportation company wishes to extend a bus line into a new area. Demand might come from a large portion of the residents in the area into which the proposed bus line was to run, but this would not prevent the city councillor from any other district of the city from refusing to sanction the project until he was bought off. Such possibilities would seem to fall in with the general philosophy expressed by Lincoln Steffens, when he said that business was not interested in reform, that it wanted men in office with whom it could "do business."

Let us suppose that a certain inspector in the Building Department is willing to relax the rules relating to building construction as applied to an apartment building,

1. Chapter I, Section 10, infra.

As will be pointed out later the people of Boston are not well organized either for or against any general political end. Ignorance, and the tradition of honest graft with its newer modifications, are the real reasons that the organized interests, working through the politicians do get away with it. Part and parcel of this is the propensity or the natural susceptibility of most citizens to play ball with the politicians because of the small favors forthcoming. This may run all the way from the fixing of sub-mobile tags or the allowing of water bills to run unpaid for several years, to the district attorney's non-prosecuting of serious criminal offenses.

V. The Ways of the Politician.

It is possible for the public utilities to be held up by the politicians. Let us suppose that a transportation company wishes to extend a bus line into a new area. Demand might come from a large portion of the residents in the area into which the proposed bus line was to run, but this would not prevent the city councillor from any other district of the city from refusing to sanction the project until he was bought off. Such possibilities would seem to fall in with the general philosophy expressed by Lincoln Steffens, when he said that business was not interested in reform, that it wanted men in office with whom it could "do business."

Let us suppose that a certain inspector in the Building Department is willing to relax the rules relating to building construction as applied to an apartment building.

for a "reasonable" sum. Contractors would make considerable efforts to keep that man in his position.

Intimidation and threat is often resorted to to gain political objectives. A recent politician who was evidently versed in gangster language if not methods is reported to have said to a leader of a tax reform organization in Boston, "Mr. Blank, you'd better lay off that stuff. You live too near the Quincy granite quarries." (The quarries into which one of the Curran gangsters had just been pushed off and drowned for being a squealer. What Mr. Blank was told to lay off of was an investigation of bribery.)

Flat refusals to give facts and information of a supposedly public matter are sometimes resorted to. An official may refuse to furnish information and statistics regarding his department if he thinks there will be political repercussions.

In the Assessing Department great abuses have unquestionably taken place. A certain firm of attorneys in Boston will produce tax abatements if their clients will promise them a very juicy slice of the first and second year's abatements. Query: Why are they alone able to do so, and why their record of successful abatements?

In later chapters mention will be made of Boston, streets, which have been well christened streets of gold. A ring of four contractors handle all this paving business. The city's insistence on a patented paving material only manufacturable by these four lies at the bottom of this particu-

For a "successful" case, Contractors would not be liable for the cost of the work.

Indication of a case is not a matter of course.

to the gain of the object. A recent politician who was

indicated to be in contact with the other side is not

to have said to a leader of a tax reform organization in Boston,

"Mr. Smith, would you like to see the other side?"

One thing is certain. The question is not which one of

the other side has been pushed off and around for

being a success. What Mr. Smith was told to let off was

investigation of the case.

First refusal to give facts and information

of a possibly public matter and refusal to report to

official may be as to furnish information and statistics

and the report is as follows: there will be no report

on the case.

In the meantime, the case is not a matter of

the case is not a matter of the case.

is not a matter of the case. It is not a matter of

the case is not a matter of the case. It is not a matter of

the case is not a matter of the case. It is not a matter of

the case is not a matter of the case. It is not a matter of

the case is not a matter of the case. It is not a matter of

the case is not a matter of the case. It is not a matter of

the case is not a matter of the case. It is not a matter of

the case is not a matter of the case. It is not a matter of

the case is not a matter of the case. It is not a matter of

lar abuse.

8. Why Isn't More Disclosed?

Boston's trouble has been to uncover the guilty parties. Several times when this has been threatened, a trade of one sort or another was made to prevent any important disclosures.

Those who control the votes in the Legislature are often the same ones who have benefited by some particular fraud or robbery perpetrated on the city. They cannot call for general investigation without running the risk of themselves being caught. It is difficult to find men with power to force disclosures who are not at the same time linked up with what is to be disclosed.

There is very little hope in the disclosure and reform angle - the same situation exists in all our large cities. Temporarily Cincinnati and a few other smaller cities have pushed the old line politician out in the cold. But that is not the common condition of our big cities. Kansas City, for example, has been smothered by the politicians, the gang and the system. Not encouraging is the view of the politically wise who see us as hell bent for socialism with the prospect that when we arrive in that Elysian condition our political masters will be the very same gentlemen who have misruled us in the past, with scope increased.

9. Personalities and Parties.

In Boston there are a few "principals" who might be considered as running the city - sort of natural

... the 1st of June 1900

... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the

... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the

... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the

... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the
... Boston's fronting has been to answer the

... the 1st of June 1900

In Boston's fronting has been to answer the

... Boston's fronting has been to answer the

leaders, if you like. Martin Lomasney of old Ward 9 is a fine example. James M. Curley and John I. Fitzgerald are others. Behind the scenes there are also a few powerful figures, men who pull the strings and whose puppets hold the offices. Of this type, Innes is the best example.

There are about 170,000 Democrats and 80,000 Republicans. This is the pattern on which both parties work. The natural leaders are secure in a knowledge that most of "the people", the 170,000 Democrats, can be lined up behind themselves. The Republicans manoeuvring to split that Democratic vote into several factions, the Democrats attempting to present a solid front - such is the struggle. The result is certain, if only one Democrat runs against one Republican, the Democrat will win. If the Democrats can be split into several factions against one Republican candidate, the Republican candidate may win. The result is uncertain where two Republicans oppose several Democrats.

So far in our discussion we have seen a predominantly Democratic city with natural leaders, an Irish stock, with scatterings of Italians, negroes, and Jews.

10. Organizations: Taxpayers' Leagues, Economy League, City Club, etc.

The Good Government Association has recently wound up its existence by the election of its candidate Mr. Mansfield. During the several decades of its existence it has worked in a non-partisan way to choose and elect honest, capable candidates for city offices. In the process of so doing

leadership, it was like, Martin Luther King Jr. is a fine example. James E. Farmer and John L. Lewis are others. But the people know and also a few powerful figures, who are still alive and whose people hold the offices. Of late, there is a new example.

There are about 15,000 Democrats and 30,000 Republicans. This is the pattern on which both parties work. The national leaders are seen in a knowledge that each of "the people", the 150,000 Democrats, can be taken by surprise. The Republican movement is to split the Democrats in two into several factions, the Democrats attempting to present a solid front - such is the strategy. The result is certain. Only one Democrat runs against one Republican, the Democrats will win. If the Democrats can be split into several factions against one Republican candidate, the Republican candidate will win. The result is to maintain more two Republican seats against Democrats.

Earlier in our discussion we have seen a predominantly Democratic city with natural leaders, an Irish Catholic, and Jews.

10. Opposition: Taxpayers' League, money

League, City Club, etc.

The Good Government Association has re-

cently wound up its existence by the election of its candidate, Mr. Daniel, taking the several thousands of its existence in the process of so doing.

it became a clearing house for statistics and information about the city government. It was financed largely by Back Bay blue bloods. The depression and the last campaign in which many of its contributors were alienated by the 'goo goo' choice, left the Association without resources and the directors decided to disband. The unfortunate choice of name lent itself too easily to political cartooning.

In Boston the pressure of organizations has not been great. Propaganda for retrenchment has come from the larger real estate interests, principally the Boston Real Estate Exchange. This organization is powerful in everything except votes, which are all essential.

The Massachusetts Taxpayers' Association, largely an organization of the smaller Boston Real Estate holders, has been busy, noisy, but not effective. For the building of the Association up to its present membership and for the obtaining of a considerable amount of publicity, credit belongs to its secretary, a woman. The Association is mentioned, not for any power that it has or results that can be traced to it, but because it is one of the two organized, anti-graft groups that have dared to lift their heads in Boston in recent years.

The National Economy League was born and financed with grand visions of national and local surveys, and recommendations. In national affairs the Economy League may have justified its existence - it beat the bonus. In local Boston affairs it has appeared before the Legislature at various times with tables and figures in support of economy measures.

it became a clearing house for statistics, and information about the city government. It was financed largely by Back Bay blue bloods. The depression and the last campaign in which many of its contributors were alienated by the 'goo goo' choice, left the Association without resources and the directors decided to disband. The unfortunate choice of name lent itself too easily to political cartooning.

In Boston the pressure of organizations has not been great. Propaganda for retrenchment has come from the larger real estate interests, principally the Boston Real Estate Exchange. This organization is powerful in everything except votes, which are all essential.

The Massachusetts Taxpayers' Association, largely an organization of the smaller Boston Real Estate holders, has been busy, noisy, but not effective. For the building of the Association up to its present membership and for the raising of a considerable amount of publicity, credit belongs to its secretary, a woman. The Association is mentioned, not for any power that it has or results that can be traced to it, but because it is one of the two organized, anti-graft groups that have dared to lift their heads in Boston in recent years.

The National Economy League was born and financed with grand visions of national and local surveys, and recommendations. In national affairs, the Economy League may have justified its existence - it beat the bums. In local Boston affairs it has appeared before the legislature at various times with tables and figures in support of economy measures.

Its working representative, a once able statistician may yet bring glory upon the organization. He is hampered by lack of an adequate staff and it is quite possible that the Economy League organization will be allowed to die as soon as the bonus issue is off the horizon of political possibilities.

The Boston City Club and several other organizations in the city are forums rather than leaders. The Boston City Club was organized by Edward A. Filene and other men, who hoped that through the facilities of such a club, the various sections of the people might be brought together and united, in order that some of the worst elements be driven out of the city's politics. Despite the high purpose of the Boston City Club it cannot be credited with any effect on the recent course of the city's history. It is a gathering place handy to City Hall, the Court House and the State House; a club for men of moderate means where they can get together in their natural social and economic groupings, but no more than that. The Colonel's lady and Judy O'Grady may be sisters under the skin, but their husbands do not congregate together unless expediency dictates. The Boston City Club has failed of its original ideal.

There are innumerable small organizations varying all the way from the high-hat Beacon Hill Association to the East Boston Social and Athletic Club. In every mayoral election the unknowing candidate is likely to discover to his economic grief that a visit by the representative of these clubs is nothing more than a "touch." The club may not have three members, it may not be able to swing a single vote, but it is

pleased to accept a donation from each and every candidate.

11. Bases of Election.

Most voters are apathetic to council members, knowing that at best their City Council member is of small importance. The smaller business men and interests, and the drifters on and off the welfare rolls are the principal interested parties in the success or failure of councilors.

The School Committee members are of middling importance. The mayor generally runs his own School Committee candidates either openly or sub rosa, because by so doing and being successful he can control the spending of some 14 millions of dollars.

The highest in importance is the mayor. Appeals to class, race, religion hold equal rank with personality and issue in the final determination of a Boston election. The radio and the sound-truck are two recent innovations in municipal electioneering that bid fair to oust the old red light flare parades.

* * * * *

With such bases for the city's elective offices it is strange that we get as high grade men as we do. Appeals seem to be made and seem to be successful on any basis except qualifications. If we are going to continue to elect our city administrative and legislative officials on bases that have so little to do with calibre, then we should not be unduly optimistic about the resulting administration of the city's affairs.

planned to accept a nomination from each and every candidate.

12. Issues of Election.

Most voters are anxious to know in an election year, knowing that at best their City Council member is of small importance. The smaller business men and interests, and the citizens of our city are well to do and the financial interests are getting in the way of the success of our city.

The school committee members are of middle and importance. The mayor generally runs his school committee candidates either openly or through the back door and being successful he can control the spending of some millions of dollars.

The highest in importance is the mayor. Aspects to class, race, religion, and social status are all taken into account in the final determination of a Boston election. The radio and the sound-film are two recent innovations in municipal administration that will help to cost the city and state more money.

With such issues for the city's elective offices it is strange that we get as high grade men as we do. Another reason for the high grade men is that they are successful in any business except qualifications. If we are going to continue to elect only city administrative and legislative officials on bases that have so little to do with caliber, then we should not be unduly optimistic about the resulting administration of the city's affairs.

If a man should be elected mayor and should be desirous of improving the city government, nevertheless he is likely to be a man untrained for the work that he forthwith would be engrossed in. On these grounds then, training and qualification, the city manager exponents have a compelling argument. Further discussion of this matter would be out of place, since in this chapter we are dealing with things as they are rather than as they should be.

The suburbs which ring the city of the north, west and south are not politically part of Mexico. They are a social and economic zone which are not politically a part of Mexico. They are a part of the metropolitan area. However political boundaries have prevented this large metropolitan area from becoming politically "united."

2. United States Census Bureau of the Census says

The 1920 United States Census shows that the United States has an area of 3,600,000 square miles. The city proper has an area of 45.0 miles and a population of 2,000,000. The metropolitan area has an area of 275.4 square miles and a population of 1,772,000. The central business district is an area of 1.2 square miles. The area from which people travel to and from the central city, the area within which retail stores are located, the area served by electric power, the area served by light from the central city, the area served by telephone and mail from the central city, the area served by city water, the area of mail delivery by city mail carriers, the area of residential membership of social and athletic clubs are

Chapter II.

Relationship of Boston to State and County.

1. Boston the City and Boston the Metropolitan Area.

A stranger entering Boston either by automobile or train would have difficulty in determining where the city limits began. The suburbs which ring the city on the north, west and south are not politically part of Boston. But in a social and economic sense these suburbs and outlying cities are a part of metropolitan Boston. However political expediency has prevented this large metropolitan area from becoming politically "Boston."

2. United States Census Treatment of the Boston Area.

The 1920 United States Census treats the Boston Metropolitan area as containing four counties, the city proper having an area of 43.5 miles and a population of 748,060; the metropolitan part as having 570.4 square miles and a population of 1,772,254. The control factors used in arriving at these figures are: the area from which people travel to and from the central city, the area within which retail stores make regular free deliveries, the area served by electric power or light from the central city, the area served by telephones operating from the central city as a base, the area served by city water, the area of mail delivery by city mail carriers, the area of residential membership of social and athletic clubs and

Chapter II.

Relationship of Boston to State and Country.1. Boston the City and Boston the Metropolitan Area.

A stranger entering Boston either by auto-

mobile or train would have difficulty in determining where the

city limits began. The suburbs which ring the city on the

north, west and south are not politically part of Boston. But

in a social and economic sense these suburbs and outlying cities

are a part of metropolitan Boston. However political expedi-

ency has prevented this large metropolitan area from becoming

politically "Boston."

2. United States Census Treatment of the Boston Area.

The 1920 United States Census treats the

Boston Metropolitan area as containing four counties, the city

proper having an area of 42.5 miles and a population of 748,760;

the metropolitan part as having 570.4 square miles and a popu-

lation of 1,772,254. The control factors used in arriving at

these figures are: the area from which people travel to and

from the central city, the area within which retail stores make

regular free deliveries, the area served by electric power or

light from the central city, the area served by telephone or

mailing from the central city as a base, the area served by

city water, the area of mail delivery by city mail carriers, the

area of residential membership of social and athletic clubs and

the like.*

3. The lack of coordination within the metropolitan area.

The result is an area which for trade and social purposes is one, but for municipal services is many. Each of the politically independent cities, towns and villages is concerned with its own problems. The people of this area are only dimly aware that they are part of a community which has common needs and problems. This is in part due to the rather quiet, non-political work done by various metropolitan commissions and bodies which unify a few of the areas' services.

That there is and has been real lack of coordination in one important matter - police - has lately been made very plain by the crime situation. A series of bank hold-ups and murders in eastern Massachusetts, that is, the Boston Metropolitan area, have disclosed police forces in all stages of efficiency and in all stages of non-cooperation with the forces in adjoining cities and towns of the area. One town had for economy's sake omitted its teletype system. Lack of harmony and ill feeling developed between Boston police and out-of-town police. State police, private detectives, police of several cities and towns vied with one another, in non-achievement while some boy scouts turned up an all-important clue. The police are but one example of municipal service which must be coordinated to give fullest efficiency - but which in the Boston Metropolitan area unfortunately is not.

Fire protection is equally open to criti-

*Studenski, Paul: "The Government of Metropolitan Areas in the United States". p. 10.

the like.

3. The lack of coordination within the metropolitan area.

The result is an area which for trade and social purposes is one, but for municipal services is many. Each of the politically independent cities, towns and villages is concerned with its own problems. The people of this area are only dimly aware that they are part of a community which has common needs and problems. This is in part due to the rather dated, non-political work done by various metropolitan commissions and bodies which unify a few of the areas' services. That there is and has been real lack of coordination in one important matter - police - has lately been made very plain by the crime situation. A series of bank hold-ups and murders in eastern Massachusetts, that is, the Boston Metropolitan area, have disclosed police forces in all stages of efficiency and in all stages of non-cooperation with the forces in adjoining cities and towns of the area. The town had for economy's sake omitted its telephone system. Lack of harmony and ill feeling developed between Boston police and out-of-town police. State police, private detectives, police of several cities and towns vied with one another, in non-achievement while some boy scouts turned up an all-important clue. The police are but one example of municipal service which must be coordinated to give fullest efficiency - but which in the Boston Metropolitan area unfortunately is not.

Fire protection is equally open to criticism.

W. L. G. "The Government of Metropolitan Areas in the United States". p. 10.

cism, but the situation is not so apparent to the average citizen because he has frequently seen or read of apparatus from neighboring cities and towns answering calls for help in his particular community. A study of the Metropolitan area with fire stations spotted on a map reveals what is meant. Fire stations within a few hundred yards of each other, placed so because political boundaries were as they were. Other areas are so far from fire apparatus as to constitute poor insurance risks if not general menaces.

City Planning in Boston, Quincy, Cambridge and Brookline has been unrelated. They all like Topsy "jest grewed." But that is no excuse why they should keep on ignoring each other and tending solely to their own intra-community problems.

4. Stumbling blocks to annexation or coordination of facilities.

The general feeling of persons who live outside of Boston proper is a most important factor in this connection. The resident of Brookline, Quincy or Milton has strong feelings on the subject. He lives where he does for mighty good reasons, he will tell you - lower taxes, better schools, and less graft. And within broad limits he is telling the bitter truth. Boston (proper) suffers by comparison with its outlying sections.

Added to these very genuine reasons why the suburban man feels annexation should not be furthered, are the still strong forces of localism. These have existed since

the days of the early annexations. Even when Roxbury was consolidated with Boston in 1868, the author's grandfather crusaded the length and breadth of Roxbury to prevent such a result - not because he held any office which would be abolished or had any business that would suffer, but because he felt very strongly that self-government (he meant local government) should be continued and should not be stifled by the waste and evils of "the city." My grandfather's speeches and hand bills did not turn the tide of annexation and he disgustedly removed his habitation out of the doomed realm.

Local politicians and city and town employees of the outlying communities oppose annexation. Loss of their jobs is the root of their fears. They know that new political ties will come into play with annexation, whereas the present independent existence of their local governments offers security.

Within the Boston Metropolitan area are more than fifty political subdivisions every one of which if put to a vote would vehemently refuse annexation to Boston.

5. Means other than annexation were used for handling specific services.

With common needs of sewerage, water, and transportation some way had to be found of giving the whole area service without stirring up individual political hornet's nests.

The pollution of the Charles River and its tributaries began to cause discomfort to the people of Boston

the days of the early annexation. When when Roxbury was con-
solidated with Boston in 1867, the annexation was opposed
ed the health and vitality of Roxbury to prevent such a result -
not because he held any office which would be abolished or had
any business that would suffer, but because he felt very strong-
ly that self-government (he meant local government) should be
continued and should not be stifled by the waste and evils of
"the city." By Grant's speeches and Grant bills did not
turn the tide of annexation and he disgustedly removed his resis-
tance out of the doomed realm.

Local politicians and city and town employ-
ees of the existing communities oppose annexation. Loss of
their jobs is the root of their fear. They know that new polit-
ical ties will come into play with annexation, whereas the
present independent existence of their local government's officers
security.

Within the Boston Metropolitan area are
more than fifty political subdivisions every one of which if
put to a vote would vehemently refuse annexation to Boston.

5. Means other than annexation were used for handling
specific services.

With common needs of sewerage, water, and
transportation some way had to be found of giving the whole
area service without stirring up individual political parties
needs.

The pollution of the Charles River and its
tributaries began to cause discomfort to the people of Boston

and its suburbs as early as the late 1840's. It was partly responsible for the annexations of 1868-74. Despite this and the consequent building of intercepting sewers, northern territory and independent communities continued to pollute the river. From 1873 onwards agitation was stirring for metropolitan authorities. In 1889 the State Board of Health made a report and drew up a bill which after acceptance by the legislature created a Metropolitan Sewerage Commission for Boston.

This created a precedent and within five years another metropolitan concern was attended to - parks.

So in 1893 the Metropolitan Park Commission came into being.¹

Water supply came to be a source of worry in certain outlying Boston communities in 1895.² Up to this time each had handled its water supply problem by itself. Several towns during the century had voted annexation to Boston largely because they needed her water supply.³ This piecemeal method had various results in various communities. The State Department of Health in a survey classified communities into those needing new supplies immediately; those needing immediately a supplement to their old supply; those bound to need new supplies in a few years; and those not needing any supplies until after the expiration of twenty years or more (which last group was not large). This report was instrumental in bringing about the establishment in that year (1895) of the Metropolitan Water District, under the Metropolitan Water Supply Commission.

In 1910 the Metropolitan Sewerage and

1. Studenski, *ibid.* p. 263

2. *Ibid.* p. 32

3. *Ibid.* p. 107

and its success as early as the late 1840's. It was partly responsible for the annexation of 1853-54. Despite this and the consequent building of intercepting sewers, northern territory and independent communities continued to pollute the river. From 1873 onwards attention was shifting for metropolitan authorities. In 1889 the State Board of Health made a report and drew up a bill which after acceptance by the legislature created a Metropolitan Sewerage Commission for Boston.

This created a precedent and within five

years another metropolitan concern was attended to - parks.

So in 1893 the Metropolitan Park Commission came into being. Water supply came to be a source of worry

in certain outlying Boston communities in 1905. Up to this

time each had handled its water supply problem by itself. Now

ever towns during the century had voted annexation to Boston largely because they needed hot water supply. This place was

metred had various results in various communities. The State

Department of Health in a survey classified communities into

those needing new supplies immediately; those needing immediate

ly a supplement to their old supply; those bound to need new

supplies in a few years; and those not needing any supplies

until after the expiration of twenty years or more (which last

group was not large). This report was instrumental in bring-

ing about the establishment in that year (1905) of the Metro-

politan Water District, under the Metropolitan Water Supply

Commission.

In 1910 the Metropolitan Sewerage and

Water Supply Commissions were merged and in 1919 the Park Commission was added to them.¹ The amalgamated body was thereafter called the Massachusetts Metropolitan District Commission. At present the cities and towns within its jurisdiction can only control the Commission through their representatives in the legislature, for the Metropolitan District Commission is empowered only to execute such projects as the legislature shall adopt.

The financing is done by (mandatory) assessment on the constituent cities and towns.² This has the effect of allowing the state to execute the improvements without increase in state taxation except to the beneficiary cities and towns.

6. Does Metropolitan District Commission meet with favor?

Boston politicians annually at the State House berate state control. In fact, as long as the legislature is in session Boston representatives and senators talk about Boston needing more home rule, less state interference and so on. Much of this is for their home ward and district consumption and is not indicative of fundamental objections.

The smaller cities and towns within the area accept the Metropolitan District Commission with little comment. And to them it is at once an established mechanism for certain services and a safeguard against Boston's domination.³ However, it has not resulted in a rapprochement between municipalities of the district. All bring projects to the

1. Studenski, ibid. p. 274

2. Ibid. p. 306

3. Ibid. p. 314

Water Supply Commissions were merged and in 1919 the Park Com-
 mission was added to them.¹ The amalgamated body was there-
 after called the Massachusetts Metropolitan District Commission.
 At present the cities and towns within its jurisdiction can
 only control the Commission through their representatives in
 the legislature, for the Metropolitan District Commission is
 empowered only to execute such projects as the legislature shall
 adopt.

The financing is done by (mandatory) as-
 sessment on the constituent cities and towns.² This has the
 effect of allowing the state to execute the improvements with-
 out increase in state taxation except to the necessary cities
 and towns.

5. Does Metropolitan District Commission meet with
 Favor?

Boston politicians annually at the State
 House debate state control. In fact, as long as the legis-
 lature is in session Boston representatives and senators talk
 about Boston needing more home rule, less state interference,
 and so on. Much of this is for their home ward and district
 consumption and is not indicative of fundamental objections.
 The smaller cities and towns within the
 area accept the Metropolitan District Commission with little
 comment. And to them it is at once an established mechanism
 for certain services and a safeguard against Boston's domina-
 tion.³ However, it has not resulted in a rapprochement between
 municipalities of the district. All being projects to the

1. Stoughton, 1915, p. 274
 2. Ibid. p. 308
 3. Ibid. p. 314

legislature or object to them in the legislature, with sole reference to what the effects will be on themselves.

It should be noted that the greater portion of the Metropolitan District Commission work today is purely of a maintenance kind, - the projects were planned and executed twenty to forty years ago and quite generally by special commissions other than the Metropolitan District Commission.

The Metropolitan District Commission has served the Boston metropolitan area in the fields of sewerage, parks, and water supply. Compared with other cities its maintenance efficiency is high and there is no important opposition to its continuance.

7. The Metropolitan Planning Division.

This body is called a "division" of the Metropolitan District Commission. In theory it is part of that body, whose chairman is an ex officio member of the Planning Division. The relationship has no practical significance and is due to the state constitution limiting the number of departments with a consequent necessity of tying the new body to an already existing one.²

As a working unit it reports to the governor and to the legislature. Established in 1923 it is only lately it has begun to assume some leadership in planning for the region.³

It has no corporate status and has only the power to investigate and recommend.⁴

1. Studenski, ibid. p. 316

2. Ibid. p. 283

3. Ibid. p. 317

4. Ibid. p. 281 and 297

legislature or subject to them in the legislature, with sole reference to what the effects will be on themselves.

It should be noted that the greater por-

tion of the Metropolitan District Commission work today is

purely of a maintenance kind, - the projects were planned and

executed twenty to forty years ago and could generally be con-

sidered as completed other than the Metropolitan District Commission

The Metropolitan District Commission has

served the Boston metropolitan area in the fields of sewerage,

garbage, and water supply. Compared with other cities the main-

tenance efficiency is high and there is no important opposition

to its continuance.

7. The Metropolitan Planning Division.

This body is called a "division" of the

Metropolitan District Commission. In theory it is part of that

body, whose chairman is an ex officio member of the Planning

Division. The relationship has no practical significance and

is due to the state constitution limiting the number of depart-

ments with a consequent necessity of tying the new body to an

already existing one.²

As a working unit it reports to the govern-

or and to the legislature. Established in 1923 it is only late-

ly it has begun to assume some leadership in planning for the

region.³

It has no corporate status and has only

the power to investigate and recommend.⁴

1. Studenski, 1914, p. 315

2. Ibid. p. 283

3. Ibid. p. 317

4. Ibid. p. 281 and 297

8. The Metropolitan Transit District.

The creation of this coordinating body was due to the financial difficulties of the Boston Elevated Corporation. In 1918 the Massachusetts Legislature relieved the company of keeping down to a five cent fare. At the same time it vested control of the company's affairs in a board of five trustees appointed by the governor.¹ This was equivalent to making a board of directors who should do the state's bidding. Ownership of the company remained in the old hands and the plan was to operate ten years.

When 1928 the end of the term arrived, the question was again what to do and no agreement seemed acceptable to all - except that some sort of a metropolitan commission should be created. Finally an act was passed in the Legislature setting up the Metropolitan Transit District. It is an incorporated area governed by a board of five trustees (four appointed by the governor, one by the mayor of Boston.)² They send their decisions and plans to a "Metropolitan transit council" which is composed of the heads of the cities and towns within the district, with voting strength in ratio to the assessed valuations within their districts. It is sufficient to state here that the creation of the Metropolitan Transit District has temporarily solved the question of how the **problem** of the electric car, bus and subways shall be handled.

1. Studenski, ibid. p. 275

2. Ibid. p. 276

8. The International Transit District

The creation of this particular
area was due to the historical affiliation of the United States
to the region. In 1910 the American government had a policy
of opening up the region to a free port zone. At the same
time it wanted to have of the country's affairs in a permanent
five years, extended by the government. This was extended
to eight years in 1915 and to ten years in 1920. The district
was in operation for ten years and the old laws and the new
one in 1920 for ten years.
When 1920 the end of the zone was
reached, the question was again what to do and an agreement was
reached to all - except that some part of a restricted zone
was to be created. This was done and was passed to the
legislature which on the 10th of March 1920 decided. It is
an international zone governed by a board of five members (four
appointed by the government, one by the state of Colorado). The
zone is a free port zone and is a restricted transit zone.
All which is covered by the zone of the zone and zone with
in the district. The zone is a transit zone in the district
valuation with the district. It is subject to state
control at the discretion of the International Transit District
committee which has the power to solve the problem of the zone.
This zone, but it is a transit zone.

9. General Comments on "Metropolitanization"

All the various Commissions and Districts were set up simply because the problem had become acute, concerned more than one city, and because the annexation method could not be used. In most instances the problem was studied by state investigating commissions who recommended the establishment of metropolitan bodies.

As has been suggested previously, the creation of these several more or less single purposed metropolitan agencies does not solve the problems of general coordination. Nor are many special problems taken care of that ought to be, such as police, fire, and highways. The best that can be said of these metropolitan bodies is that they have temporarily taken care of the particular services for which they were created.

9. General Comments on "Metropolization"

All the various commissions and sub-commissions were set up mainly because the problem was a-
cute, concerned more than one city, and because the association
method could not be used. In most instances the problem was
studied by state investigating commissions who recommended the
establishment of metropolitan bodies.
As has been suggested previously,
the creation of these several more or less single purpose met-
ropolitan agencies does not solve the problem of general co-
ordination. For any special problem taken care of that
ought to be, such as police, fire, and highways. The best that
can be said of these metropolitan bodies is that they have for-
getfully taken care of the particular services for which they
were created.

Chapter III. Evolution

1. Colonial History.

The little colonial seaport of Boston was slow in growing. Its population in 1740 was only seventeen thousand and at the end of the Revolution even less. Town government was adequate. This meant the settling of issues, election of officers, and voting of money at town meetings.¹

After the Revolution Boston's population began to grow at an increased rate; in 1800 it was 25,000 inhabitants, in 1810 there were 33,000 and by 1820, 43,000. This led to difficulties.²

As Huse expresses it, "the budget ... would often be approved by the town meeting though only the voters in the immediate vicinity of the desk knew what was being done."³ By this time "selectmen" were in vogue and they, with officers and boards, were acting as executives and legislators of the town's affairs. Most of them were men of high integrity and this is fortunate, for the voters had pretty largely lost control over execution of town business.

Another difficulty was the appointment of executive work within the committee of finance. Three subdivisions of the committee carried on operations of borrowing money and letting contracts, with little reference to what the others were doing and without taking the temper of the others.

1. Huse, Charles P. "The Financial History of Boston" p. 3
 2. Huse, ibid. p. 4
 3. Huse, ibid. p. 5

1. Financial History

The first financial report of Boston was

also in 1790. The population in 1790 was only 1,000 persons and at the end of the Revolution even less. Town government was rudimentary. This meant the setting of taxes,

election of officers, and voting of money at town meetings.

After the Revolution Boston's population

began to grow at an increased rate; in 1800 it was 25,000 inhabitants, in 1810 there were 35,000 and by 1820, 45,000. This led to difficulties.

As time expressed it, "the budget ...

would often be approved by the town meeting through only the voters in the immediate vicinity of the desk where they had just gone." In this time "misbehavior" was in vogue and town

with officers and boards, were acting as executives and legislators of the town's affairs. Most of these men of high

integrity and this is fortunate. For the voters had never

largely lost control over execution of town business.

Another difficulty was the appointment of

executive work within the committee of finance. Three auditors

of the committee carried on operations of borrowing

money and letting contracts, with little reference to what the

others were doing and without taking the temper of the officers.

The third and probably most pernicious difficulty (because it has partially survived) was with the town of Chelsea. When Suffolk County was established in 1643, (it included the towns of Boston and Chelsea) it had been given various administrative and judicial powers and most important, taxing powers. The Quarter Sessions Court which exercised the county powers was generally beyond the reach of Boston's selectmen, for the court's members were appointees of the governor. Here then was Boston paying most of the taxes yet almost impotent in saying how the money should be spent. Friction engendered by this situation swelled the demands for a city form of government.

2. Change from Town to City.

By virtue of the Massachusetts Constitutional Convention held in 1820 the legislature was empowered to incorporate cities. Boston voted to incorporate. The legislature had wisely made it part of the acceptance of a charter that the court of sessions should be abolished and most of its functions turned over to Boston.¹

3. The First City Charter.

Town meetings in Boston were over. The voters were to elect annually a city council of forty-eight members, four to come from each of the twelve wards. Also the voters were to choose a mayor and eight aldermen-at-large.

The aldermen and the council had a veto on each others' legislative acts.² Executive power was vested in the mayor and aldermen, but administration was in the mayor

1. Huse, ibid. p. 7

2. The relationship of the Board of Aldermen to the Council was that of one part of a bi-cameral legislature to the other.

The third and probably most significant characteristic (because it has generally survived) was with the town of Boston. When William Gannett was established in 1835, (it included the towns of Boston and Chelsea) it had been given various administrative and judicial powers and most important, taxing powers. The Charter Revision Committee which prepared the county powers was generally beyond the reach of Boston's select men, for the county's officers were appointed by the governor. There then was Boston paying most of the taxes yet almost no control in saying how the money should be spent. This situation was changed by the legislation which the demand for a city form of government.

2. Changes from Town to City.

The vision of the Massachusetts Constitution of 1780 was that the legislative body in 1835 the legislature was empowered to incorporate cities. Boston voted to incorporate. The fact that the court of sessions should be abolished and most of its functions turned over to Boston.

3. The First City Charter.

Then came the Boston vote over. The voters were to elect annually a city council of forty-eight members, four to come from each of the twelve wards. Also the voters were to choose a mayor and eight aldermen. The aldermen and the council had a veto on each other's legislative acts. Executive power was vested in the mayor and aldermen, but administration was in the mayor.

1. The Charter of 1822, p. 7
2. The Charter of 1822, p. 7
The Charter of 1822, p. 7

alone.

John Philips, the first mayor, endeavored to retain the old ways of doing things under the selectmen. He set up departments only so far as the charter authorized him.

The second mayor was Josiah Quincy, who administered the city from 1823 to 1828. Actually the charter gave the mayor no great power. If the mayor was to be a controlling influence on the city it must be by virtue of his own personality. However Mayor Quincy bolstered up the weak charter provisions by appointing himself chairman of all the important aldermanic committees. This practice proved to be one that was necessary and was followed by the mayors down to the time of the charter revisions of 1854.

Under this original city charter most of the department heads were chosen by the city council, and the mayor could not remove them. The voters elected a school committee, fire-wards, and overseers of the poor. These last officials were generally a thorn in the side of the mayor and aldermen, for they could make expenditures without city council approval.

Boston's bargain with Chelsea at the time of the 1822 charter acceptance, was to the effect that the court of sessions should be abolished and that in return Boston should pay all the county expenses. County expenses were therefore put in the hands of court officers. Chelsea drove a shrewder bargain than she knew.

It was the real defects in the charter of

alone.

John Phillips, the first mayor, endeavored to retain the old ways of doing things under the settlement. He set up departments only as far as the charter authorized him. The second mayor was Josiah Quincy, who administered the city from 1823 to 1828. Actually the charter gave the mayor no great power. If the mayor was to be a controlling influence on the city it must be in virtue of his own personality. However Mayor Quincy polished up the weak character provisions by appointing himself chairman of all the important administrative committees. This practice proved to be one that was necessary and was followed by the mayors down to the time of the charter revision of 1852.

Under this original city charter most of the department heads were chosen by the city council, and the mayor could not remove them. The voters elected a school committee, fire-wards, and overseers of the poor. These last officials were generally a group in the side of the mayor and aldermen, for they could make expenditures without city council approval.

Boston's bargain with Charles at the time of the 1828 charter amendments, was to the effect that the court of sessions should be abolished and that in return Boston should pay all the county expenses. County expenses were thrown out in the hands of court officials. Quincy drove a steeper bargain than she knew.

If we take the real balance in the charter of

1822 that made the city leaders determined to change it. The aldermen were unpaid, separate boards and committees could spend money without consulting anyone, the mayor had no veto, and there was no demarcation of legislative from administrative powers.¹

4. Revision of 1854.

The council must have had more to do with framing the charter changes in 1854 than is generally supposed, for the net result was to increase the council's power at the expense of the all too weak mayor! By this change the mayor was made independent of the board of aldermen - his chairmanship of the various aldermanic committees thereby denied him. He was, however, given a veto on the aldermen, where the acts involved expenditures and a veto on the council on all matters. The keen edge of this veto was blunted by a provision whereby the mayor could be overridden with a two-thirds vote, and still further dulled by one prohibiting him from disapproving separate items in appropriation orders or loan bills.

The council in 1854 must have been laughing up its sleeves when Mayor Prince spoke in his inaugural address of being limited to an advisory capacity.²

One interesting departure is to be noted in the charter changes of this year. The term of office of the school committee was made three years.³ This is the first break away from the annual election custom. This seemed to produce a new line of thought in the politically active men of the day. The council voted in favor of increasing the length of their own term of office, that of the aldermen and of the mayor.

1. Huse, ibid. p. 12

2. Huse, ibid. p. 62

3. Huse, ibid. p. 80

1952 that made the city leaders determined to change it. The
alterations were made, separate bodies and committees could
move without creating expense, the mayor had no veto, and there
was no separation of legislative from administrative powers.

4. Revised at 1954.

The council must have been to do with
fixing the charter changes in 1954 that is generally supposed.
For the net result was to increase the council's power at the
expense of the city's mayor. It is hard to see the mayor
was made independent of the board of aldermen - his responsibility
of the various administrative committees thereby denied him. He
was, however, given a veto on the aldermen, where the aldermen
voted unanimously and a veto on the council on all matters.
The keep sake of this veto was limited by a provision whereby
the mayor could be overridden with a two-thirds vote, and still
further limited by one prohibiting the mayor from exercising
items in administrative matters or from filling.

The council in 1954 must have been feeling
as the aldermen when Mayor James spoke in his inaugural address
of being limited to an advisory capacity.

One interesting departure is to be noted
in the changes of this year. The term of office of the
second council was made three years. This is the first
break away from the annual election custom. This seemed to have
been a new line of thought in the politically active men of the
city. The council voted in favor of increasing the length of
their own term of office, that of the aldermen and of the mayor.

The city council was in the saddle. Committees of this body were virtually all powerful. In 1864 the council was given power to appoint the overseers of the poor.

The power of the aldermen was slipping away. The mayor now gained a little advantage. He was given in 1875 the appointing of the park commissioners, likewise the water board and in 1878 he was to appoint the city's three police commissioners. The city council could still hamstring him by refusing its approval.

5. Revision of 1885.

This rather thorough rearranging of the guide wires in the city's political mechanism has largely been continued down to our own day. Executive power was vested in the mayor and a clear separation of legislative and executive powers made. The mayor was to appoint, subject to aldermanic confirmation, all city officials other than those popularly elected, and a few minor officials who were rightfully left to the council (clerk of committees, city messenger and city clerk). Also the mayor might remove heads of departments.¹

The city council was forbidden to have anything to do with the letting of contracts, hiring of labor, purchase of materials or in many way to dabble in the city's administrative business, with of course the exception of the expenses of the council itself.

Departments were forbidden to exceed their appropriations.²

The mayor might veto any order of the coun-

1. Huse, ibid. p. 177

2. Koren, John "Boston 1822-1922" p. 12

The city council was in the saddle. Com-
 mittees of this body were virtually all powerful. In 1884 the
 council was given power to appoint the overseers of the poor.
 The power of the aldermen was slipping
 away. The mayor now gained a little advantage. He was given
 in 1875 the appointment of the park commissioners, fifteen the
 water board and in 1878 he was to appoint the city's three po-
 lice commissioners. The city council could still restrain him
 by refusing the approval.

E. Revision of 1883.

This rather thorough reorganization of the
 guide wires in the city's political mechanism has largely been
 continued down to our own day. Executive power was vested in
 the mayor and a clear separation of legislative and executive
 powers made. The mayor was to appoint, subject to aldermanic
 confirmation, all city officials other than those commonly
 elected, and a few minor officials who were rightly left to
 the council (chief of police, city messenger, and city clerk).
 Also the mayor might remove heads of departments.

The city council was forbidden to have any-
 thing to do with the letting of contracts, hiring of labor, pur-
 chase of materials or in any way to dabble in the city's admin-
 istrative business, with of course the exception of the expenses
 of the council itself.

Departments were forbidden to exceed their
 appropriations.

The mayor might veto any order of the coun-

cil and disapprove loan bills and appropriations, although the old two-thirds overriding veto of the council was undisturbed. The mayor might no longer be a member of the school committee.

In short, the council was unhorsed and the mayor was put in the saddle. The outlook for improved efficiency was bright. However the man on foot, the council, was not through fighting. Loopholes in the charter gave him more of an advantage than the makers of the charter had foreseen.

Loophole number one was the still required aldermanic approval of mayoral appointees.

Loophole number two, a gaping hole in the armor, allowed the council members to flout the charter provisions relative to contracts, labor and executive business because there was no penalty on their so doing!

6. Charter of 1909.

Preceding the adoption of a new charter, a finance committee was appointed to investigate and study the possibilities. The commission made an admirable study and the charter of 1909 is part of its work.

By it the mayor's term of office is made four years (subject to recall after two years). It gave him appointive powers, only nominally checked by the civil service commission. The city council was made a single chamber of nine members elected at large for three year terms. Penalties were set up for infraction of the provisions prohibiting council interference in executive matters. A permanent finance commission was established whose members were to be appointed by the gov-

oil and champagne from the and restaurants, although the
of two-thirds overvoting vote of the council was maintained.
The mayor might no longer be a member of the school committee.
In short, the council was undisturbed and the
mayor was out in the saddle. The council had improved efficiency
was brief. However, the men on foot, the council, was not
through fighting. Josephine in the chapter gave him more of an
advantage than the makers of the chapter had foreseen.
Josephine number one was the still requires
administrative approval of mayor's appointments.
Josephine number two, a genuine hole in the
armor, allowed the council members to fight the chapter pro-
visions relative to corporate, labor and executive business de-
cause there was no penalty on their as being!
6. Chapter of 1909.
Proceeding the adoption of a new chapter, a
finance committee was appointed to investigate and study the
possibilities. The commission made an extensive study and the
chapter of 1909 is part of its work.
By the mayor's term of office he made
four years (subject to recall after two years). It gave him
executive powers, only nominally checked by the civil service
commission. The city council was made a single chamber of nine
members elected at large for three year terms. Committees were
set up for the direction of the provisions prohibiting council in-
terference in executive matters. A permanent finance commission
was established whose members were to be appointed by the gov-

ernor.

Since the adoption of this charter of 1909, several modifications have been made. One is the abolition of the recall of the mayor, and an addition whereby the mayor may not succeed himself. The city council has reverted to the ward representation system and now has twenty-two members.

Boston is now operating under this charter granted by the legislature in 1909. Executive power is vested in the mayor and in the executive department. Ordinance power rests in the city council. A school committee elected by the voters controls school affairs. The framework that we have today is clearly labelled "the strong mayor plan" and its detailed analysis will be attempted in the following chapter.

7. Mayor Mathews.

"The doctrine of executive responsibility and control is therefore democratic in theory, American in origin, and successful in practice. The American people may claim to have practically invented two new and distinct forms of municipal government: the town meeting and the city charter in which all executive power is reposed in the mayor ... the latter is on trial and capable of development and improvement." ¹

Since the adoption of this charter of 1909, several modifications have been made. One is the abolition of the recall of the mayor, and an addition whereby the mayor may not succeed himself. The city council has reverted to the ward representation system and now has twenty-two members. Boston is now operating under this charter granted by the Legislature in 1909. Executive power is vested in the mayor and in the executive department. Ordinance power rests in the city council. A school committee elected by the voters controls school affairs. The framework that we have today is clearly labelled "the strong mayor plan" and the detailed analysis will be attempted in the following chapter.

V. Mayor Mahoney.

"The doctrine of executive responsibility and control is therefore democratic in theory, American in origin, and successful in practice. The American people may claim to have practically invented the new and distinct form of municipal government: the town meeting and the city charter in which all executive power is lodged in the mayor ... the latter is on trial and capable of development and improvement." 1

Chapter IV. Present Structure of Government

1. Historical Growth.

By a process of trial and error Boston has come into the year 1934 with what is generally known as the strong-mayor plan of city government. As has been traced in the preceding chapter, the domination of the mayor over the administration has been an historical growth. Starting from a powerless figure in the days of 1822, he has become the virtual dictator of today.

2. The Mayor and his Election.

The present charter allows the mayor a four year term, but bars him from self-succession. Election is by popular vote, without a primary. Nomination papers signed by 3000 registered voters must be in the hands of the Election Commissioners several weeks before the election day.

In some cities party label has lost prestige in the matter of insuring election. Personality in those cities is the badge that voters go by. Whether Boston is tending in such a direction is difficult to determine. Voters who were in the habit of following the recommendations of the Good Government Association have never given value to party label. Posited against this healthy disregard of party is the announced wish of important leaders, Democrats and Republicans, to introduce the party primary into Boston's mayoral contests. Manifestly

Chapter II. Present Structure of Government

1. Historical Growth

By a process of trial and error Boston has

come into the year 1934 with what is generally known as the
strong-mayor plan of city government. As has been traced in the
preceding chapter, the domination of the mayor over the adminis-
tration has been an historical growth. Starting from a mayor-
council figure in the days of the 18th century, he has become the virtual dic-
tator of today.

2. The Mayor and his Election

The present charter allows the mayor a four
year term, but this duration is self-suggestion. Election is by
popular vote, without a primary. Nomination is made by
1000 registered voters must be in the hands of the Election Com-
missioners several weeks before the election day.

In some cities party label has lost credit
in the matter of franchise election. Responsibility for those cities
is the edge that voters go by. Whether Boston is tending in
such a direction is difficult to determine. Voters who were in
the habit of following the recommendations of the Good Govern-
ment Association have never given value to party label. Pointed
against this healthy disregard of party is the announced wish
of important leaders, Democrats and Republicans, to introduce
the party primary into Boston's municipal contests. Manifestly

this would strengthen the probability of election of regular line politicians. One would expect the Republicans to oppose any such means because as has been pointed out in Chapter I, one Republican on election day will certainly lose if opposed by only one Democrat. Despite this, the better element in even the Republican party has gone on record as favoring the primary in municipal elections. So the straws fly in two directions and only time can answer whether personality will supplant party.

3. Mayor's Legislative Powers.

In theory the mayor is solely an executive or administrative official. In practice he has a potent legislative whip. This is gained by his recommendations and communications to the council which by virtue of its weakness will follow the mayor's recommendations - if there is any thing to be gained by their so doing. For the last twelve years, the mayors have made political bargains with a large enough number of city councilors so that virtually any measure could be run through that body. So in a positive sense the mayor controls the ordinance-making branch of the city, by patronage and favors.

In a negative sense he has also a club. If the council should try to go on a rampage in accordance with plans of its own, the mayor may exercise his veto. This is done by sending the council's order, resolution or bill back without the mayoral signature, together with a statement of objections. A two-thirds majority is necessary for the council to pass matters over the mayor's veto. It's a poor mayor or a poor measure that cannot muster seven councilors out of twenty-two.

5

this would strengthen the probability of election of regular line politicians. One would expect the Republicans to oppose any such move because as has been pointed out in Chapter I, one Republican on election day will certainly lose if opposed by only one Democrat. Despite this, the better element in even the Republican party has gone on record as favoring the primary in municipal elections. So the answer lies in two directions and only time can answer whether personally will succumb, partly.

5. Mayor's Legislative Powers.

In theory the mayor is solely an executive or administrative official. In practice he has a potent legislative voice. This is gained by his recommendations and recommendations to the council which by virtue of its weakness will follow the mayor's recommendations - if there is any thing to be gained by their so doing. For the last twelve years, the mayors have made political bargains with a large enough number of city councilors so that virtually any measure could be run through that body. So in a positive sense the mayor controls the ordinance-making branch of the city, by patronage and favors.

In a negative sense he has also a club. If the council should try to go on a rampage in accordance with plans of its own, the mayor may exercise his veto. This is done by sending the council's order, resolution or bill back without the mayor's signature, together with a statement of objections. A two-thirds majority is necessary for the council to pass matters over the mayor's veto. It's a poor mayor or a poor council that cannot master these principles out of twenty-two.

In the matter of appropriations and loan orders, in other words the budget, the council has only the power to strike out or reduce items and no council since the war has exhibited any desire to reduce the mayor's figures.¹

4. Mayor's Appointing Powers.

It is easier to discuss the few officials whom the mayor does not appoint rather than the long list which he does appoint. Members of the City Council and of the School Committee are elected directly by the municipal electorate. The City Council in turn chooses the city clerk, city messenger and clerks of committees. The members of the Finance Commission, of the Licensing Board and the Police Commission are appointed by the governor. Every other department head and board from Art to Weights and Measures is entirely or substantially subject to the mayor's appointing power!

5. The City Council.

In the last third of the 19th century the City Council was the power in city affairs. Charter changes and the gradual deterioration of the membership have reduced it to low esteem. As one writer has said, "The history of the City Council during the past forty years is an almost uninterrupted chronicle of retreat."²

The electorate came to feel that it was safer for them to turn over matters such as the annual tax limit and the borrowing limit to the State Legislature. This tendency was of course aided and abetted by the desires of the larger tax payers in Boston, mostly Republicans, to "do business with" the

1. Chapter VI, supra.

2. Munro, W.B. "Government of American Cities" p. 285.

In the matter of appropriations and loans

others, in other words the budget, the council has only the power to strike out or reduce items and no council since the war has exhibited any desire to reduce the mayor's figure.

Mayor's appointment powers.

It is easier to discuss the law officials when the mayor does not appoint rather than the fact that which he does appoint. Members of the City Council and of the School Committee are elected directly by the municipal electorate. The City Council in turn chooses the city clerk, city messenger and clerk of committees. The members of the Finance Commission, of the Licenses Board and the Police Commission are appointed by the governor. Every other department head and board from art to police and measures is appointed or substantially subject to the mayor's appointing power.

8. The City Council.

In the last third of the 19th century the City Council was the power in city affairs. Greater changes and the gradual deterioration of the municipality have reduced it to low esteem. As one writer has said, "The history of the City Council during the past forty years is an almost unbroken chronicle of retreat."

The electorate came to feel that it was safer for them to turn over matters such as the annual tax limit and the borrowing limit to the State Legislature. This tendency was of course aided and abetted by the desires of the former taxpayers in Boston, mostly Republicans, to "do business with" the

Republican controlled State Legislature.

The election of the City Council is held at the same time as is that of the mayor. One councilor is elected for each of the twenty-two wards. This does not make for the best interests of the city as a whole, for each councilor in attempting to keep his position naturally seeks only the advancement of projects within his own ward. In addition, it continues machine councilors in office term after term, for if a councilor is "in with" the administration he will have sufficient patronage to distribute to his ward to build up a politically powerful nucleus at election time.

To do the small amount of work allowed it, the council divides itself into committees. The president of the council does the naming of committees and consequently holds the balance of power within the City Council. Frequently in Boston many ballots have been taken before the council could select its president. Obviously political trading is going on behind the scenes when this choosing of the council president takes place.

Ordinances, orders and resolutions issue from the council, the principal ones being the loan and appropriations orders.

6. The School Committee.

Other than the mayor and councilors, School Committee members are the only city officers elected directly by the people. This committee is an historical continuation out of the original charter of Boston (1822). That it was left standing in the field when all other departments were made responsible

Republican controlled State Legislature.

The election of the City Council is held at the same time as is that of the mayor. One councillor is elected for each of the twenty-two wards. This does not make for the best interests of the city as a whole. For each councillor is

attempting to keep his position regardless of the advancement of the city in his own ward. In addition, if councillor making connections in office term after term, for it is a councillor is "in with" the administration he will have sufficient patronage to distribute to his ward to build up a politically powerful nucleus at election time.

To do the small amount of work allowed it, the council divides itself into committees. The president of the council does the naming of committees and consequently holds the balance of power within the City Council. Frequently in Boston many ballots have been taken before the council could select the president. Obviously political trading is going on behind the scenes when this choosing of the council president takes place. Ordinances, orders and resolutions issued

from the council, the principal ones being the laws and regulations ordering.

The School Committee.

Other than the mayor and councillors, School Committee members are the only city officers elected directly by the people. This committee is an historical continuation out of the original charter of Boston (1630). That it was left standing in the field when all other departments were made responsible

to the mayor, is partly traceable to the popular feeling that the schools should be kept out of politics. When we consider that the School Committee spends some 14 million dollars per year its importance is realized.

It is composed of five unpaid members, elected at large for four year terms, two being chosen at one election, three at the next.

The Committee elects the Superintendent of Schools (six year term), six assistant superintendents, a business manager, several lesser officers and one Commissioner of the School Buildings Department. To this latter department the mayor appoints one commissioner. These two choose a third. (Upon their failure to agree the governor appoints the third commissioner).

7. Departments under State Authority.

The Police Department, the Licensing Board, and the Finance Commission are responsible to the governor, who appoints their heads or members as the case may be. The expediency and political philosophy back of this state control has to do in part with graft and corruption. In the case of the Finance Commission the wisdom of having as a watch dog for the city an agency controlled by other than those in the city administration, is obvious.

The work of the Police Department and the Licensing Board is known to most citizens. The precise function of the Finance Commission is not too generally recognized, Historically the Finance Commission originated with the charter re-

to the mayor, is partly responsible for the popular feeling that
the schools should be kept out of politics. When we consider
that the School Committee spends some 15 million dollars per year
its importance is realized.

It is composed of five unpaid members,
elected at large for four year terms, two being chosen at one
election, three at the next.

The Committee elects the Superintendent of
Schools (six year term), six assistant superintendents, a busi-
ness manager, several lesser officers and one Commissioner of
the School Building Department. To this latter department the
mayor appoints one commissioner. These two choose a third.
(Upon their failure to agree the governor appoints the third
commissioner).

V. Departments under State Authority.

The Police Department, the Licensing Board,
and the Finance Commission are responsible to the governor, who
appoints their heads or members as the case may be. The experi-
ence and political philosophy back of this state control has to
do in part with graft and corruption. In the case of the Fi-
nance Commission this wisdom of having as a watch dog for the city
an agency controlled by other than those in the city adminis-
tration, is obvious.

The work of the Police Department and the
Licensing Board is known to most citizens. The precise function
of the Finance Commission is not too generally recognized. His-
torically the Finance Commission originated with the transfer to

vision studies made preparatory to the charter of 1909. The Commission's work at that time was so thorough that the body was continued. Its purpose is to discover and bring to the attention of the mayor and council, matters that concern the efficient operation of the city. In practice the Finance Commission has been a power or a nonentity as the personality of the chairman might vary. He, as the only paid member of the Finance Commission except its secretary and investigators, directs its actions. Be he energetic, honest and versed in city affairs he makes the Commission a force to be reckoned with. Under such a man the Finance Commission performs all the functions that now are being carried on by the independent Municipal Research Bureau. Occasionally it happens that the Chairman of the Finance Commission comes into his position by virtue of a trade between a governor and a mayor; then of course one cannot expect the Commission to fulfill the purposes of its existence.

8. Two Mixed Units of Organization.

Important in the formulating and carrying out of projects beneficial to Boston's inhabitants is the Board of Trustees of the George R. White Fund. The five men composing this board are the mayor, the president of the City Council, the City Auditor, President of the Boston Chamber of Commerce, and the President of the Boston Bar Association. The will which set up the fund allows a fair margin of discretion as to how the money shall be spent. Some years ago when the Board decided that a series of Health Units should be established at various points within the city, it committed Boston to an extremely valu-

vision studies made preliminary to the charter of 1922. The Commission's work at that time was so thorough that the body was continued. Its purpose is to discover and bring to the attention of the mayor and council matters that concern the efficient operation of the city. In practice the Finance Commission has been a sort of a committee as the responsibility of the chairman might vary. As the only paid member of the Finance Commission except the secretary and investigators, attracts its members. He is energetic, honest and varied in city affairs he makes the Commission a force to be reckoned with. Under such a man the Finance Commission performs all the functions that now are being carried on by the independent financial research bureau. Occasionally it happens that the chairman of the Finance Commission comes into his position by virtue of a trade between a newspaper and a mayor; then of course one cannot expect the Commission to fulfill the purposes of its existence.

8. Two kinds of City Administration.

Important in the Commission's work is the carrying out of projects beneficial to Boston's inhabitants. In the course of studies of the House of Representatives, the five new members of this board are the mayor, the president of the City Council, the City Auditor, President of the Boston Chamber of Commerce, and the President of the Boston Bar Association. The will which sets the fund allows a fair margin of discretion as to how the money shall be spent. Some years ago when the fund reached that a series of health bills should be established at various points within the city, it committed Boston to an extremely valuable

able experiment in the field of municipal health activity.

The other "mixed" department of the city is the Boston and Cambridge Bridge Commission, of two members, one chosen by the mayor of Cambridge, the other being Boston's Public Works Commissioner.

9. Departments Whose Officials are All or in Part Appointed by the Mayor.

Rather than attempt to describe in detail the work of these remaining thirty-three departments and boards, a simple enumeration will be given. Any one interested in the particular functions and field of operation of any one department can discover what he wishes to know in the annual reports of that department. Their relative importance or lack of it may be roughly gained by the 1933 appropriation figures which follow them:

Art Department	\$510.
Assessing Department	\$386,850.
Auditing Department	73,325.
Boston Port Authority	39,065.
Boston Retirement Board	29,640.
Boston Traffic Commission	143,628.
Budget Department	10,472.
Board of Zoning Adjustment (unpaid; expenses met from Reserve Fund)	
Building Department	220,000.
City Planning Department	16,785.
Collecting Department	248,882.
Election Department	220,375.
Fire Department	3,924,295.
Health Department	943,610.
Hospital Department	3,348,967.
Institutions Department	1,085,638.
Law Department	117,276.
Library Department	1,004,750.
Market Department	15,755.
Overseers of the Public Welfare	9,133,258.
Park Department	1,133,437.
Printing Department	450,630.

Public Buildings Department	\$ 481,620.
Public Works Department	7,670,900.
Registry Department	56,500.
Sinking Funds Department	2,625.
Soldiers' Relief Department	1,078,870.
Statistics Department	12,421.
Street Laying Out Department	160,700.
Supply Department	48,264.
Treasury Department	71,670.
Transit Department	(Expenses paid from cost of projects)
Weights and Measures Department	43,350.

10. The Future of Administration.

Despite this long list of departments, commissions and boards the Boston city government of the future will doubtless carry on even more work. To be sure it may reduce the number of departments, but the scope of work is bound to increase. The city is fast entering upon an acquisition and operation of the elevated railway system. Agitation exists for going into the electrical utility field. Health activities will be broadened. Slum clearance and then city housing will follow. More and more the old conception of private business yields to the new conception of public business.

Chapter V. Graft, Corruption and Waste

1. Idea of Graft as being Necessary and Unimportant.

In the mayoralty campaign of 1933 charges of graft, corruption and waste were hurled daily. The public seemed to take divergent attitudes about what should be done about the situation, yet almost all agreed that it existed. There were those who were shocked and disgusted and there were those who felt that it was a natural concomitant of all city governments. In this latter group were the believers in "honest graft" and the believers in graft as a necessary part of all business operations. But apathy characterized the attitude of most voters. There seemed to be in their minds some differentiation between illegal acts having to do with the city's business and illegal acts such as safecracking, holdup and murder. Perhaps it is an extension of the notion that although violation of the automobile laws may be criminal it is after all not serious, nothing to get "worked up about."

2. The Bill for an Investigation.

Earlier in the year a bill was introduced into the legislature which called for an investigation of the city's affairs. The originator of the bill had considerable trouble in finding a representative or senator who would even introduce the bill, let alone endorse it. A senator having

Chapter V. Graft, Corruption and Waste

1. Idea of Graft as Being Necessary and Inevitable

and

In the favorably campaign of 1933 charges

of graft, corruption and waste were hurled daily. The public seemed to take divergent attitudes about what should be done about the situation, yet almost all agreed that it existed.

There were those who were shocked and disgusted and there were those who felt that it was a natural concomitant of all city governments. In this latter group were the believers in "good government" and the believers in graft as a necessary part of

all business operations. But neither characterized the attitude of most voters. There seemed to be in their minds some distinction between illegal acts having to do with the city's

business and illegal acts such as racketeering, holding and running. Perhaps it is an extension of the notion that although violation of the automobile laws may be criminal it is after all not serious, nothing to get "worked up about."

2. The Bill for an Investigation

Earlier in the year a bill was introduced

into the legislature which called for an investigation of the city's affairs. The originator of the bill had considerable trouble in finding a representative or senator who would even introduce the bill. Let alone endorse it. A senator having

finally been found who would do it and would work for its passage, further difficulties arose. The bill went to committee and public hearings were held. These were attended by throngs of people both friends and enemies of the administration. Many members of the committee were distinctly hostile to the bill and were defenders of Mayor Curley. It was their general policy to try to make the sponsors of the bill prove graft and corruption at the hearing if an investigation was to be forthcoming. These tactics were manifestly unfair, for after all it was the purpose of the proposed investigation to discover whether there was graft and corruption or not. Practically no private citizen would be in a position to prove anything of this sort. Resort to court action was nearly useless because real evidence of fraud or bribery had to be given in advance to the prosecution. So too was action through the Finance Commission, for as was demonstrated by the events of the hearing, the Finance Commission was "playing ball" with the mayor and thereby disregarding the purpose for which it was created. Therefore sole hope for making disclosures such as had been made in New York was in this bill to investigate.

3. Hearing on the Bill to Investigate.

Two city councilors neither of whom are reported to have had very clean fingers and both of whom had an axe to grind led the fight for the bill's passage. Most of the evidence which they offered was based on Finance Commission Reports of earlier years.

When it came time for the opposition to

finally been found who would do it and would work for the passage. Further difficulties arose. The bill went to committee and public hearings were held. These were attended by thousands of people both friends and enemies of the administration. Many members of the committee were distinctly hostile to the bill and were defenders of Mayor Curley. It was their general policy to try to make the sponsors of the bill prove graft and corruption at the hearing if an investigation was to be forthcoming. These tactics were manifestly unfair, for after all it was the purpose of the proposed investigation to discover whether there was graft and corruption or not. Practically no private citizen would be in a position to prove anything of this sort. Resort to court action was nearly useless because test evidence of friends of Curley had to be given in advance for the prosecution. So too was action through the Finance Commission, for as was demonstrated by the events of the hearing, the Finance Commission was "playing ball" with the mayor and thereby disregarding the purpose for which it was created. Therefore sole hope for making disclosures such as had been made in New York was in this bill to investigate.

3. Hearing on the Bill to Investigate.

Two city councilors neither of whom are reported to have had very clean fingers and both of whom had an axe to grind for the bill's passage. Most of the evidence which they offered was based on Finance Commission Reports of earlier years. When it came time for the opposition to

the bill to present its case Corporation Counsel Silverman for the city arose and pointed out the lack of absolute proof of dishonesty or corruption, heatedly denounced the sponsors of the bill and defended the administration's lily whiteness. Rather significantly Chairman Goodwin of the Finance Commission took the same tack - lack of absolute airtight proof of corruption plus a series of personal attacks on all sponsors of the bill. Chairman Goodwin did admit there was proof of extravagance and waste, but he very, very carefully avoided accusing anyone of graft or corruption.

4. The Bill to Investigate Is Traded for a Cut in Salaries.

The hearing closed. Weeks went by. The bill was held by the committee. Another bill for charter changes was introduced by another group of sponsors. More weeks went by. Mayor Curley cut the salaries of city employees. After some delay the original bill for an investigation was reported on unfavorably. The bill calling for a committee to investigate and recommend charter changes was passed - in the hopes of satisfying some of those who had wanted investigation. It is interesting to note that while the bill to investigate was being held in a committee of the Legislature and was being argued at public hearings before the committee, the mayor of Boston was being approached by a committee of Boston bankers to reduce the salaries of municipal employees. The bankers were threatening to make no more loans unless their terms were met. The mayor, at first adamant, later acceded.

the bill to present its case Corporation Counsel Silverman for the city arose and pointed out the lack of absolute proof of dishonesty or corruption, heatedly denounced the sponsors of the bill and defended the administration'silly whiteness. Rather significantly Chairman Goodwin of the Finance Commission took the same tack - lack of absolute alright proof of corruption pins a series of personal attacks on all sponsors of the bill. Chairman Goodwin did admit there was proof of extravagance and waste, but he very, very carefully avoided accusing anyone of graft or corruption.

4. The Bill to Investigate Is Traded for a Cut in Salaries.

The hearing closed. Weeks went by. The bill was held by the committee. Another bill for charter changes was introduced by another group of sponsors. More weeks went by. Mayor Curley cut the salaries of city employees. After some delay the original bill for an investigation was reported on unfavorably. The bill sailing for a committee to investigate and recommend charter changes was passed - in the hopes of satisfying some of those who had wanted investigation. It is interesting to note that while the bill to investigate was being held in a committee of the Legislature and was being argued at public hearings before the committee, the mayor of Boston was being approached by a committee of Boston bankers to reduce the salaries of municipal employees. The bankers were threatening to make no more loans unless their terms were met. The mayor, at first adamant, later acceded.

Shortly after the mayor made public announcement of salary reductions for city employees, the bill to investigate failed - apparently some sort of trade was made. For causes that were not clear, Democratic legislators voted against the bill. By a narrow margin of votes, Boston escaped an official muckraking such as New York underwent.

5. Certain Fundamentals are Involved.

Mr. Goodwin in an oration of several hours touched upon some of the fundamental considerations of city government. He quoted an earlier, respected mayor, Nathan Mathews, on certain points. One of these, namely that the city should not be supposed ~~as~~ operating on a profit basis, is important in taking perspective of the whole field or of any particular aspect of city operations. The question as to whether it is fitting for a city to furnish to a certain portion of its citizens services below cost and consequently at the expense of the whole body of taxpayers is one that has a profound bearing upon the subject under discussion.

6. The Problem before the Turn of the Century.

Nathan Mathews speaking of municipal investments said, "Quincy Market paid for itself in 20 years and has been a source of large annual profit ever since. Another, the Mystic Water Works has paid for itself in 30 years ... and freed from debt should be a source of annually increasing profit. The East Boston Ferry on the other hand, has proved a most disastrous failure, and continues to be a great and annually increasing burden to the city. The Cochituate Water Works ...

Shortly after the mayor made public announcement of salary reductions for city employees, the bill to investigate failed - apparently some sort of trade was made. For causes that were not clear, Democratic legislators voted against the bill. By a narrow margin of votes, Boston escaped an official wrecking such as New York underwent.

5. Certain Fundamentals are Involved.

Mr. Goodwin in an oration of several hours

touched upon some of the fundamental considerations of city government. He quoted an earlier, respected mayor, Nathan Mathews, on certain points. One of these, namely that the city should not be supposed as operating on a profit basis, is important in taking perspective of the whole field or of any particular aspect of city operations. The question as to whether it is fitting for a city to furnish to a certain portion of its citizens services below cost and consequently at the expense of the whole body of taxpayers is one that has a profound bearing upon the subject under discussion.

6. The Problem before the Turn of the Century.

Nathan Mathews speaking of municipal investments said, "Culinary Market paid for itself in 20 years and has been a source of large annual profit ever since. Another, the Mystic Water Works has paid for itself in 30 years ... and freed from debt should be a source of annually increasing profit. The East Boston Ferry on the other hand, has proved a most disastrous failure, and continues to be a great and annually increasing burden to the city. The Cookinstitute Water Works ...

stands midway between Mystic Water Works and East Boston Ferries ... might have been managed very much more advantageously than they have been - but not so utterly mismanaged as the East Boston Ferries. ... The lessons of these experiments in municipal ownership seems to be that it is possible for a city to manage these undertakings fairly well from the standpoint of private ownership and distinctly well considered as municipal investments not necessarily undertaken for profit: and that it is also possible to manage them so badly that they constitute in the end a hopeless burden, the weight of which even fictitious bookkeeping cannot conceal. The history of our water works and ferries is the record of a never-ending struggle between the taxpayer on the one side and the rate payer on the other: and in view of the unfortunate results of some of these undertakings we ought on the whole to congratulate ourselves that the results have been no worse in the others. The city should certainly decline to be drawn into such undertakings in the future, unless the necessity is urgent and the utmost precautions are taken to prevent a reduction in rates, tolls and fares below the point of profit." ¹

The Boston of Nathan Mathews' day was not a corrupt one for, "the city has been comparatively free from the suspicion of jobbery and fraud ... the city government has been relatively free of this particular evil (corruption)...."²

Difficulty is not corruption but expenditure. 99% of all questions that come before the city council are questions of expenditure: there are practically no divisions of the city council

1. Mathews, Nathan, Jr. "The City Government of Boston. p.160-161.

2. Mathews, ibid. p. 174

stands midway between public water works and public water supply. ... might have been managed very much more advantageously than they have been - but not so utterly mismanaged as the East Boston ferries. ... The lessons of these experiments in municipal ownership seem to be that it is possible for a city to manage these undertakings fairly well from the standpoint of private ownership and distinctly well considered as municipal investments not necessarily undertaken for profit; and that it is also possible to manage them so badly that they constitute in the end a hopeless burden, the weight of which even fictitious bookkeeping cannot conceal. The history of our water works and ferries is the record of a never-ending struggle between the taxpayer on the one side and the rate payer on the other; and in view of the unfortunate results of some of these undertakings we ought on the whole to congratulate ourselves that the results have been no worse in the others. The city should certainly decline to be drawn into such undertakings in the future, unless the necessity is urgent and the utmost precautions are taken to prevent a reduction in rates, tolls and fares below the point of profit.

The action of Nathan Matthews, Jr. was not a correct one for, "the city has been conservatively free from the suspicion of jobbery and fraud ... the city government has been relatively free of this notorious evil (corruption) ...". Difficulty is not corruption but expenditure. 75% of all disbursements that come before the city council are questions of expenditure: there are practically no divisions of the city council.

on party lines: and the contest in almost every case is between extravagance and economy, between expenditure and retrenchment, not between Democrats and Republicans."¹

7. What is Involved in the Problem Today.

For the moment let us not make a judgment as to whether Mayor Mathews' statement that expenditures rather than corruption is the difficulty remains valid. So withholding judgment let us turn to the evidence contained in Finance Commission reports and some other sources. The material as it is here presented is almost as written for mayoral candidate Henry Parkman, Jr. and as delivered by him in his radio speeches in 1933. It has never been contradicted.

"Not all of this evidence is sensational. Some of it is just plain sickening. For instance, it was brought out by a trip to the City Hospital refrigerator that inmates of the hospital were eating frozen chickens and frozen pork yet the city ordered and paid for fresh, highest quality meat, not frozen stuff."²

"The prices that the city has paid for food are a scandal. They range from 10% to 100% higher than prevailing market prices. Here are some 1931 instances:

For rib beef the market price was 18 to 19 cents per pound.³

The city paid 30 cents per pound.³

For pork loins the market price was 15 to 16 cents per pound.³

The city paid 27 cents per pound and got only frozen²

1. Mathews, ibid. p. 178

2. From Henry Parkman Jr.'s radio speeches during the mayoral campaign of 1933

3. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 174

3. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 174
2. From Henry Parkman Jr.'s radio speeches during the mayoral campaign of 1932
1. Mathews, *ibid.*, p. 173

The city paid 27 cents per pound and got only frozen

pound.

For pork loins the market price was 15 to 16 cents per

The city paid 30 cents per pound.

pound.

For rib beef the market price was 18 to 19 cents per

vailing market prices. Here are some 1931 instances:

are a scandal. They range from 10% to 100% higher than pre-

"The prices that the city has paid for food

meat, not frozen stuff.

pork yet the city ordered and paid for fresh, highest quality

inmates of the hospital were eating frozen chickens and frozen

brought out by a trip to the City Hospital refrigerator that

Some of it is just plain sickening. For instance, it was

"Not all of this evidence is sensational.

In 1933. It has never been contradicted.

Henry Parkman, Jr. and as delivered by him in his radio speeches

is here presented as almost as written for mayoral candidate

Commission reports and some other sources. The material as it

ing judgment let us turn to the evidence contained in Finance

than corruption is the difficulty remains valid. So withhold-

as to whether Mayor Mathews' statement that expenditures rather

For the moment let us not make a judgment

7. What is Involved in the Problem Today.

not between Democrats and Republicans."

extravagance and economy, between expenditure and retrenchment,

on party lines: and the contest in almost every case is between

pork loins. Mohawk Packing Company added the profit to the

For bacon the market price was 17 to 18 cents per lb.¹

The city paid 30 cents per lb.¹

"Prices on vegetables and fruits were equally out of line. The market price of a 100 lb. bag of potatoes at wholesale was \$1.30.² The city paid \$3.10 --- only \$1.80 difference.² The city could have bought two bags for less than it paid for one.

The city could have bought apples wholesale at \$1.25²

The city paid \$3.00²

"Often meat was furnished and consumed at the hospital before the price lists were received and in some cases requisitions were so loosely written that it was impossible to know what grades of food were ordered.³ Favoritism is apparent because one dealer was given 75% of the fruit and vegetable business.⁴

"In connection with the food scandal it is instructive to look into the Mohawk Packing Company of 1931. This company was simply a middle-man that carried very little stock.⁵ It sold a very large amount of meats to the city. It shipped out meat of the various well-known packers and added its profits to the market prices.⁵ This company sold approximately \$350,000 worth of meat to the City Hospital alone in one year.⁵ The procedure of the Mohawk Packing Company was to give its order to some well-known packer, who shipped its meat to the City Hospital and, for the privilege of accepting the⁶

1. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 174

2. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 175

3. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 172

4. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 173

5. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 178

6. From Henry Parkman Jr.'s radio speeches during the mayoral campaign of 1933.

6. From Henry Parkman Jr.'s radio speeches during the mayoral campaign of 1933.
5. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 178
4. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 173
3. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 172
2. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 175
1. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 174

to the City Hospital and, for the privilege of accepting the
 give its order to some well-known packer, who shipped its meat
 one year.⁵ The procedure of the Mohawk Packing Company was to
 mately \$250,000 worth of meat to the City Hospital alone in
 its profits to the market prices.⁶ This company sold approxi-
 shipped out meat of the various well-known packers and added
 stock.⁷ It sold a very large amount of meat to the city. It
 This company was simply a middle-man that carried very little
 instructive to look into the Mohawk Packing Company of 1931.
 "In connection with the food scandal it is
 vegetable business.⁴

apparent because one dealer was given 75% of the fruit and
 able to know what grades of food were ordered.³ Favoritism is
 cases negotiations were so loosely written that it was impos-
 the hospital before the price lists were received and in some
 "Often meat was furnished and consumed at
 The city paid . . . \$2,000
 The city could have bought apples wholesale at \$1.25

than it paid for one.
 difference.² The city could have bought two bags for less
 at wholesale was \$1.30. The city paid \$3.10 --- only \$1.80
 ly out of line. The market price of a 100 lb. bag of potatoes
 "Prices on vegetables and fruits were equal-
 The city paid 30 cents per lb.
 For bacon the market price was 17 to 18 cents per lb.
 pork loins.

order, the Mohawk Packing Company added its profit to the total.¹ Packing companies have stated that they would be willing to sell their meat to the city at approximately the same prices which they charged the Mohawk Company.¹ The city paid through the nose for the privilege of doing business with the Mohawk Packing Company.

"Is this sort of thing still going on? The Finance Commission report of 1933 indicates only partial cure. In the City Hospital there were 58,812 more meals served in the first three months of 1932 than in the first three months of 1931, yet there were 14,803 less pounds of meat purchased in the 1932 period, the year with the greater number of meals served.² Is this due to a change in the dietary? No. The Hospital dietitian says that no substantial change was made.² What is the inference? That in 1931 gross errors of weight were being "put over" on the city.²

"Potatoes purchased in the first three months of 1932 were 95,387 pounds less than in the first three months of 1931, yet this lesser poundage of potatoes fed more people.² Employees charged with checking weights must have been grossly careless and inaccurate.³ Apparently dealers were not careful about the grades of meat they sent out, for in 1931 federal inspectors threw out certain deliveries of meat as not up to specifications.⁴

"Bids were submitted calling for fresh killed chicken. However, a letter went out "to bidders of 5

1. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 178

2. Finance Commission Report of 1933, p. 98

3. Finance Commission Report of 1933, p. 99

4. Finance Commission Report of 1933, p. 34

5. From Henry Parkman Jr.'s radio speeches during the mayoral campaign of 1933.

order, the Mohawk Packing Company added its profit to the total. Packing companies have stated that they would be willing to sell their meat to the city at approximately the same prices which they charged the Mohawk Company. The city paid through the nose for the privilege of doing business with the Mohawk Packing Company.

"Is this sort of thing still going on? The Finance Commission report of 1933 indicates only partial cure. In the City Hospital there were 58,812 more meals served in the first three months of 1932 than in the first three months of 1931, yet there were 14,803 less pounds of meat purchased in the 1932 period, the year with the greater number of meals served. Is this due to a change in the dietary? No. The Hospital dietitian says that no substantial change was made. What is the inference? That in 1931 gross errors of weight were being "put over" on the city."

"Potatoes purchased in the first three months of 1932 were 95,387 pounds less than in the first three months of 1931, yet this lesser purchase of potatoes fed more people. Employees charged with checking weights must have been grossly careless and inaccurate. Apparently dealers were not careful about the grades of meat they sent out, for in 1931 Federal inspectors threw out certain deliveries of meat as not up to specifications."

"Bids were submitted calling for fresh killed chicken. However, a letter went out "to bidders of

1. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 178
2. Finance Commission Report of 1933, p. 92
3. Finance Commission Report of 1933, p. 92
4. Finance Commission Report of 1933, p. 54
5. From Henry Parkman Jr.'s radio speeches during the mayoral campaign of 1933.

meat" and giving information that "frozen fancy grade" could be substituted.¹ The only bidder who noted on his bid that his price was for "frozen chicken" was the company that has had the largest amount of the meat business in the past two years.¹

"Large amounts of coffee, tea and eggs were purchased without a contract and without regular testing.² One city department did its own buying and sent its vouchers to the Supply Department to be certified afterwards.³ A recent report characterizes the Supply Department as being untrained and misdirected.⁴ Discrepancy exists between figures given out by the Supply Department and the city auditor's authorized payments and there is very little check-up on the part of the Supply Department to find out quantity or quality of goods received by the city.⁵ To illustrate:

"The city purchased six months' supply of gasoline in a contract fixing price and quality.⁶ An investigation disclosed that the city paid \$1500. more than the contract called for and that the quality was not up to specifications.⁶

"\$250,000. worth of automobiles were bought without competition and without any attempt to obtain fair value on the cars traded in.⁷ One car which cost \$1700. was given a trade allowance of only \$150.⁷ \$30,000. worth of tires and tubes were bought from a restricted list of dealers.⁷ Rugs,⁸

1. Finance Commission Report of 1933, p. 34
2. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 178-9.
3. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 172
4. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 9
5. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 168-9.
6. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 171
7. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 179
8. From Henry Parkman Jr.'s radio speeches during the mayoral campaign of 1933.

8. From Henry Parnham Jr.'s radio speeches during the mayoral campaign of 1935.
7. Finance Commission Report of 1935, p. 173
6. Finance Commission Report of 1935, p. 171
5. Finance Commission Report of 1935, p. 169-9.
4. Finance Commission Report of 1935, p. 9
3. Finance Commission Report of 1935, p. 172
2. Finance Commission Report of 1935, p. 178-9.
1. Finance Commission Report of 1935, p. 84

tubes were bought from a restricted list of dealers. V. Buses, a trade allowance of only \$150. V. \$30,000. worth of tires and one on the cars traded in. V. One car which cost \$1700. was given without competition and without any attempt to obtain fair value of \$250,000. worth of automobiles were bought

tions. 6. tract sealed for and that the quality was not up to specifications. 6. gation disclosed that the city paid \$1500. more than the gasoline in a contract fixing price and quality. 6. An investigation of the city purchased six months' supply of by the city. 6. To illustrate:

ply Department to find out quantity or quality of goods received by the Supply Department and the city auditor's authorized payments and there is very little check-up on the part of the Supply Department to be certified afterwards. 6. A recent report characterizes the Supply Department as being untrained and misdirected. 4. Discrepancy exists between figures given out by the Supply Department as being untrained

were purchased without a contract and without regular testing. 2. One city department did its own buying and sent its vouchers to the Supply Department to be certified afterwards. 6. A recent largest amount of the meat business in the past two years. 1. price was for "frozen chicken" was the company that had the be substituted. 1. The only bidder who noted on his bid that his meat" and giving information that "frozen fancy grade" could

clothing, beds, dishes, electrical supplies, soaps and lead pipe were purchased in large amounts without contracts.¹ No wonder Boston has come to its present financial pass.

"During the administration of 1926 there was a company known as the Lockwood Company.² This company was owned and controlled by one man, who, although he held no office in the corporation, testified under oath "I am the company."² Practically the only thing that this company owned was the favor of city officials and the control of a few workmen.² It rendered no service except to furnish workmen when required and made its profits from their labor at the expense of the city.² A predecessor, the Murray Engineering Company, obtained the same type of contracts and the same favors from city officials.²

"Now what kind of work did this Lockwood Company do? Well, for one thing it located and repaired a floating screen surrounding a rubbish dump in Charlestown.³ The original screen had been installed by the Murray Engineering Company.³ Its purpose was to prevent paper and other rubbish from floating off into the Mystic River.³ For doing this repair work, the company charged the city \$20. a day for many days for motor boats which cost the Lockwood Company \$10. a day.⁴ No contract was made, labor was charged by the hour and there was absolutely no check or supervision ordered by the city authorities.⁴ The entire cost charged to the city for this repair work was almost twice the amount which the building of a new screen should have cost.⁴⁵

1. Finance Commission Report of 1932, p. 181

2. Finance Commission Report of 1927, p. 299

3. Finance Commission Report of 1927, p. 300

4. Finance Commission Report of 1927, p. 301

5. From Henry Parkman Jr.'s radio speeches during the mayoral campaign of 1933.

5. From Henry Parkman Jr.'s radio speeches during the mayoral campaign of 1938.
4. Finance Commission Report of 1937, p. 301
3. Finance Commission Report of 1937, p. 300
2. Finance Commission Report of 1937, p. 299
1. Finance Commission Report of 1938, p. 181

a new screen should have cost.⁴⁵

pair work was almost twice the amount which the building of

shorties.⁴ The entire cost charged to the city for this re-

was absolutely no check or supervision ordered by the city au-

No contract was made, labor was charged by the hour and there

days for motor boats which cost the Lockwood Company \$10. a day.⁴

pair work, the company charged the city \$20. a day for many

from floating off into the Mystic River.⁵ For doing this re-

Company.³ Its purpose was to prevent paper and other rubbish

original screen had been installed by the Murray Engineering

floating screen surrounding a rubbish dump in Charlestown.⁵ The

Company do? Well, for one thing it located and repaired a

"Now what kind of work did this Lockwood

type of contracts and the same favors from city officials.³

predecessor, the Murray Engineering Company, obtained the same

its profits from their labor at the expense of the city.³ A

ed no service except to furnish workmen when required and made

of city officials and the control of a few workmen.³ It render-

Practically the only thing that this company owned was the favor

in the corporation, testified under oath "I am the company."³

owned and controlled by one man, who, although he held no office

was a company known as the Lockwood Company.³ This company was

"During the administration of 1938 there

Boston has come to its present financial pass.

were purchased in large amounts without contracts.¹ No wonder

clothing, beds, dishes, electrical supplies, soap and lead pipe

"In complete violation of the law which prohibits the employment of workmen through contractors by the city, the Murray Company and the Lockwood Company furnished labor to the ferry and sewer services.¹ Most of that labor cost the Lockwood Company 90¢ and \$1.00 an hour while the city was charged and paid during the first year for these men \$1.20 an hour and finally \$1.50 an hour.¹ For ten years the city was bled in this way at the expense of honest workmen.¹

"The Lockwood case is just taken at random. The amounts involved in this case are not large, but it is a very significant case -- running over two administrations -- a one man company, no honest assets, no books, no inspection of work. "Fake" written all over it. Sometimes as much as 100% profit from the city was made!"²

Such spicy examples as that just given conjecture the possibility of fee-splitting. But the difficulty is as always to put one's finger on the absolute proof of such action.

"Let's look at another example. As you know, the city can give to any contractor a contract for less than \$1000. without competitive bidding or can give to a contractor a contract for any amount of money if the mayor merely states that he feels the city's interests will be best served by not having competitive bidding. No city department, except in case of genuine emergency, should have the right to award any contract for over \$500. without open competitive bidding. As an example of what may happen with these so-called small³

1. Finance Commission Report of 1927, p. 302

2. Finance Commission Report of 1927, p. 301

3. From Henry Parkman Jr.'s radio speeches during the mayoral campaign of 1933.

"In complete violation of the law which

prohibits the employment of workmen through contractors by the

city, the Murray Company and the Lockwood Company furnished

labor to the ferry and sewer services. Most of that labor cost

the Lockwood Company 80¢ and \$1.00 an hour while the city was

charged and paid during the first year for these men \$1.20 an

hour and finally \$1.50 an hour. For ten years the city was

bled in this way at the expense of honest workmen.

"The Lockwood case is just taken at random

The amounts involved in this case are not large, but it is a

very significant case -- running over two administrations --

a one man company, no honest assets, no books, no inspection of

work. "Take" written all over it. Sometimes as much as 100%

profit from the city was made."

Such spicy examples as that just given

conjecture the possibility of fee-splitting. But the difficulty

is as always to put one's finger on the absolute proof of

such action.

"Let's look at another example. As you

know, the city can give to any contractor a contract for less

than \$1000. without competitive bidding or can give to a con-

tractor a contract for any amount of money if the mayor merely

states that he feels the city's interests will be best served

by not having competitive bidding. No city department, except

in case of genuine emergency, should have the right to award

any contract for over \$500. without open competitive bidding.

As an example of what may happen with these so-called small

contracts under \$1000. is the following. During the administration of 1926-1929 a Mr. Fred E. Bowes was awarded four separate contracts for building manholes and catch basins.¹ The first one was for three new manholes at \$962.06, the second was for two catch basins and one manhole at \$962.02, the third was for three new catch basins at \$994.15, the fourth was for two new catch basins at \$950.¹ This was not emergency work.¹ There was no reason why it should not have been considered one contract and competitive bids asked for.¹ When the bills for this work were reviewed by a competent engineer, it was found that the charge on all four was 100% greater than it should have been.¹ The contractors call this type of contract "gift contracts" -- nice little presents made between friends, all at the taxpayers' expense.

"Another example. The M. H. Looney Company, of which Mr. Michael H. Looney was president and treasurer had a contract for furnishing teams and trucks to the city for the removal of refuse.² Mr. Michael H. Looney, not satisfied with the M.H.Looney Company contract, received a personal contract from the city for extra work which the M.H.Looney Company should have performed.² When the Looney Company furnished the trucks under its contract it charged for them \$23.00 a day, but when Michael H. Looney furnished the trucks he charged \$28. plus an additional profit of 15%, making \$32.20 in all.²

"Let us leave this wasteful or worse method of purchasing and examine the case of the police-boat Stephen O'Meara -- that boat or rather that white elephant cost nearly³

1. Finance Commission Report of 1927, p. 284
2. Finance Commission Report of 1927, p. 160
3. From Henry Parkman Jr.'s radio speeches during the mayoral campaign of 1933.

contracts under \$1000. In the following. During the administration of 1925-1929 a Mr. Fred E. Powers was awarded four separate contracts for building manholes and catch basins. The first one was for three new manholes at \$282.08, the second was for two catch basins and one manhole at \$282.02, the third was for three new catch basins at \$294.15, the fourth was for two new catch basins at \$250.1. This was not emergency work. There was no reason why it should not have been considered one contract and competitive bids asked for. When the bids for this work were reviewed by a competent engineer, it was found that the charge on all four was 100% greater than it should have been. The contractors call this type of contract "gift contracts" -- nice little presents made between friends, all at the taxpayers' expense.

"Another example. The M. H. Looney Company, of which Mr. Michael H. Looney was president and treasurer had a contract for furnishing teams and trucks to the city for the removal of refuse. Mr. Michael H. Looney, not satisfied with the M. H. Looney Company contract, received a personal contract from the city for extra work which the M. H. Looney Company should have performed. When the Looney Company furnished the trucks under its contract it charged for them \$23.00 a day, but when Michael H. Looney furnished the trucks he charged \$28.00 plus an additional profit of 15%, making \$32.20 in all."

"Let us leave this wasteful or worse method of purchasing and examine the case of the police-post Stephen O'Meara -- that post or rather that white elephant cost nearly

a quarter of a million dollars. It is the joke of the Boston waterfront. It ought to go over to the Public Gardens with the swan boats. One quarter of a million dollars was thrown away for a brand new craft we don't know what to do with. This money was thrown away when thousands of people needed food, shoes, coal, and clothing. It was little short of criminal to spend taxpayers' money in such a fashion. Here's the history of our white elephant. Born February 19, 1930, when the mayor approved of a contract for the construction of the boat.¹ He approved the plans and designs of Munro & Munro, neither of whom were naval architects. One of the finest naval architect firms is located in Boston. Why was not it given the contract?

"Munro & Munro on March 3, 1931 reported that their boat "machinery, boilers and equipment were in perfect condition"; but she broke down on her trial trip down the harbor and has been unable to operate properly since. The contract for the boat called for delivery in Boston on or before October 18, 1930. If not delivered on that date, the builders were to be fined \$100. a day until delivery was made.² The boat was not actually delivered until March 7, 1931. In the meanwhile Commissioner Hultman told the bonding company of their liability in this matter, but the mayor decided to waive the \$100. per day fine.² On March 1, 1932 two eminent naval architects, Professors Owens and Minot of M.I.T., branded the boat a most inferior plant and they listed three pages containing 40 to 50 defects in the construction,¹ yet a few days later the city accepted the boat.²³

1. Finance Commission Report of 1933, p. 88

2. Finance Commission Report of 1933, p. 89

3. From Henry Parkman Jr.'s radio speeches during the mayoral campaign of 1933.

a quarter of a million dollars. It is the joke of the Boston waterfront. It ought to go over to the Public Gardens with the swim boats. One quarter of a million dollars was thrown away for a brand new craft we don't know what to do with. This money was thrown away when thousands of people needed food, shoes, coal, and clothing. It was little short of criminal to spend taxpayers' money in such a fashion. Here's the history of our white elephant. Born February 12, 1930, when the mayor approved of a contract for the construction of the boat. He approved the plans and designs of Munro & Munro, neither of whom were naval architects. One of the finest naval architects firms is located in Boston. Why was not it given the contract? "Munro & Munro on March 3, 1931 reported that their boat "machinery, boilers and equipment were in perfect condition"; but she broke down on her trial trip down the harbor and has been unable to operate properly since. The contract for the boat called for delivery in Boston on or before October 18, 1930. If not delivered on that date, the builders were to be fined \$100 a day until delivery was made. The boat was not actually delivered until March 7, 1931. In the meanwhile Commissioner Hoffman told the bonding company of their liability in this matter, but the mayor decided to waive the \$100 per day fine. On March 1, 1932 two eminent naval architects, Professor Owens and Midget of M.I.T., branded the boat a most inferior plant and they listed three pages containing 40 to 50 defects in the construction, yet a few days later the city accepted the boat.²⁵

1. Finance Commission Report of 1935, p. 89
 2. Finance Commission Report of 1935, p. 89
 3. From Henry Parkman Jr.'s radio speeches during the mayoral campaign of 1933

"White elephant it is -- experts say the hull is the only part that is any good, that the rest ought to be junked.¹ A yacht engine was installed, substituted by the way, for the one called for in the contract.¹ The final result is a quarter of a million dollars of the city's money spent and the Police Department still needs a boat. The hopeless hulk was finally turned over to the Institutions Department. There is some question whether the boat is to serve the Institutions Department or the Institutions Department is to nurse the boat.

"Boston streets built in recent years with some justice have been christened "the streets of gold." They deserve the title. They cost considerably more than streets of the same material built in other cities.² Bituminous paving is costing Boston \$1.70 per sq. yd.³ Hartford, Connecticut pays \$1.21; Utica, New York \$1.37 and Providence \$1.06 for practically the same materials. A ring of four contractors has monopolized the entire paving field in Boston.³"⁴

8. Conclusions: That Corruption has been Rampant.

Because there is on the record no act of passing money to city officials does not mean that they are guiltless of receiving it. Any experienced member of the city council or any City Hall reporter can name names and dates.

Can anyone look at this mass of evidence without coming to the positive conclusion that the four horse-men of graft, corruption, extravagance and waste have ridden over the city?

Returning now to Mayor Mathews' maxim that

1. Report of Owens and Minot to Commissioner Hultman - 3/1/32.
2. Finance Commission Report of 1933, p. 50
3. Finance Commission Report of 1933, p. 44
4. From Henry Parkman Jr.'s radio speeches during the mayoral campaign.

"White elephant it is -- experts say the hull is the only part that is any good, that the rest ought to be junked. A yacht engine was installed, substituted by the way, for the one called for in the contract. The final result is a quarter of a million dollars of the city's money spent and

the Police Department still needs a boat. The hopeless hull was finally turned over to the Institutions Department. There is some question whether the boat is to serve the Institutions Department or the Institutions Department is to nurse the boat. "Boston streets built in recent years with

some justice have been christened "the streets of gold." They deserve the title. They cost considerably more than streets of the same material built in other cities. Situations paving is costing Boston \$1.70 per sq. yd. Hartford, Connecticut pays \$1.21; Utica, New York \$1.27 and Providence \$1.06 for practically the same materials. A ring of four contractors has monopolized the entire paving field in Boston."

8. Conclusion: That Corruption has been rampant. Because there is on the record no act of passing money to city officials does not mean that they are guiltless of receiving it. Any experienced member of the city council or any City Hall reporter can name names and dates. Can anyone look at this mass of evidence without coming to the positive conclusion that the four horse-men of graft, corruption, extravagance and waste have ridden over the city?

Returning now to Mayor Mahoney's maxim that

1. Report of Owens and Wint to Commissioner Sullivan - 3/1/22.
2. Finance Commission Report of 1922, p. 30
3. Finance Commission Report of 1923, p. 44

"extravagance and not corruption is the difficulty" we are now ready to make a judgment. And our judgment is that the problem today is more serious: corruption and fraud have permeated so much of the city administration that the people have come to think it belongs there ! And the difficulty is not to cage a single-headed monster, extravagance, but to slay a four-headed one.

Every year of extravagance has been a year of loss to the city. This means an elaborate and expensive system. However, the city administration has been very successful in its efforts to reduce the cost of its operations. It has been able to do this by a combination of measures, including the elimination of unnecessary expenditures, the reduction of the number of employees, and the improvement of the methods of doing the work.

During the past few years a program to provide for the future financial needs of the city. In 1930 long range planning had been largely non-existent. Each administration has planned its program from year to year or at longest for the duration of its term. Boston citizens have arranged their financial programs to fit their annual spending projects, or in a few cases were far-sighted enough to arrange the city's finances so that the year in which they left office would show a lower tax rate than the year in which they assumed office. This arbitrary or haphazard way of doing things is long range planning.

During the past few years a program to provide for the future financial needs of the city. In 1930 long range planning had been largely non-existent. Each administration has planned its program from year to year or at longest for the duration of its term. Boston citizens have arranged their financial programs to fit their annual spending projects, or in a few cases were far-sighted enough to arrange the city's finances so that the year in which they left office would show a lower tax rate than the year in which they assumed office. This arbitrary or haphazard way of doing things is long range planning.

"extravagance and not corruption is the difficulty" as are now
ready to make a judgment. The one judgment is that the problem
today is more serious corruption and fraud have penetrated so
much of the city administration that the people have come to
think it belongs there ! And the difficulty is not to have a
single-headed monster, extravagance, but to have a four-headed
one.

Chapter VI. Finance

1. Elements in the Problem of Boston's Financial Administration.

Every penny of expenditure and every penny of income must be accounted for by the city. This means an elaborate bookkeeping and accounting system. However, under the term 'financial administration' much more than accounting is comprehended; there really are four operations: planning, determining, executing and controlling.¹

Planning, means the formulating of a program to provide for the future financial needs of the city. In Boston long range planning has been largely non-existent. Each administration has planned its program from year to year or at longest for the duration of its term. Boston mayors have arranged their financial programs to fit their annual spending projects, or in a few cases were far-sighted enough to arrange the city's finances so that the year in which they left office would show a lower tax rate than the one in which they assumed office. This chicanery is hardly worthy of being classed as long range planning.

Determining, means a consideration of the facts available including both financial plans and proposed projects and formal authorizations of such of them as are deemed desirable. In Boston this is the work of the city coun-

1. Willoughby, W.^{F.}N. "Public Administration", p. 424.

Chapter VI. Finance

1. Elements in the Problem of Boston's Financial

Administration.

Every penny of expenditure and every penny of income must be accounted for by the city. This means an elaborate bookkeeping and accounting system. However, under the term "financial administration" much more than accounting is comprehended; there really are four operations: planning, determining, executing and controlling.

Planning means the formulation of a program to provide for the future financial needs of the city. In Boston long range planning has been largely non-existent. Each administration has planned its program from year to year or at longest for the duration of its term. Boston mayors have arranged their financial programs to fit their annual spending projects, or in a few cases were far-sighted enough to arrange the city's finances so that the year in which they left office would show a lower tax rate than the one in which they assumed office. This obviously is hardly worthy of being classed as long range planning.

Determining means a consideration of the facts available including both financial plans and proposed projects and formal authorizations of such of them as are deemed desirable. In Boston this is the work of the city council.

cil, a rubber stamp body as will be later demonstrated.

Execution, of course, is the carrying out of what has been authorized. This covers the whole field of what is known as the city's administrative services.

Controlling means the seeing to it that what has been authorized is carried out properly. It includes the furnishing of reports by the various departments as to their appropriations, income and expenditures.

What these four elements of financial administration in Boston amount to in practice is

- A. The mayor's proposed budget
- B. The budget as passed by the council
- C. The city's accounts
- D. The city's audit
- E. Departmental reports.

2. The Budget.

The legislative authority for the budget document is contained in the City Charter, section #3 as amended by Chapter 479 of the Massachusetts General Court, Acts of 1924, which reads as follows:-

"All appropriations, other than for school purposes, to be met from taxes, revenue, or any source other than loans shall originate with the mayor, who within thirty days after the beginning of the fiscal year shall submit to the city council the annual budget of the current expenses of the city and county, and may submit thereafter supplementary budgets until such time as the tax rate for the year shall have been fixed. The city council may reduce or reject any item, but without the approval of the mayor shall not increase any item in, nor the total of a budget, nor add any item thereto, nor shall it originate a budget. It shall be the duty of the city

all, a rubber stamp body as will be later demonstrated.
 Executive, of course, is the carrying out
 of what has been authorized. This covers the whole field of
 what is known as the city's administrative services.
 Controlling means the seeing to it that
 what has been authorized is carried out properly. It includes
 the furnishing of reports by the various departments as to their
 expenditures, income and expenditures.
 What these four elements of financial ad-

ministration in Boston amount to in practice is

- A. The mayor's proposed budget
- B. The budget as passed by the council
- C. The city's accounts
- D. The city's audit
- E. Periodical reports.
- F. The Budget.

The legislative authority for the budget

document is contained in the City Charter, section 23 as
 amended by Chapter 479 of the Massachusetts General Court, Acts
 of 1924, which reads as follows:-

"All appropriations, other than for school purposes,
 to be met from taxes, revenue, or any source other
 than loans shall originate with the mayor, who shall
 in thirty days after the beginning of the fiscal
 year submit to the city council the annual
 budget of the current expenses of the city and coun-
 ty, and may submit supplementary budgets
 until such time as the tax rate for the year shall
 have been fixed. The city council may reduce or in-
 crease any item, but without the approval of the mayor
 shall not increase any item in the total of a
 budget, nor add any item thereto, nor shall it or-
 der a budget. It shall be the duty of the city

and county officials, when requested by the mayor, to submit forthwith in such detail as he may require estimates for the next fiscal year of the expenditure of the department or office under their charge, which estimates shall be submitted to the city council."

In practice, the provision requiring the mayor to submit his budget to the council within 30 days after the beginning of the fiscal year has been more often honored in the breach than in the observance. To be sure the mayor does submit a budget within the specified period, but it is only a dummy budget and is tacitly ignored by the council. The reason that the mayor cannot submit his real budget within the time allowed by the Charter is that he must first go to the Legislature and obtain its sanction to a tax limit, and the Legislature has generally been tardy in setting the tax limit.

The "tax limit" deserves passing mention, although it has now been supplanted. To properly analyze budgets of other years, the operations of the tax limit must be understood. It was the dollars per thousand of taxable assessed valuations (using an average of the preceding three years) that the General Court saw fit to allow the city to raise by taxation. It was in the nature of a legislative check upon one portion of the city's expenditures. But the tax limit was solely applicable to money the city might wish to raise from taxation for purposes within the bounds of the city maintenance budget. It was no check at all upon the amounts to be spent on such other things as schools, county expenses, debt requirements, etc. It did not even limit expenditures for city maintenance.

and county officials, when requested by the mayor, to submit to the council in each fiscal year a budget estimate for the next fiscal year of the expenditures of the department or office under their charge, which estimates shall be submitted to the city council.

In practice, the provision requiring the mayor to submit his budget to the council within 60 days after the beginning of the fiscal year has been more often honored in the breach than in the observance. To be sure the mayor does submit a budget within the specified period, but it is only a dummy budget and is tacitly ignored by the council. The reason that the mayor cannot submit his real budget within the time allowed by the Charter is that he must first go to the Legislature and obtain its sanction to a tax limit, and the Legislature has generally been tardy in setting the tax limit. The "tax limit" becomes a mere fiction, although it has now been supplanted. To properly analyze budgets of other years, the operations of the tax limit must be understood. It was the dollars per thousand of taxable assessments (using an average of the preceding three years) that the General Court saw fit to allow the city to raise by taxation. It was in the nature of a legislative check upon one portion of the city's expenditures. But the tax limit was solely applicable to money the city might wish to raise from taxation for purposes within the bounds of the city's maintenance budget. It was no check at all upon the amounts to be spent on such other things as schools, county expenses, debt retirement, etc. It did not even limit expenditures for city maintenance.

because the mayor and council might still appropriate free cash in the treasury along with income from various income producing city departments. It obfuscated the layman and probably the legislator. It left the door wide open to mayors with high spending propensities to underestimate departmental and other revenues and consequently to spend more than was intended. To demonstrate that mayors took advantage of this opportunity to juggle figures, one has only to compare tentative budgets as submitted to the Legislature with budgets submitted later to the council. The substitution in 1933 of an appropriation limit for the old tax limit was a seven-league step in making the budget procedure more honest and intelligible.

Under the new limit, the "appropriation limit", the mayor goes to the Legislature and submits a program of appropriations for city maintenance. There is no mention and no need of revenue estimates. The Legislature either approves of the program or insists upon a lower limit.

3. The Budget as Acted upon by the City Council.

After legislative action has been obtained, the mayor must secure the passage of the budget through the council, not a difficult matter. In fact, a table, showing the amounts recommended by mayors and the amounts sanctioned by councils over a period of years, throws doubt upon the wisdom of maintaining a city council.

In not one year from 1920 to 1932 was the total amount appropriated during the year less than the mayor's original request. From such figures as these, it is apparent

because the mayor and council might still appropriate free cash in the treasury along with income from various income producing city departments. It obstructed the layman and probably the legislator. It left the door wide open to mayors with high sounding propensities to underestimate departmental and other revenues and consequently to spend more than was intended. To demonstrate that mayors took advantage of this opportunity to inflate figures, one has only to compare tentative budgets as submitted to the legislature with budgets submitted later to the council. The substitution in 1933 of an appropriation limit for the old tax limit was a seven-league step in making the budget procedure more honest and intelligible.

Under the new limit, the "appropriation limit", the mayor goes to the legislature and submits a program of appropriations for city maintenance. There is no mention and no need of revenue estimates. The legislature either approves of the program or insists upon a lower limit.

3. The Budget as acted upon by the City Council.

After legislative action has been obtained the mayor must secure the passage of the budget through the council, not a difficult matter. In fact, usually, showing the amounts recommended by experts and the amounts sanctioned by council over a period of years, throws doubt upon the wisdom of maintaining a city council.

In not one year from 1930 to 1935 was the total amount appropriated during the year less than the mayor's original request. From such figures as these, it is apparent

that the city council over a twelve year period never shaved a penny from any mayor's budget recommendation.

The budget document as it goes to the council is a collection of papers, data and statistics, all printed together as one city document, and setting forth a financial plan for the year. In Boston it is entitled "Message of the Mayor Recommending Appropriations and Tax Orders for the Financial Year (date)".

The first portion is in the form of a letter from the mayor to the council saying that the budget is submitted in compliance with section 3 of the charter. In this letter the differences from the preceding years (if any) are touched lightly upon. If the Mayor has any pet project, he devotes a few paragraphs to it. The conclusion is generally an urging to the council to pass the mayor's budget without change.

The second section is a listing of the city departments with the amounts allowed them by the mayor. A recapitulation follows which shows the amounts to be appropriated, from taxes and the amounts from revenue.

The third section contains the actual appropriations and tax orders, followed by tables and schedules which show how the amounts are to be spent in great detail.

A fourth section, supporting data for the mayor's message, was added in 1933. Total departmental appropriations, as well as itemized allowances, are compared with 1932 figures.

The city council turns the document over

That the city council over a twelve year period never passed a
 penny from any mayor's budget recommendation.
 The budget document as it came to the council
 all is a collection of papers, data and statistics, all printed
 together as one city document, and setting forth a financial
 plan for the year. In 1933 it is entitled "Message of the
 Mayor Recommending Appropriations and Tax Changes for the Fin-
 ancial Year (date)".
 The first portion is in the form of a
 letter from the mayor to the council saying that the budget is
 submitted in compliance with section 8 of the charter. In this
 letter the differences from the preceding year (if any) are
 touched lightly upon. If the mayor has any pet project, he de-
 votes a few paragraphs to it. The conclusion is generally an
 urging to the council to pass the mayor's budget without change.
 The second section is a listing of the
 city departments with the amounts allowed them by the mayor.
 A recapitulation follows which shows the amounts to be appro-
 priated, from taxes and the amount from revenue.
 The third section contains the actual ap-
 propriations and tax orders, allowed by tables and schedules
 which show how the amounts are to be spent in great detail.
 A fourth section, supporting data for the
 mayor's message, was added in 1933. Total departmental appro-
 priations, as well as itemized allowances, are compared with
 1932 figures.
 The city council turns the document over

to its Committee on Appropriations, which goes through the motions of making a study. Department heads are called in and questioned as to their estimated expenditures. Stenographic reports of these hearings show that councilmen know very little about the activities of their city departments. The information that they elicit in these hearings is practically nil. A few routine questions by the chairman are generally all that a department head is expected to answer before he is excused. Occasionally the private grudge of a councilman can be brought into action, but for the most part the appropriation committee is a rubber stamp for the mayor. The committee having made its report, the council as a whole passes the budget with more or less ado but no changes.

Having passed the council it is reprinted in a document called "Appropriations and Tax Orders for the Financial Year (date) as Adopted by the City Council (date)". On the first pages of the new document the amounts allowed to the various departments are set forth. Any appropriations granted since the beginning of the fiscal year are added, city debt requirements and the county budget follow. The self-supporting city departments complete the list. A recapitulation of amounts allowed, a basis of estimates and a list of ways and other means other than taxes complete this first portion.

4. The City Accounts and Audits.

The departmental list given below will serve two purposes. It will show a typical maintenance budget

to the Committee on Appropriations, which does through the various of making a study. Department heads are called in and questioned as to their estimated expenditures. Statements of these heads show that appropriations have very little about the activities of their city departments. The information that they elicit in these hearings is practically nil. A few routine questions by the chairman are generally all that a department head is expected to answer before he is excused. Occasionally the private grudge of a councilman can be brought into action, but for the most part the appropriation committee is a rubber stamp for the mayor. The committee having made its report, the council as a whole passes the budget with more or less but no changes.

Having passed the council it is transmitted in a document called "Appropriations and Tax Orders for the Financial Year (date) as adopted by the City Council (date)". On the first pages of the new document the amounts allowed to the various departments are set forth. Any appropriations granted since the beginning of the fiscal year are added, city debt requirements and the county budget follow. The self-supporting city departments complete the list. A recapitulation of amounts allowed, a basis of estimates and a list of wave and other items other than taxes complete this first portion.

4. The City Accounts and Audits.

The departmental list given below will serve two purposes. It will show a typical maintenance budget

list and at the same time will present a very good list of the departments publishing annual reports, with their subdivisions.

- Art
- Assessing
- Auditing
- Boston Port Authority
- Boston Retirement Board
- Boston Traffic Commission
- Budget
- Building
 - Board of Appeals
 - Board of Examiners
- City Clerk
- City Council
- City Council Proceedings
- City Documents
- City Planning
- Collecting
- Election
- Finance Commission
- Fire
 - Wire Division
- Health
- Hospital
 - Sanatorium Division
- Institutions
 - Child Welfare Division
 - Long Island Hospital
- Steamers
- Law
- Library
- Licensing
- Market
- Mayor
 - Conventions
 - Public Celebrations
- Park
 - Cemetery Division
- Police
- Public Buildings
- Public Welfare
 - Temporary Home
 - Wayfarers' Lodge
- Public Works
 - Bridge Service
 - Ferry Service
 - Lighting Service
 - Paving Service
 - Granolithic Sidewalks
 - Street Signs
 - Snow Removal

list and at the same time will present a very good list of the
departments publishing annual reports, with their subdivisions.

Art
Assessing
Auditing
Boston Port Authority
Boston Railroad Board
Boston Traffic Commission
Budget
Building
Board of Appeals
Board of Examiners
City Clerk
City Council
City Council Proceedings
City Department
City Planning
City Planning
Collecting
Electricity
Finance Commission
Fire
Fire Division
Health
Hospital
Sanitation Division
Inspection
Child Welfare Division
Long Island Hospital
Steamers
Law
Library
Licensing
Market
Mayor
Commissions
Public Commissions
Park
Sanitary Division
Police
Public Utilities
Public Welfare
Temporary Home
Warfare, Lodge
Public Works
Bridge Service
Lary Service
Lighting Service
Faring Service
Geographical Statistics
Street Signs
Snow Removal

Sanitary Service
 Sewer Service
 Registry
 Reserve Fund
 Sinking Fund
 Soldiers' Relief
 Statistics
 Street Laying-Out
 Supply
 Treasury
 Weights and Measures

This list of departments, services, funds, etc., comprises what is properly called City Maintenance Requirements. On an appropriation order this group will be found under the classification "for city purposes within the tax limit."

There are three departments which because of their self-supporting nature are generally listed separately:

Printing
 Publication of the "City Record"
 Public Works, Water Division

Each department does its own bookkeeping under a general system prescribed by the auditor. In practice this means extreme variations in methods of presenting figures. No fundamental distinction is observed between statistical and accounting statements. The departmental reports clearly show absolute divergence in ability and purpose in the various departments. One department will give but a few figures of a general nature; another will go into the fullest detail.

Before discussing the reports further it may be well to dispose of the function of the city auditor. In theory an auditor should be an agent of the legislative branch, that is, ^{of} the council, responsible for seeing to it that legis-

Sanitary Service
Sewer Service
Registry
Reserve Fund
Sinking Fund
Soldiers' Relief
Statistics
Street Laying-Out
Supply
Treasury
Weights and Measures

This list of departments, services, funds, etc., comprises what is properly called City Maintenance Departments. In an appropriation order this group will be found under the classification "for city purposes within the tax limit."

There are three departments which because of their self-sustaining nature are generally listed separately:

Printing
Publication of the "City Record"
Public Works, Water Division

Each department does its own bookkeeping under a general system prescribed by the auditor. In practice this means extreme variations in methods of presenting figures. No fundamental distinction is observed between statistical and accounting statements. The departmental reports clearly show a wide divergence in ability and purpose in the various departments. One department will give but a few figures of a general nature; another will go into the fullest detail.

Before discussing the reports further it may be well to discuss of the function of the city auditor. In theory an auditor should be an agent of the legislative branch, that is, the council, responsible for seeing to it that legis-

lative orders are properly carried out.¹ In practice in Boston the auditor does little more than formally examine the various departmental accounts with an eye to seeing that legal provisions regarding expenditures are observed. It is perfunctory work: the author knows of no time when a city auditor has appeared before the council and discussed cases of mishandling of funds. This situation is due partly to charter provisions that make the auditor responsible to the mayor.

He has been a useful tool at times and in the years 1930 to 1933 inclusive by his power to transfer appropriations has saved the city from bogging down in some temporary financial holes. Auditor Carven who recently retired, is generally credited with being the originator of Boston's book-keeping system. It is by virtue of his auditor's power to demand figures and accounts in the form that suits him best that Boston's Departmental Reports are in the form we find them.

5. The Departmental Reports.

Up until the depression set in the annual reports of the various city departments were wordy affairs often with expensive photographs of work completed or areas needing attention. Much excess verbiage, and much praise of the incumbent mayor is found in them. A single set of yearly reports bound in cloth made three or even four fat volumes. As demands for economy began to be heard orders were issued to cut down on the size of reports and omit photographs. In many departments this was followed out to the letter, in fact a paucity of figures is apparent in recent reports. Some department ^{heads} to

1. Willoughby, ibid. p. 646

relative orders are generally carried out. In practice in Boston the auditor does little more than formally examine the various departmental accounts with a view to seeing that legal provisions regarding expenditures are observed. It is noteworthy that the auditor knows of no time when a city auditor has intervened before the annual and discussed cases of misappropriation. This situation is due partly to greater provisions that have been made for the auditor.

It has been a useful tool at times and in the years 1920 to 1922 inclusive by his power to transfer appropriations has saved the city from being down in some departments. Auditors have also recently received, in any financial matter, the originator of Boston's budget generally credited with being the originator of Boston's budgeting system. It is by virtue of his auditor's power to demand figures and accounts in the form that suits him best that Boston's departmental reports are in the form we find them.

3. The Departmental Reports.

Up until the depression set in the annual reports of the various city departments were worthy efforts often with extensive photographs of work completed or areas needing attention. Each volume was printed, and much praise of the department mayor is found in them. A single set of yearly reports bound in cloth made three or even four fat volumes. As time went on the reports began to be hard orders were issued to cut down on the size of reports and only photographs. To save space this was followed out to the letter, in fact a quantity of figures is present in recent reports. Some departmental reports

avoid timely criticism of their departments delayed publication of their reports for months and even years; some failed to issue any reports at all.

6. Expenditures and their Relation to the Tax Bill.

City maintenance requirements approximate but one half of the amount the city spends a year. The other half goes for:

- City Debt Requirements
- County Debt Requirements
- Pension Accumulation Fund
- County Maintenance Requirements
- School Maintenance Requirements
- Land and Buildings for Schools
- Metropolitan Assessments
- State Assessments
- Elevated Deficit
- Special Tax, loans outside the debt limit
- Miscellaneous

Against its total appropriation figure the city credits or deducts -

- Available Cash (surplus)
- City Departments' Income (estimated)
- County Income (estimated)
- School Dept. Balance and (estimated) Income
- Corporations and Street Railway Taxes (estimated)
- State Income Tax
- Highway Fund Receipts
- Poll Tax
- Auto Excise Tax
- Old Age Assistance
- Elevated Reimbursement
- Miscellaneous

To the balance is added an amount for overlay and the resulting figure is the net amount of the city's tax levy.

Although somewhat aside from the budget study it is worth while to show the relation of the budget to

avoid timely criticism of their departments delayed publication of their reports for months and even years; some failed to file any reports at all.

Expenditures and Their Relation to the Tax Bill.

City maintenance requirements approximate but one half of the amount the city spends a year. The other half goes for:

- City Debt Requirements
- County Debt Requirements
- Person Assessment Fund
- County Maintenance Requirements
- School Maintenance Requirements
- Land and Buildings for Schools
- Metropolitan Assessments
- State Assessments
- State Debt
- Special Tax, loans outside the debt limit
- Miscellaneous

Against the total appropriation figure the

city credits or deducts -

- Available Cash (Surplus)
- City Departments' Income (estimated)
- County Income (estimated)
- School Debt, Bonds and (estimated) Income
- Corporations and Street Railway Taxes (estimated)
- State Income Tax
- Miscellaneous Fund Receipts
- Poll Tax
- Auto License Tax
- Old Age Assistance
- Unemployed Compensation
- Miscellaneous

To the balance is added an amount for over-

lay and the resulting figure is the net amount of the city's tax levy.

Although somewhat aside from the budget study it is worth while to show the relation of the budget to

the bills sent to the taxpayers. To find the tax rate per thousand dollars of valuation, the tax levy is divided by the valuation figure for real and personal estates divided by 1000.

Reducing this to symbols and letting -

A = Total Warrants and Appropriations

B = Total Credits and Deductions

C = Overlay

D = Total Valuation of Real and Personal Estates

X = Net Tax Levy

Y = Tax Rate per \$1000. of valuation

The Tax Levy formula is $A - B + C = X$

The Tax Rate formula is $X \div \frac{D}{1000} = Y$

7. The City Treasurer.

By the nature of the arrangement whereby tax bills are payable at a given date in the fall and whereby the city has expenditures to make for all the months preceding this due date, borrowing is necessary. Tax anticipation warrants have not been used in Boston although one loan made last year (1933) called for the earmarking of tax moneys received until the loan was covered.

That the city treasurer has not always obtained a rate commensurable with the city's credit standing is due to a variety of reasons. Already we have mentioned the city's bookkeeping system which is difficult of analysis and tends to partially conceal the true condition of affairs. Secondly is the political pressure brought to bear to make loans not advantageous to the city. In a report dated Feb. 19, 1932 the Finance Commission spoke of "an unfortunate laxity and lack of initiative in the office of the City Treasurer," for "failure

the bill is sent to the Governor. The bill is not to be
 and the bill is not to be passed. The bill is not to be
 action taken for the bill and personal action taken for the bill.

1 = Tax Rate or 1000. of valuation
 2 = Net Tax Levy
 3 = Total Valuation of Real and Personal Property
 4 = Overlevy
 5 = Total Credits and Deductions
 6 = Total Amount of Assessments
 The Tax Levy Formula is $A = B \times C$
 The Tax Rate Formula is $D = E \div F$

7. The City Treasurer.
 by the order of the Board and whereby
 tax office are payable at a given date in the fall and whereby
 the city has expenditures for water for all the months preceding
 this date, borrowing is necessary. Tax collection was
 made have not been used in Boston although one loan made last
 year (1933) called for the amounting of tax money received
 until the loan was covered.

That the City Treasurer has not always
 obtained a rate commensurate with the city's credit standing
 is due to a variety of reasons. Already we have mentioned the
 city's bookkeeping system which is difficult to maintain and
 tends to partially conceal the true condition of affairs. Se-
 condly is the political pressure brought to bear to make loans
 not advantageous to the city. In a report dated Feb. 12, 1932
 the Finance Commission spoke of "an unfortunate laxity and lack
 of initiative in the office of the City Treasurer." For "failure

to make proper and business-like arrangements for the interest to be paid upon the collections of taxes deposited in the First National Bank and the National Shawmut Bank."

Apparently the First National Bank and the National Shawmut Bank have an understanding in regard to loans to the city. They almost always offer the same rate of interest on loans and as in several recent cases where they were the only bidders, their rate has been accepted even though higher than the rate the same banks were offering for notes of cities of equal credit standing.

A frequent practice has been for a subordinate in the City Treasurer's office to telephone a list of potential bidders and ask for bids. Bids as telephoned back would be jotted down on a slip of paper and when all were in the successful bidder would be asked to submit a bid in writing which would be promptly accepted. This procedure is on its face open to influences that are not conducive to honesty.

8. Summary and Criticism.

This tracing of the budget from the time it originates with the mayor to its passage by the council does not take into account the work of the Budget Commissioner, the official who has supervision of all details of method pertaining to the preparation of the annual appropriation schedules which form the bulk of Boston's highly segregated type of budget. Nor does it take into consideration the conferences with department heads by the mayor and the budget commissioner, conferences of the mayor with municipal organizations, such as,

to make proper and business-like arrangements for the interest
to be paid upon the collection of taxes deposited in the First
National Bank and the National Savings Bank.
Accordingly the First National Bank and the
National Savings Bank have an understanding in regard to loans
to the city. They almost always offer the same rate of inter-
est on loans and as in several recent cases where they were
the only bidders, their rate has been accepted even though it
is less than the rate the same banks were offering for some of
other cities of equal credit standing.

A Treasury practice has been for a while
to state in the City Treasurer's Office to telephone a list of
potential bidders and ask for bids. Bids as telephoned back
would be jotted down on a slip of paper and then all were in
the successful bidder would be asked to submit a bid in writing
which would be promptly accepted. This procedure is on its
face open to influence that are not conducive to honesty.

5. Summary and Criticism.

This tracing of the budget from the time
it originates with the mayor to the passage by the council does
not take into account the work of the Budget Commission, the
official who has supervision of all details of method pertain-
ing to the preparation of the annual appropriation estimates.
which form the bulk of Boston's highly segregated type of bud-
get. The Board is taken into consideration the conference with
department heads by the mayor and the Budget Commission, con-
ferences of the mayor with municipal organizations, such as,

the Chamber of Commerce, Bankers' Committees, the Finance Committee, and the Research Bureau. Bargaining, trading and the whole process of keeping political fences up goes on before the budget message of the mayor is ever put on paper. The complexity and mystery with which the budget has generally been shrouded in the past was somewhat lessened in 1933 by the mayor's substitution of an appropriation limit for the former tax limit.¹ But its present form still leaves much to be desired and the Boston budget cannot be held up as a model for other cities to follow.

Boston's bookkeeping and statistical devices are somewhat original. They are extremely hard for the layman to make head or tail out of. It is interesting to note that the auditor is responsible to the mayor, not to the council; and except for an independent, outside audit of one or two departments, that there is no other check on the accounts of the city. The state does not audit Boston's books as it does those of other cities and towns.

The form of the departmental annual reports

1. After writing this the author interviewed the late Mr. Edward Fenton in the Massachusetts Department of Audits. Mr. Fenton was of a contrary opinion, feeling that the adoption of the appropriation limit was farcical because the city officials knew they were not going to live within it. Query, does not Mr. Fenton's criticism apply only to the Public Welfare Department's appropriation which admittedly is of a volatile nature, not easily predictable?

The Chamber of Commerce, Bankers' Committee, the Finance Committee, and the Research Bureau. Regarding trading and the whole process of keeping political fences up goes on before the budget message of the mayor is ever put on paper. The complexity and mystery with which the budget has generally been shrouded in the past was somewhat lessened in 1933 by the mayor's substitution of an appropriation limit for the former tax limit. But the present form still leaves much to be desired and the Boston budget cannot be held up as a model for other cities to follow.

Boston's bookkeeping and statistical devices are somewhat original. They are extremely hard for the layman to make head or tail out of. It is interesting to note that the auditor is responsible to the mayor, not to the council; and except for an independent, outside audit of one or two departments, that there is no other check on the accounts of the city. The state does not audit Boston's books as it does those of other cities and towns.

The form of the departmental annual reports

1. After writing this the author interviewed the late Mr. Edward Fenton in the Massachusetts Department of Audits. Mr. Fenton was of a contrary opinion, feeling that the adoption of the appropriation limit was farcical because the city officials knew they were not going to live within it. Query, does not Mr. Fenton's criticism apply only to the Public Welfare Department's appropriation which admittedly is of a volatile nature, not easily measurable?

leaves much to be desired in the matter of uniformity and regularity of issue.

Lastly the conduct of the City Treasurer's office is open to grave criticism.

1. The Possibilities for Improvement.

In the preceding chapters some notion of the restrictions of the municipal corporation and some of the means for their removal have been set forth. Before of the city's government and contract the matter is called for. The Treasurer's procedure is not unimpeachable. Other possibilities for improvement are the methods of the Institutions and Public Welfare Department.

It might signify the city's government to make a new departmental set up - allowing a section of the city's departments.

2. Reasons that Council is Being Called on for Reorganization.

For several years city officials have expressed dissatisfaction with the city's financial condition. There has been a general feeling of dissatisfaction with the city's financial condition. The 1937 Boston tax rate of 2.5% exceeded the average for the eight other cities of the Metropolitan area and was well above the average of the eight as a whole. These eight cities have average tax rates for 1937 that are higher than Boston's, and have a lower average tax rate than Boston. Yet in 1930 Boston's rate was 2.1% less than the average for the other eight cities. (Haverhill, Worcester, Cambridge, Chelsea, Everett, Manchester, Lynn, Salem, Bedford, Melrose, Boston, Boston).

leaves much to be desired in the matter of uniformity and regularity of issue.
Lastly the conduct of the City Treasurer's office is open to grave criticism.

Chapter VII. Reorganization

1. The Possibilities for Improvement.

In the preceding chapters some notion of the ramifications of the municipal corruption and waste have been set forth. Reform of the city's purchasing and contracting methods is called for. The treasurer's procedure is not businesslike. Other possibilities not so far mentioned are the methods of the Institutions and Public Welfare Departments.

It might simplify the city's government to make a new departmental line up altogether - allowing a maximum of twenty departments.

2. Reasons that Compel a Halt being Called on Expenditures.

For several years city officials have professed non-desire or inability to reduce expenditures adequately. These politicians have talked of irreducible minimums. The 1932 Boston tax rate of \$35. exceeded the average for the eighteen surrounding cities of the Metropolitan area and was well above the average of the state as a whole. Those eighteen cities whose average tax rate for years has been higher than Boston's, now have a lower average tax rate than has Boston. Yet in 1930 Boston's rate was \$4.21 less than the average for the other eighteen. (Beverly, Brockton, Cambridge, Chelsea, Everett, Gloucester, Lynn, Malden, Medford, Melrose, Newton, Peabody,

Chapter VII. Reorganization

1. The Possibilities for Improvement

In the preceding chapters some notion of

the ramifications of the municipal corporation and waste have

been set forth. Before of the city's purchasing and contract-

ing methods is called for. The treasurer's procedure is not

businesslike. Other possibilities not so far mentioned are the

methods of the institutions and public health departments.

It must admit that the city's government is

in a new departmental line no different - allowing a maximum

of twenty departments.

2. Reasons that Demand a New Basis for

Expansion

For several years city officials have con-

tinued non-basis on inability to reduce expenditures adequately.

iv. These officials have talked of irreducible minimum. The

1832 Boston tax rate of 45% exceeded the average for the eight-

een surrounding cities of the Metropolitan area and was well

above the average of the state as a whole. Those elected off-

ices whose average tax rate for years has been higher than Bos-

ton's, now have a lower average tax rate than has Boston. For

in 1930 Boston's rate was 44.81 less than the average for the

other sixteen. (Haverhill, Brockton, Dedham, Chelsea, Ever-

ett, Gloucester, Lynn, Salem, Woburn, Weymouth, Boston, Roxbury,

Quincy, Revere, Salem, Somerville, Waltham, Woburn).

Taxes both real and personal have been rising since 1929. But since the same date (1929), everything else has gone down - total wages paid, department store retail sales in Boston, new car sales, postal receipts, bank debits, value of building permits, and freight car loading in New England.

All the while city officials talked about irreducible minimums they were increasing the load of the homeowner who now carries a larger burden than his brother in other cities.

A home taxed for \$100. in Boston would be taxed for \$80. in New York, \$80. in Chicago, and \$75. in Los Angeles.

There are two extreme positions possible in the matter. One attitude is expressed by saying, "There is no needless expenditure; the city's services should not be crippled by wanton slashing of salaries and jobs." The other is the stand of Mayor Mansfield who campaigned with a statement that 65 cents out of every dollar spent by the last administrations went for graft. Neither position is sound and both are in the process of being exposed. Mayor Mansfield is going to discover that he cannot maintain the same city services as we are at present receiving for 35 cents on the dollar. And ex-mayor Curley is going to have it demonstrated to him that the city can abolish positions, curtail expenditures and purify purchasing methods without detriment to service.

Finance Commission Chairman Goodwin feeds

Lincoln, Harvey, Salem, Somerville, Waltham, Woburn).

Taxes both real and personal have been rising since 1933. But since the same date (1933), everything else has come down - total wages paid, government store retail sales in Boston, new car sales, postal receipts, bank deposits, value of building permits, and freight car loading in New England.

All the while city officials talked about irreducible minimums they were increasing the load of the homeowner who now carries a larger burden than his neighbor in other cities.

A home taxed for 100 in Boston would be taxed for 80 in New York, 60 in Chicago, and 75 in Los Angeles.

There are two extreme positions possible in the matter. One attitude is expressed by saying "There is no needless expenditure; the city's services should not be criticized by wanton slashing of salaries and jobs." The other is the stand of Mayor Hanford who accompanied with a statement that 85 cents out of every dollar spent by the last administration went for waste. Neither position is sound and both are in the process of being exposed. Mayor Hanford is going to discover that he cannot maintain the same city services as we are at one cent receiving for 85 cents on the dollar. And ex-mayor Curley is going to have it demonstrated to him that the city can abolish positions, curtail expenditures and purify purchasing methods without detriment to services.

Finance Commission Chairman Goodwin Lodge

the fires of the Curley camp by suggesting that instead of cutting city expenditures new revenue ought to be found. This is of course tantamount to saying the splurging shall go on, but we should tax higher incomes more heavily. Mr. Goodwin is doubtless correct in his views that our state and municipal tax structures should be broadened and made to rest heavier on certain classes of taxpayers, but he is doing a great disservice to the cause of better government in allowing his program of tax reform to become knitted up in the attempts of spendthrift politicians to avoid the inevitability of cutting down the golden stream that goes to their henchmen.

Those in Boston who want retrenchment want it for excellent reasons. They are taxpayers who feel the pinch of hard times. In the back of their minds is of course the conviction that corruption has flowered in City Hall. Why should they continue to let it go on, when they the taxpayers need the money? In other words the pocket book motive had made a small proportion of the taxpayers politically active. As has already been noted they are not numerous. There is only the Real Estate Exchange and the Massachusetts Taxpayers Association, the one short on votes and the other short on effectiveness.

They have seen fit to present figures showing the relative falling of community income as compared with an increase in the cost of government.

Decrease 1929-1932

Postal Receipts (Boston District)	15.8%
Retail Sales (Boston)	32.6%

the fires of the Curley camp by suggesting that instead of cutting city expenditures new revenue ought to be found. This is of course tantamount to saying the splurging shall go on, but we should tax higher incomes more heavily. Mr. Goodwin is doubtless correct in his views that our state and municipal tax structures should be broadened and made to rest heavier on certain classes of taxpayers, but he is doing a great disservice to the cause of better government in allowing his program of tax reform to become knitted up in the attempts of spendthrift politicians to avoid the inevitability of cutting down the golden stream that goes to their benches.

Those in Boston who want retrenchment want it for excellent reasons. They are taxpayers who feel the pinch of hard times. In the back of their minds is of course the conviction that corruption has flowered in City Hall. Why should they continue to let it go on, when they the taxpayers need the money? In other words the pocket book motive had made a small proportion of the taxpayers politically active. As has already been noted they are not numerous. There is only the Real Estate Exchange and the Massachusetts Taxpayers Association, the one short on votes and the other short on effectiveness.

They have seen fit to present figures showing the relative falling of community income as compared with an increase in the cost of government.

<u>Decrease 1929-1932</u>	
Postal Receipts (Boston District)	18.8%
Retail Sales (Boston)	32.6%

Freight Car Loadings (New England)	39.8%	
Total Manufacturing Wages Paid (Boston)	52.1%	
New Car Sales (Massachusetts)	62.1%	
Value of Building Permits (Boston)	87.3%	1

Without figures, but undeniable is the drop in capital, values which are the sources of income and therefore of taxes. And it is known that many estates paid taxes out of savings and reserves of past years. Posited against this is the cost of city government going up 10.9% and the property tax going up 22.4%!

Most significant of all are the figures on tax collections:

Levy of	Amount of Tax Levy	Collected to March 31, following	
1928	\$56,652,000	\$51,872,000	(91.6%)
1929	55,197,000	49,747,000	(90.1%)
1930	61,279,000	54,525,000	(89.0%)
1931	62,177,000	53,695,000	(86.4%)
1932	67,598,000	52,578,000	(77.8%) 2

Percents of taxes collected within five months after due dates has dropped year by year. Even increasing the tax levy has failed to bring in larger amounts. Apparently the old economic law having to do with the point of diminishing returns holds good for taxes.

The city's net debt has risen 24% in three years. Temporary borrowings have been more and more necessary. These two factors have of course increased the city's annual debt requirements.

To these can be added increasing elevated deficits, increasing tax refunds, increasing Public Welfare necessities and declining departmental revenues.

1. Brief of the Municipal Research Bureau to the Massachusetts Legislature. April 18, 1933. p. 6
2. Ibid. p. 7

...and declining departmental revenues.
 ...increasing tax revenues, increased public welfare
 To these can be added increasing elevated
 ...requirements.
 These two factors have of course increased the city's annual
 ...Temporary bond issues have been more and more necessary.
 The city's net debt has risen \$20 in three
 ...failing returns hold good for taxes.
 ...the old economic law having to do with the point of diminishing returns holds good for taxes.

Year of	Amount of Tax Levy	Collected to March 31, following
1955	\$7,328,000	\$6,858,000
1954	\$6,777,000	\$6,307,000
1953	\$6,226,000	\$5,756,000
1952	\$5,675,000	\$5,205,000
1951	\$5,124,000	\$4,654,000
1950	\$4,573,000	\$4,103,000
1949	\$4,022,000	\$3,552,000
1948	\$3,471,000	\$3,001,000
1947	\$2,920,000	\$2,450,000

Most significant of all are the figures on
 ...ing to \$2,450,000
 ...cost of city government going up 10.2% and the property tax pay-
 ...savings and reserves of past years. Located against this is the
 ...of taxes. And it is known that many cities sold taxes out of
 ...in capital, values which are the sources of income and therefore
 ...Without figures, but undeniably is the fact

Value of existing permits (Boston)	\$7,328,000
New car sales (Massachusetts)	\$6,858,000
Total Massachusetts car sales (Boston)	\$6,307,000
Private car licenses (New England)	\$5,756,000

3. Waste and Overmanning.

A. Building Department

Number of Applications

	<u>New Construction</u>	<u>Alterations</u>	<u>All Others</u>	<u>Total</u>
1926	3,799	6,016	19,657	29,472
1932	822	5,137	7,539	13,498
1926-1932 (Decrease)	78%	15%	62%	54% ¹

With such a decrease in the amount of work to be handled by the Building Department there is little ground for maintaining a 1926 staff. Actually the number of permanent employees over the period dropped only 8%. The department may then be cited as one example of an excessive payroll.

B. Public Works Department.

To pick out one division, the Bridge service, the same tendency again becomes apparent. The author made a personnel study of Boston's drawbridges and compared it with personnel figures for Metropolitan and other bridges within the Commonwealth. The results so far as comparable (there are mechanical variations to be considered) were not favorable to Boston. There seemed to be an inexplicable connection between the size and comfort of the draw-tenders' houses and the number of men employed on the particular bridge.

C. Institutions Department.

In the matter of personnel the Institutions Department has had unwarranted increases. The inmates since 1929 have increased 18% but the personnel on the payroll has increased 55%!²

1. Brief to the Legislature, ibid. p. 17
2. Finance Commission Report of February 17, 1933.

payroll has increased 55%.

Since 1929 have increased 18% but the personnel on the
 Institutions Department has had unwarranted increases. The in-
 crease in the matter of personnel the

D. Institutions Department.

houses and the number of men employed on the particular bridge,
 connection between the size and comfort of the first-terrace
 not favorable to Boston. There seemed to be an inverse relation
 able (there are mechanical variations to be considered) were

bridges within the Commonwealth. The results so far as compar-
 pared it with personnel figures for Metropolitan and other

author made a personnel study of Boston's drawbridges and com-
 bridge service, the same tendency again becomes apparent. The

To pick out one division, the

E. Public Works Department.

then be cited as one example of an excessive payroll.

employees over the period dropped only 8%. The department may
 for maintaining a 1933 staff. Actually the number of personnel
 to be handled by the Public Works Department there is little ground
 With such a decrease in the amount of work

Number of Applications				
	New Construction	Alterations	All Others	Total
1933	5,799	5,016	19,987	29,442
1932	822	5,037	7,538	13,408
1933-1932	78%	15%	62%	54%
(Decrease)				

A. Public Works Department

1. Streets and Overpassing.

D. Fire Department.

A study made by the Boston Municipal Research Bureau indicates a considerable overmanning of the Fire Department. The Bureau recommendations are: reductions in the number of officers and privates, simplification of the supervisory staff, elimination of several engine and ladder companies which are duplicating, abandonment of several old and poorly located fire houses.¹

In the Wire division both interior and exterior inspectional forces are maintained. These could be merged and the total personnel reduced. The Finance Commission called attention to this as far back as 1927.

In addition to these examples of what are generally known as "padded payrolls", there are unquestionably many others. Trained investigators of the Finance Commission or of the Municipal Research Bureau if sent into various departments would be likely to turn up similar situations. A politician must get his friends on the payroll and few department heads can resist the pressure.

4. Consolidation

Imagine President Roosevelt holding a cabinet meeting with the Secretary of the Treasury, the Secretary of the Interior, the Director of Botanical Gardens, the head of the Congressional Library, and thirty-five other department heads. Large fry and small fry all in a cabinet meeting. All on a par. Preposterous you say. Yes, it would be for the national executive. But if the Mayor of Boston called together

1. Brief to the Legislature, ibid. p. 18

10
D. Fire Department.

A study made by the Boston Herald.

pal research forces indicates a considerable overlapping of the
fire department. The present recommendations are: reduction in
the number of officers and privates, simplification of the
alarm system, elimination of several engine and ladder companies
which are duplicating, assignment of several old and new
located fire houses.

In the Division of the Interior.

and exterior inspection forces are maintained. These could
be merged and the total personnel reduced. The Finance
also called attention to this as far back as 1927.

In addition to these agencies of

what are generally known as "padding agencies", there are the

organizationally many others. Trained investigators of the Finance
Commission or of the Municipal Research Bureau is sent into

various departments would be likely to turn up similar situations.
A politician must get his friends on the payroll and the depart-
ment heads can resist the pressure.

4. Consolidation

Imagine President Roosevelt holding a con-

ference meeting with the Secretary of the Treasury, the Secretary
of the Interior, the Director of National Gardens, the head of
the Congressional Library, and thirty-five other Government
heads. Large try and small try all in a quiet meeting. All

on a day. Transmissions for say, Yes, it should be for the
national education. But if the Mayor of Boston called together

1. List to the Legislature. 1916, p. 10

his department heads just that sort of meeting would result.

Boston has thirty-nine departments whose expenditures in 1933 ranged from \$510.00 by the Art Department to \$3,000,000 by the Fire Department. From \$43,000 by the Weights and Measures Department to \$12,000,000 by the Public Welfare Department. Not much relationship between those sums.

As the city has progressed historically departments have been added. It is hard to remember a time when any department was abolished. A new service, a new department has been the rule. Beyond dispute Boston has needed most of the services which have become standard. We all of us know that city government should furnish certain services. Police, Fire, Health, Hospitals, Sewers, Street Lighting, etc. must be furnished. People once upon a time grouped themselves together and decided to do certain things for mutual protection and advantage. For these purposes officials were delegated to undertake the necessary services.

In addition to separating the city from its political encrustations, this modernizing of the departmental framework will make it easier for the voter to learn about what the city does. It will give the mayor a better opportunity to produce interdepartment harmony and cooperation. It may even raise the esprit de corps of the lower ranking city employees, who in several departments are not above insulting the public with whom they come in contact.

Departments have been created until today we have thirty-nine of them. We could get along with twenty.

his department needs just that sort of meeting would result.

Boston has thirty-nine departments whose

expenditures in 1935 ranged from \$10.00 by the Art Department to \$5,000,000 by the Fire Department. From \$45,000 by the Police and Treasurer Department to \$12,000,000 by the Public Welfare Department. Not much relationship between these sums.

As the city has progressed historically departments have been added. It is hard to remember a time when any department was abolished. A new service, a new department has been the rule. Beyond dispute Boston has needed most of the services which have become standard. We all of us know that city government should furnish certain services. Police, Fire, Health, Hospitals, Sewers, Street Lighting, etc. must be furnished. People once upon a time grouped themselves together and decided to do certain things for mutual protection and advantage. For these purposes officials were delegated to undertake the necessary services.

In addition to separating the city from the political entanglements, this modernizing of the departmental framework will make it easier for the voter to learn about what the city does. It will give the mayor a better opportunity to produce interdepartmental harmony and cooperation. It may even raise the esprit de corps of the lower ranking city employees, who in several departments are not above insulting the public with whom they come in contact.

Departments have been created until today we have thirty-nine of them. We could get along with twenty.

The Commonwealth of Massachusetts consolidated its departments some time ago. Last spring it cut down expenses by abolishing several divisions. Boston, too, can consolidate and abolish. It needs an operation and plastic surgery.

One reason that Boston has so many departments is purely political. Department heads are exempt from Civil Service requirements, which leaves the door wide open for unscrupulous mayors to appoint political henchmen to paying positions. And when there are not positions available the old-fashioned custom was to create new departments. When it was desired to give influential positions to your friends you gave them the heading of a department. The friend did not have to undergo the strain of Civil Service competition. It was a grand reward.

The city government can be run like a business corporation, making use of experts and of the most advanced methods in every field so that the greatest economy of resources may be effected. To comprehensively plan the yearly expenditures of the city and consequently of each department the number must be reduced to twenty. Imagine trying to hold an executive conference with thirty-nine department heads. It would be ridiculous. Does it seem reasonable that the head of the Weights and Measures service should be a department head? Should the Art Department be represented by a full-fledged department head? No, Boston's departmental conferences should be in arrangement more like those of the national government where a department is such by virtue of its importance not by someone's having

created it as a political reward.

By cutting the number from thirty-nine to twenty the Budget comptroller at the beginning of the year should be able to more accurately furnish estimates of how much money the city will spend. It will help eliminate the supplementary budget which yearly upsets the appropriation applecart. The other purposes of this cutting down of city departments are to eliminate overlapping, consequent waste and poor service.

We have all heard the old phrase, "Too many cooks spoil the broth." That expresses pretty well the trouble with our having thirty-nine departments. Some possible changes are as follows:

The statistics "Department" should be abolished. The little information that it gets together ought to be done in the budget department. The card index file of information concerning welfare recipients, logically belongs in the Public Welfare Department.

The Market "Department" should be abolished. The Public Buildings Department, with very little adjustment and probably no additional force, could take care of the work.

The City Messenger "Department" is a misnomer. It has charge of the city flag staffs, display of flags and the roping off of streets for public celebrations and in addition it has charge of city documents. Most of the work of this so-called "department" should be done in other departments. For instance, that of the flags is entirely a job for the Public Buildings, roping off streets for the Police Department, and

created it as a political reward.

By cutting the number from thirty-nine to

twenty the Budget controller at the beginning of the year should be able to more accurately furnish estimates of how much money the city will spend. It will help eliminate the surplus budget which yearly upsets the appropriation accounts. The other purposes of this cutting down of city departments are to eliminate overlapping, consequent waste and poor services.

We have all heard the old phrase, "Too many cooks spoil the broth." That expresses pretty well the trouble with our having thirty-nine departments. Some possible changes are as follows:

The statistic "Department" should be abolished. The little information that it gets together ought to be done in the budget department. The card index file of information concerning welfare recipients, formerly belongs in the Public Welfare Department.

The Market "Department" should be abolished. The Public Buildings Department, with very little adjustment and probably no additional force, could take care of the work. The City Messenger "Department" is a mis-

nomer. It has charge of the city flag staffs, display of flags and the taping off of streets for public celebrations and in addition it has charge of city documents. Most of the work of this so-called "Department" should be done in other departments. For instance, that of the flag is entirely a job for the Public Buildings, taping off streets for the Police Department, and

the city documents should be taken care of by a document man in the city clerk's office. As for messenger service, pages inside the Hall and commercial messenger boys for outside work should be utilized.

The Municipal Employment Bureau should be abolished as it duplicates the work of Federal and State agencies. The work of transferring employees is supposed to be done by the Budget Commissioner.

The Public Celebrations Department is a frill. If expenses for celebrations are kept within reason, one of the mayor's secretaries could handle the work.

The purpose of reducing thirty-nine departments to not more than twenty is to eliminate waste, duplication and poor service. A plan for twenty departments would comprise the following:

- | | |
|--------------------------|---------------------------------|
| 1. Assessing | 11. Park |
| 2. Building | 12. Police |
| 3. Boston Port Authority | 13. Public Buildings |
| 4. Budget | 14. Public Welfare |
| 5. Election | 15. Public Works |
| 6. Fire | 16. Boston Retirement Board |
| 7. Hospital | 17. School Building Department |
| 8. Law | 18. Soldiers' Relief Department |
| 9. Library | 19. Supply Department |
| 10. Mayor | 20. Transit Commission |

The nineteen city departments which do not appear in this list have either been made divisions of departments already enumerated, or have been abolished.

Some examples of consolidation are the Health and Institutions Departments which have been consolidated under the heading of "Hospitals."

The city documents should be taken care of by a department man in the city clerk's office. As the messenger service, which inside the city and commercial messenger boys for outside work should be utilized.

The municipal government should be organized as it duplicates the work of Federal and State agencies. The work of transferring employees is supposed to be done by the Budget Commissioner.

The Public Relations Department is a full-time expense for information and help with the work, one of the major's secretaries could handle the work.

The purpose of the new Public Relations Department seems to be not more than twenty is to eliminate waste, duplication and poor service. A plan for ready department work can also be followed:

- | | |
|--------------------------|----------------------------------|
| 1. Assessing | 11. Public |
| 2. Building | 12. Police |
| 3. Harbor Port Authority | 13. Public Utilities |
| 4. Budget | 14. Public Works |
| 5. Election | 15. Public Safety |
| 6. Fire | 16. Harbor Board |
| 7. Hospital | 17. School Building Department |
| 8. Law | 18. Children's Relief Department |
| 9. Library | 19. Public Health |
| 10. Mayor | 20. Transit Commission |

The nineteen city departments which do not appear in this list have either been made divisions of existing departments, or have been abolished.

Some examples of consolidation are the Health and Sanitation Departments which have been consolidated under the heading of "Health".

The Street Laying Out Department comes under Public Works. Auditing, Collecting, Treasury and Statistics have been put under the Budget Department.

Consolidation of city departments may be a shibboleth. It by no means lessens the amount of work the city must do, but it is liable to lessen the cost of the work to the city. It reduces the confusion of departments and boards in which excess politicians thrive, to a framework understandable to the voter.

2. The General Problem

The health problem of a large city involves several distinct phases of activity. The first phase is the hospital and health care services that minister to the sickly member. A third phase of the health program, and one that has to co-operate in departmental action, is education. Both the individual and the health department do much work in this third field.

A fourth thing is one of the most attractive things we produce. In a wage-slavery society, with an average income of \$2000.00, the quest of reaching a point of self-support is second nature. But what is the quest of health? Happiness. This is very likely to have an effect

The direct level of "deficiency" does not
 but in the work. In addition, collection, pressure and satisfaction
 have been not under the level of "deficiency".
 Generalization of city government may be a
 a hypothesis. It is no more serious the amount of work the city
 must do, but it is in the sense of the work to be
 done. It reduces the number of departments and towns in
 which excess political activity is a frequent phenomenon
 to the voter.

Chapter VIII. Health and Hospital Activities,

Public and Private*

1. Change in Viewpoint Adopted.

So far we have treated Boston's government as individual parts of the municipal mechanism. This is necessary but unfortunate, for by so doing we lose sight of the all-important integration of departments with each other and with private operations of one sort and another. In this chapter the attempt will be made to use another viewpoint. Starting from the particular problem of city health the whole field of public and private agencies will be covered.

2. The General Problem.

The Health problem of a large city involves several distinct phases of city activity. The two departments Hospital and Health each perform direct services that minister to the city's health. A third phase of the health program, but one that has no counterpart in departmental naming, is health education. Both the hospitals and the Health Department do much work in this third field.

A human being is one of the most expensive things we produce. In a wage earner's family, with an annual income of \$2500.00, the cost of rearing a child to the age of self-support is around \$7000.00. But more important than cost of health is happiness. This is very likely to have an inter-

* Figures and statements in this chapter are largely from Health League and Council of Social Agencies pamphlets.

Public and Private

1. Change in Viewpoint Adopted.

So far we have treated Boston's government as individual parts of the municipal mechanism. This is necessary but unfortunate, for by so doing we lose sight of the all-important integration of departments with each other and with private operations of one sort and another. In this chapter the attempt will be made to use another viewpoint. Starting from the particular problem of city health the whole field of public and private agencies will be covered.

2. The General Problem.

The Health problem of a large city involves several distinct phases of city activity. The two departments, Health and Hospital, each perform direct services that minister to the city's health. A third phase of the Health program, but one that has no counterpart in departmental naming, is health education. Both the hospitals and the Health Department do much work in this third field.

Human being is one of the most expensive things we produce. In a wage earning family, with an annual income of \$2500.00, the cost of rearing a child to the age of self-support is around \$7000.00. But more important than cost of health is happiness. This is very likely to have an inter-

dependence on health.

What does Boston do for its peoples' health?

3. Hospitals, Physicians and Nurses.

The old fashioned practice of treating sickness in the home has given way to the modern one of hospitalization. A high average of hospital beds to people in the community is maintained by New England. Boston is particularly well provided for.

Boston City Hospital is one of the most notable and highly rated hospitals in the country. A young physician feels it an opportunity to be upon its staff.

Much research work is carried on here. The equipment is of the most up to date variety. Hospital appropriations have gone up and up. It is good politics to spend money on city services of this sort and the physical plant of the Hospital has been the gainer. The buildings are grouped around Harrison Avenue, filling several blocks. In addition to the Main plant, relief stations for emergency cases are maintained at Haymarket Square and at East Boston. A tuberculosis hospital (the Sanatorium) is maintained at Mattapan. Some idea of the capacity of the hospital is given by the table below:

Boston City Hospital as of January 1, 1933

	<u>Beds</u>	<u>Cribs</u>	<u>Bassinets</u>	<u>Total</u>
Main Hospital	1119	65	144	1328
South Dept.	145	149	6	300
Sanatorium	616	--	--	616
Haymarket Sq.	27	2	--	29
East Boston	10	1	1	12
Totals	1917	217	151	2285

dependence on health.

What does Boston do for its people?

Healthy

3. Hospitals, Physicians and Nurses.

The old fashioned practice of treating sick-
ness in the home has given way to the modern one of hospitaliza-
tion. A high average of hospital beds for people in the commu-
nity is maintained by New England. Boston is particularly well
provided for.

Boston City Hospital is one of the most

notable and highly rated hospitals in the country. A young

physician feels it an opportunity to be upon its staff.

Such research work is carried on here. The
equipment is of the most up to date variety. Hospital approxi-
mations have come up and up. It is good politics to spend money
on other services of this sort and the physical plant of the hos-

pital has been the winner. The buildings are grouped around

Marston Avenue, filling several blocks. In addition to the

Main plant, relief stations for emergency cases are maintained

at Haymarket Square and at East Boston. A tuberculosis hospital

(the Sanatorium) is maintained at Mattapan. Some idea of the

capacity of the hospital is given by the table below:

Boston City Hospital as of January 1, 1933

	Beds	Wards	Sanatoriums	Total
Main Hospital	1113	68	144	1325
South End	145	145	8	300
Sanatorium	618	--	--	618
Haymarket Sq.	27	2	--	29
East Boston	10	1	1	12
<u>Totals</u>	<u>1913</u>	<u>217</u>	<u>153</u>	<u>2283</u>

Of this total number of 2285, only 48 are private or semi-private and these are in the Main Hospital. (These figures do not include the Pediatric Department, which had not yet opened.)

A nurses' training school is maintained. Patients are linked up to other social agencies, to relatives, and to the courts, by a Social Service Department.

Where Diseases are Treated:

Communicable diseases are treated at Boston City Hospital and at the Massachusetts Memorial Hospital. The Detention Hospital of the Health Department takes cases of unusual diseases such as leprosy, small pox, and cholera.

Tuberculosis - The Boston Sanatorium in Mattapan and the Prendergast Preventorium treat cases. A workshop for those recovering or under treatment is maintained by the Boston Tuberculosis Association.

Cardiac Diseases

Boston Lying-In Hospital
Children's Hospital
Massachusetts General
House of the Good Samaritan
Robert Bent Brigham Hospital

Diseases of the Eye and Blindness

Boston City Hospital
Massachusetts Eye and Ear Infirmary

Malignant Disease

Beth Israel Hospital
Boston Dispensary
Collis P. Huntington Memorial
Free Hospital for Women
Massachusetts General Hospital

Maternity - The Boston City Hospital takes

care of about 10% of all babies born each year in Boston. But

Of this total number of 2282, only 18 are private or semi-private and these are in the Main Hospital. (These figures do not include the Pediatric Department, which had not yet opened.) A nurses' training school is maintained. Patients are lined up to other special services, to relatives, and to the courts, by a Social Service Department. Where Diseases are Treated:

Communicable diseases are treated at Boston City Hospital and at the Massachusetts Memorial Hospital. The Pediatric Hospital of the Health Department takes cases of unusual diseases such as leprosy, small pox, and cholera. Tuberculosis - The Boston Sanatorium in Mattapan and the Franksburg Sanatorium treat cases. A ward for these patients or under treatment is maintained by the Boston Tuberculosis Association.

- Cardiac Diseases
Boston City Hospital
Cleveland Hospital
Massachusetts General
Jones of the Good Samaritan
Robert Bent Brigham Hospital
- Diseases of the Eye and Ears
Boston City Hospital
Massachusetts Eye and Ear Infirmary
- Alimentary Diseases
City Hospital
Boston Mass General
Collins St. Washington Memorial
Free Hospital for Women
Massachusetts General Hospital

Malaria - The Boston City Hospital takes care of about 10% of all cases each year in Boston. But

because of its location women from outlying districts of the city are not amongst its chief users. Particularly, is this true in the pre-natal clinics.

Almost all the general hospitals take maternity cases.

For unmarried mothers there are the Evangeline Booth Maternity Home, the Florence Crittenden League of Compassion, and the Talitha Cumi Maternity Home.

Dental Care - Patients unable to pay for dental care may go to the Harvard University Dental School, the Tufts College Dental School, and children under sixteen the Forsyth Dental Infirmary.

Convalescent Care - Private homes for convalescents, and nursing homes are available. (Boston's Convalescent Home in Dorchester was closed last year).

Nurses - Two organizations exist in Boston for the purpose of providing nurses to homes that are able to pay. They are the Household Nursing Association and the Suffolk County Central Directory.

Physicians - A separate study of Boston's physicians is hardly worth while. But the doctor as the human, interpreting link between the patient and the return to health is most important. The classified section of the telephone book lists them all. Boston's nearness to several fine medical schools and its fine hospitalization and chances for research mean that many of the most progressive in the profession prefer to reside in Boston.

because of its location women from outlying districts of the city are not amongst its chief users. Particularly, is this true in the pre-natal clinics.

Almost all the general hospitals take maternity cases.

For unmarried mothers there are the average-line North Westinghouse Home, the Florence Critchenden League of Home, and the United Guild Maternity Home.

Dental Care - Patients unable to pay for dental care may go to the Harvard University Dental School, the Tufts College Dental School, and children under sixteen for free with Dental Infirmary.

Convalescent Care - Private homes for convalescents, and nursing homes are available. (Boston's Convalescent Home in Dorchester was closed last year).

Nurses - Two organizations exist in Boston for the purpose of providing nurses to homes that are able to pay. They are the Household Nursing Association and the Suffolk County Central Directory.

Physicians - A separate study of Boston's physicians is hardly worth while. But the doctor as the human factor in the link between the patient and the return to health is most important. The classified section of the telephone book lists them all. Boston's progress in several lines of medical science and its fine hospitalization and research work mean that many of the most progressive in the profession prefer to reside in Boston.

4. Boston's Health Department.

The extraordinary ramifications of this department are not realized by most citizens. A list of its activities as divided by the Department itself is as follows:

1. Medical Division
2. Tuberculosis Division
3. Child Hygiene Division
4. George R. White Health Units
5. Detention Hospital
6. Food Division
7. Inspection of Milk
8. Dairy Division
9. Laboratory (bacteriological)
10. Sanitary Division
11. Convenience Stations
12. Nursing Service
13. Vital Statistics

Medical Division

Investigation of many causes of illness and death are made. Food poisoning cases and carbon dioxide deaths are two examples. Parrot Fever and Rabies are two other fields that have been investigated lately. Neglect of treatment of venereal disease is acted upon by the department, the effort being to make the sufferer undergo treatment without police force.

Division of Tuberculosis

Solariums in the Health Units is the general way of avoiding severe cases of tuberculosis. Children of pre-school age, under par constitutionally and in contact with open cases, are treated. Lamp treatments supplement the solarium work. Examinations, tests and clinics are held.

Division of Child Hygiene

Immunization against diphtheria is the chief

work of this division. Eye tests which may lead to a prescription for glasses are made.

George R. White Health Units

These Units are the local offices of the Health Department for the particular section of the city in which they are placed. Vaccinations, immunizations, and physical examinations are made in these buildings. Many private agencies have offices at these units and cooperation of public and private workers is thereby obtained. Under one roof access to representatives of many organizations is made available to the poor. Eye, tuberculosis, posture and dental are among the clinics offered.

Detention Hospital

For highly communicable and epidemic types of disease, this small hospital is designed as a temporary treatment home.

Food Division

Each year thousands of inspections are made of stores, markets restaurants and manufacturies. Seizures are made where foodstuffs are considered dangerous to health. Fish, ice cream, nuts and poultry require the most time. Sterilization of utensils at soda fountains and restaurants is supposed to be taken care of by this division.

Inspection of Milk and Dairy Division

As an example of how one area is affected by another, the flow of milk into Boston from upper New England and the Middle West will serve very well. An inspector from

work of this division. The latter will be a separate
division for the future.

George H. White, Acting Chief

These units are the local offices of the
Health Department for the various sections of the city in
which they are placed. Vaccinations, examinations, and physical
examinations are made in these units. Many private agencies
also have offices at these units and cooperation of public and
private workers is thereby obtained. Under one roof access to
representatives of many organizations is made available to the
public. Eye, tuberculosis, venereal and mental are among the
clinics offered.

Tuberculosis Hospital

For highly communicable and severe
cases of disease, this small hospital is designed with laboratory
treatment rooms.

Food Division

Now with thousands of inspections are
made of stores, and the restaurants and public places. Bacteria
are made with the help of the health department. The food is
checked, and the public health is maintained. The food is
checked at the health department and the health department is
to be taken care of by this division.

Inspection of Milk and Water Divisions

As an example of how the work is effected
by the health department, the food and water inspection
and the health department will serve very well. The inspection

Boston travels all through the milk producing region checking up on tuberculin-free herds, pasteurization, sediment and abortion in cattle. Milk as it reaches Boston is tested and records made public of the relative standing of the various concerns on bacteria count and butter-fat.

Laboratory Division

Testing of one sort or another is the work of the laboratory. Upon the basis of the various tests made here charts and reports are drawn up.

Sanitary Division

Abatement of nuisances, removal of sources of filth, insanitary buildings and drainage are a few of the headings under which the Sanitary work is classifiable. Inspection service is maintained for the purposes of this Division.

Convenience Stations

These are at various points in the city and if the rest of the Health Department's standards were as low as that at which the Convenience Stations are kept, it would not be worthy of the name.

Nursing Service.

Nurses are furnished for the George R. White Units Clinics and for day nurseries and Parochial Schools.

Vital Statistics

This department is simply a room in City Hall where reports of physicians and nurses are handled and tables of this, that and the other thing are composed.

Proctor travels all over the milk producing region a selling
up on the quality of his goods, pasteurized, condensed and sterilized
milk is sold. Milk as it reaches Boston is tested and reported
made public of the relative standing of the various concerns as
bacteria count and butter-fat.

Laboratory Division

Division of one section which is the work
of the Laboratory. Upon the basis of the various tests made
there a certificate is given up.

Public Division

Department of milk, cream, butter, and other products
of this, laboratory division and division are a lot of the
headlines under which the Sanitary work is classified. Inspection
service is maintained for the purpose of this Division.

Government Division

There are at various points in the city
and in the rest of the State. Government's standards are as high
as that which the Government division and food, it would not
be better in the case.

Public Division

Division are furnished for the Boston M.
Public Division for the purpose of the Sanitary Division.

Vital Division

This division is a study in the
full when reports of physicians and nurses are received and
value of this, that are for other things are considered.

And so leaving the Health Department we turn to the most interesting phase of the health problem, - health education.

5. Health Education

The purpose of health education is to improve the health attitudes, behaviour, and knowledge of the city's people. The new thought idea of medicine is the conviction that good health should be fostered by measures as strong as those applied to ill health. As typified in brick and steel, it is the Health Unit.

The Health Units

Lectures and moving pictures are given by members of the Health Department staff. Word that these lectures are going to be given is spread by nurses on their visits to homes, by posters, and by announcements.

Posters illustrating health problems and rules are shown in all the Health Units. Mothers' Clubs are organized and hold weekly meetings. During these meetings a nurse is provided to take care of children whom mothers cannot leave at home. For mothers whose children are in solarium classes, a once-a-month luncheon is given, followed by instruction on the care of under par and tubercular children.

Physicians from the Health Units try to reach larger sections of the population in their individual districts, by occasionally lecturing to Parent-Teacher Associations, Women's Clubs, and other organizations.

In the course of the regular clinics (well-

And no leaving the Health Department we

turn to the most interesting phase of the health problem, -

health education.

5. Health Education

The purpose of health education is to im-

prove the health attitudes, behavior, and knowledge of the

city's people. The new thought idea of medicine is the preven-

tion that good health should be fostered by measures as strong

as those applied to ill health. As typified in birth and death

it is the Health Unit

The Health Unit

Lectures and moving pictures are given by

members of the Health Department staff. Food that does not

do harm is given to be given by nurses on their visits

to homes, by posters, and by announcements.

Posters illustrating health problems and

rules are shown in all the Health Units. Mothers' Clubs are

organized and hold weekly meetings. During these meetings a

nurse is provided to take care of children whom mothers cannot

leave at home. For mothers whose children are in solitary class

es, a once-a-month luncheon is given, followed by instruction

on the care of under-ten and tubercular children.

Physicians from the Health Unit try to

reach larger sections of the population in their individual dis-

tricts, by occasionally lecturing to Parent-Teacher Associations,

Women's Clubs, and other organizations.

In the course of the regular clinics (with

child, pre-natal, etc.) more or less health education is imparted. The effectiveness of the whole health program is hampered by the difficulty in reaching the many people who have no symptoms of ill health.

The Nursing Service

Visits to homes with tubercular children, children in the solaria, the children registered in the Well-Baby conferences, are made by the Nursing Service. Also children absent from parochial schools and day nurseries because of illness are visited. The purpose of these visits is principally to teach facts about quarantine, isolation and disinfection. Pamphlets and bulletins are left with the families where it is thought helpful.

Publications, Leaflets, etc.

A monthly bulletin (lately discontinued) is put out by the Health Department. It contains articles and information of more interest to physicians and nurses than to the general public. But it is educational to the group it is designed to serve.

Pamphlets on control of disease are distributed by the Nursing Service. Leaflets on the care of the teeth are made up by the Dental Director and handed out at the dental clinics.

Massachusetts Department of Public Health

Members of this department give lectures, practically whenever asked. Radio broadcasts also are made. Newspaper articles, motion pictures, slides, exhibits, posters,

child, pre-natal, etc.) more or less health education is imparted. The effectiveness of the whole health program is hampered by the difficulty in reaching the many people who have no even some of ill health.

The Nursing Service

Visits to homes with numerous children, children in the schools, the children hospitalized in the hospital, etc., are made by the Nursing Service. Also children are absent from parochial schools and day nurseries because of illness are visited. The purpose of these visits is principally to teach facts about cleanliness, isolation and disinfection. Pamphlets and leaflets are left with the families where it is thought helpful.

Pamphlets, Leaflets, etc.

A monthly bulletin (later discontinued) is put out by the Health Department. It contains anti-tuberculosis information, of more interest to physicians and nurses than to the general public. But it is educational to the group it is designed to serve.

Pamphlets on control of disease are distributed by the Nursing Service. Leaflets on the care of the teeth are made up by the Dental Director and handed out at the Dental Clinic.

Massachusetts Department of Public Health

Members of this department give lectures, practically whenever asked. Radio broadcasts also are made. Newspaper articles, motion pictures, slides, exhibits, posters,

pamphlets and letters are additional means used to reach the public.

Other State Departments

The Department of Education fosters a course of Health Education for elementary schools. University Extension also offers some health education courses to adults.

The Department of Labor and the Department of Mental Diseases each does some work properly classifiable as health education.

The Boston Tuberculosis Association

Prendergast Preventorium in Mattapan is a two-sided agency. In the field of health education it teaches the children whom it houses to live hygienically. The boys are taught first aid, the girls, home nursing and cooking. Parents who come out Sunday to see their children are also given short lectures which are sandwiched in between little acts and entertainments given by the children.

The Boston Tuberculosis Association has also sponsored a special work among the negroes in the form of a Back Yard Improvement Contest.

Community Health Association

More than one third of all the homes in Boston, into which babies are born each year, are visited by nurses from this Association. Besides actual physical care these nurses give a great deal of health education, going all the way from pre-natal advice to post-surgical sanitation. Sex hygiene and parental education also are being undertaken.

particulars of the various are of interest to the general public.

Other State Departments

The Department of Education fosters a course of health education for elementary schools. University Extension also offers some health education courses to adults. The Department of Labor and the Department of Mental Diseases each does some work properly classified as health education.

The National Tuberculosis Association

Extensive tuberculosis information is a two-sided affair. In the field of health education it concerns the children whom it hopes to give hygienically. The boys are taught first aid, the girls, home nursing and cooking. Parents who are out Sunday to see their children are given short lectures which are made up of interesting little facts and suggestions given by the children.

The National Tuberculosis Association has also organized a limited work among the parents in the form of a fact and improvement contest.

Community Health Association

More than one kind of the disease in action, into which adults are born and they are visited by nurses to give this assistance. Various actual physical care needs must give a great deal of health education, and all the way from practical advice to a physical examination, for hygiene and personal attention to an individual.

The Mothers' Clubs mentioned under Health Units do a very real service. Pregnant mothers are receptive to anything that pertains to motherhood, in fact, mothers have been known to attend the series of lectures two and three times. All the pre-natal patients coming to the City Hospital are turned over to the Community Health Association for home instruction.

Boston City Hospital

Mothers-to-be are given a good measure of clinical instruction by the attendant doctors, nurses and social service workers.

Some volunteer health education of children in the clinic waiting rooms is carried on by story-telling, and games.

Boston Dispensary

This institution makes health education a definite, planned-in-advance and continuous activity. Children and adults are taught and the information is sifted out to suit the mentality of the receiver. In the neurosis clinics great success has been achieved by having patients tell their stories, stories of what they have been able to do for themselves by following the advice of the Dispensary.

Exhibits, demonstrations and posters are used at the Dispensary, probably more effectively than in any other institution in Boston.

Forsyth Dental Infirmary

Student dental hygienists take care of children waiting their turn in the clinics and by telling stories

The Mothers' Clinic mentioned under Health

Unit do a very real service. Pregnant mothers are receptive to anything that pertains to motherhood, in fact, mothers have been known to attend the series of lectures two and three times. All the pre-natal patients coming to the City Hospital are turned over to the Community Health Association for home instruction.

Massachusetts City Hospital

Mothers-to-be are given a good measure of clinical instruction by the attendant doctors, nurses and social service workers. Some volunteer health education of children in the clinic waiting room is carried on by story-telling, and

Boston Dispensary

This institution makes health education a definite, planned-in-advance and continuous activity. Children and adults are taught and the information is sifted out to suit the mentality of the receiver. In the neonatal clinic great success has been achieved by having pediatricists tell their stories of what they have seen and do for themselves by following the advice of the Dispensary.

Exhibits, demonstrations and posters are used at the Dispensary, probably more effectively than in any other institution in Boston.

Forrest Dental Infirmary

Students dental hygienists take care of children waiting their turn in the clinic and by telling stories

and giving the children pictures to look at more or less dental health is taught. Nutritionists in the food clinic give both parent and children diet information.

Other Medical Institutions

The Harvard Medical School, Hull Street Medical Mission, Beth Israel Hospital, Boston Psychopathic Hospital, Childrens' Hospital, Deaconess Hospital, Massachusetts General Hospital, and New England Hospital for Women and Children all give some form of health education.

In fairness to all the doctors and nurses in these hospitals it must be said that much is given to their patients which cannot be measured by drops of medicine or yards of bandage.

Social and Welfare Agencies

In three fields of health education the Red Cross holds classes in -

1. First Aid
2. Home Hygiene and Care of the Sick
3. Water Life-saving

Others offering some field of health education are: Bethesda Society, Boston Baptists City Mission Society, Boston Boys' Club, Boy Scouts of America, Campfire Girls, Catholic Charitable Bureau, Dorchester House, Ellis Memorial, Goodwill Neighborhood House, Hawthorne Club, Necht Neighborhood House, Home for Destitute Catholic Children, Jewish Childrens' Bureau, Lincoln House, Neighborhood Kitchen, Norfolk House Centre, North Bennet Street Industrial School, North End Union, Roxbury Neigh-

and giving the children pictures to look at more or less dental health is taught. Nutritionists in the food clinic give both patient and children diet information.

Other Medical Institutions

The Harvard Medical School, 77 Avenue Louis Pasteur

Medical Mission, 12th Street Hospital, Boston Psychopathic Hos-

pital, Children's Hospital, Massachusetts

General Hospital, and New England Hospital for Women and Children

all give some form of health education.

In fairness to all the doctors and nurses

in these hospitals it must be said that much is given to their

patients which cannot be measured by drops of medicine or yards

of bandage.

Social and Welfare Agencies

In three fields of health education the

Cross holds classes in -

1. First Aid

2. Home Hygiene and Care of the Sick

3. Water Life-saving

Others offering some field of health educa-

tion are: Bethesda Society, Boston Ladies City Mission Society,

Boston Boys' Club, Boy Scouts of America, Campfire Girls, Catho-

lic Charitable Bureau, Dorchester House, Ellis Memorial, Goodwill

Neighborhood House, Lawton House, Mount Neighborhood House,

Home for Destitute Catholic Children, Jewish Children's Bureau,

Lincoln House, Neighborhood Kitchen, Norfolk House Center, North

Barnet Street Industrial School, North End Union, Norway Holm-

borhood House, Rutland Corner House, St. Mark's Social Center, Welcome House, Wells Memorial Association, Women's Municipal League, Young Men's and Young Women's Hebrew Association, Young Men's Christian Association and the Young Women's Christian Association.

Occasional health education programs or lectures have been offered by the Burroughs Foundation, Denison House, South End House and Talitha Cumi Maternity Home.

Other Organizations

The Boston Health League has fostered health education in various fields. It has a Cancer Committee, a Social Hygiene Committee, and an information service. It publishes charts and statistics on many phases of health in Boston.

The Massachusetts Medical Society broadcasts weekly. The Massachusetts Society for Mental Hygiene issues several publications going to the parents and teachers. It also has a consulting service. The Massachusetts Society for Social Hygiene does much the same. The Massachusetts Tuberculosis League does likewise in its special field.

The New England Dairy and Food Council gives lectures, movies, lantern slides, exhibits, printed matter and newspaper publicity.

The John Hancock Life Insurance Company gives out printed material and shows health films.

Life Extension Institute (and several insurance companies) sends out printed material.

The Boston Herald and the Boston Post run

Orchard House, Rutland Corner House, St. Mark's Social Center,
 Welcome House, Wells Memorial Association, Women's Municipal
 League, Young Men's and Young Women's Hebrew Association, Young
 Men's Christian Association and the Young Women's Christian
 Association.

Occasional health education programs or
 lectures have been offered by the Humphreys Foundation, Boston
 House, South and North and White Oak Maternity Home.

Other Organizations

The Boston Health League has fostered
 health education in various fields. It has a Cancer Committee,
 a Social Hygiene Committee, and an information service. It pub-
 lishes charts and statistics on many phases of health in Boston.
 The Massachusetts Medical Society produces
 weekly. The Massachusetts Society for Mental Hygiene issues
 several publications aimed at the public and teachers. It also
 has a consultation service. The Massachusetts Society for Social
 Hygiene does much the same. The Massachusetts Tuberculosis
 League does likewise in its special field.

The New England Dairy and Food Council gives
 lectures, movies, lantern slides, exhibits, printed matter and
 newspaper publicity.

The John Hancock Life Insurance Company
 gives out printed material and shows health films.
 Life Insurance Institute (and several in-
 surance companies) sends out printed material.
 The United Jewish and the Boston Post are

daily health columns.

Boston Public Schools

In the public schools of the city, health education is achieved by films, books, lectures, and pamphlets. The whole program is under the Supervisor of Health Education. However, present conditions in the schools (i.e. the shifting of the grades into the 6-3-3 plan) has tended to make health teaching about what the individual teacher wishes to make it. There are certain minimum periods per week in which health is supposed to be taught. How effectively this teaching is done is another matter. On the other hand, the public school program of five cooperative activities (correction of physical defects, prevention and control of communicable diseases, physical education, etc.) is extremely well carried out.

In grades I - VI, and in kindergartens, each teacher is responsible for her own room in health guidance. In some schools she is supplemented by a health teacher or by a nurse. Fifteen minutes a day are supposed to be devoted to character building, which might be stretched to include health. In grades III to VI, thirty minutes per week is specified for instruction in health. No uniform text-book is used.

Correlation with other fields is the usual way in which the teacher of these younger pupils teach health. In an art class, for instance, the children will draw fruits and vegetables and will illustrate health rules. In English, stories or compositions stressing health are encouraged. Music is even stretched to include a tooth brush drill. Reading is

daily health columns.

Boston Public Schools

In the public schools of the city, health education is achieved by films, books, lectures, and pamphlets. The whole program is under the supervision of Health Education. However, present conditions in the schools (i.e., the splitting of the grades into two 3-5 and 6-8 plans) has tended to make health teaching about what the individual teacher wishes to make it. There are certain minimum periods per week in which health is suggested to be taught. How effectively this teaching is done is another matter. On the other hand, the public school program of five cooperative activities (correction of physical defects, prevention and control of communicable diseases, physical education, etc.) is extremely well carried out.

In grades I - VI, and in kindergarten, each teacher is responsible for her own room in health education. In some schools she is supplemented by a health teacher or by a nurse. Fifteen minutes a day are supposed to be devoted to character building, which might be stretched to include health. In grades III to VI, thirty minutes per week is specified for instruction in health. No uniform text-book is used.

Correlation with other fields is the usual way in which the teacher of these younger pupils teaches health. In an art class, for instance, the children will draw fruits and vegetables and will illustrate health rules. In English, stories or compositions stressing health are encouraged. Again in even stretched to include a tooth-ache drill. Reading is

sometimes in simple health primers.

A Child Health Day celebration is held each year in May. Special programs, exhibits, etc. are arranged. This generally entices the child's parents to visit the school and unconsciously to absorb some health data themselves.

In grades VII, VIII, and IX, forty minutes per week are set aside for health teaching. A certain amount of correlation now begins to be possible in subject matter. For instance, a child in a general science course learns about bacteria, oxygen, etc. A course in Household Arts is bound to impart some knowledge of foods and diet. Physical education is likely to teach posture and some bodily hygiene.

In the Senior High Schools, the program is less important. However, a requirement of one Hygiene credit must be earned before graduation.

For the special classes in the public school system (i.e. Rest-Nutrition, Sight-Conservation, Mentally Retarded Speech Improvement, Defective Hearing, and Crippled Children) a special health program is used, varying the course with the particular class. A great deal of health work, both practical and educational is given to these "specials".

In the Continuation Schools, the Trade Schools, and the Clerical School, education in health is given. In the Teachers College a health course must be taken by all first year students.

Parochial Schools and private schools in the city fit in a health program in very much the same way as

sometimes in simple health primers.

A Child Health Day celebration is held each

year in May. Social programs, exhibits, etc. are arranged.

This generally entices the child's parents to visit the school.

and unconsciously to absorb some health data themselves.

In grades VII, VIII, and IX, forty minutes

per week are set aside for health teaching. A certain amount

of correlation now seems to be possible in subject matter. For

instance, a child in a general science course learns about bac-

teria, oxygen, etc. a course in household arts is bound to in-

clude some knowledge of foods and diet. Physical education is

likely to teach posture and some daily hygiene.

In the Junior High Schools, the program is

less important. However, a reinforcement of our Hygiene credit

must be earned before graduation.

For the special classes in the public

school system (i.e. Retardation, Gifted-Conservation, Mentally

Retarded Speech Improvement, Defective Hearing, and Crippled

Children) a special health program is used, varying the course

with the particular class. A great deal of health work, both

practical and educational is given to these "specials".

In the Vocational Schools, the Trade

Schools, and the Clerical School, education in health is given.

In the Teachers College a health course must be taken by all

first year students.

Parochial schools and private schools in

the city fit in a health program in very much the same way as

do the public schools, so that separate analysis is not worth while here.

In closing, the general question of whether the schools are teaching too much or too little health might be touched upon. The modern view of health is that we must keep it rather than restore it when broken. If we are going to proceed on that basis then there can be little doubt the schools must put their shoulders to the wheel. Within general limits a planned health course from kindergarten to college should be offered, with due allowances for neighborhoods where special problems exist.

We have dealt in this survey of how Boston cares for health from three different angles. Important as have been the great discoveries and inventions in the field of medicine, fine as are our modern hospitals, the process of bringing a sick person back to health is a costly one, in time, in money, and in human values. The Health Department fills a very positive need in the keeping of health. It is a many sided watch dog. But neither hospitals nor Health Departments can keep a city's people well. Self-knowledge, personal hygiene, and how to live, are what the health education movement spreads.

6. The Problem and the Need.

When looked at from the particular problem angle, the field of city activity both public and private, is complex. Who shall say "Here the public interest ceases and here the private begins"? Above all it points to the need of trained, broadminded men as department heads, men who are able

to the public schools, as that separate analysis is not worth while here.

In closing, the general question of whether the schools are teaching too much or too little health might be covered upon. The modern view of health is that we must keep it rather than restore it when broken. If we are going to put based on that basis then there can be little doubt the schools must put their shoulders to the wheel. Within general limits a planned health course from kindergarten to college should be offered, with due allowances for neighborhood variations. Problems exist.

We have dealt in this survey of how modern courses for health from three different angles. I think we have seen the great discoveries and inventions in the field of medicine, first at the one modern scientific, the process of finding a stick versus fact to health is a costly one, in time, in money, and in human values. The Health Department fills a very positive need in the keeping of health. It is a very aided watch dog. But neither hospitals nor Health Departments can keep a citizen's people well. Self-knowledge, personal hygiene, and how to live, are what the health education movement spreads.

The Problem and the Need.

When looked at from the particular problem angle, the field of activity both public and private, is complex. One could say "here the public interest ceases and here the private begins." Above all it points to the need of trained, coordinated men as the greatest needs, men who are also

to administer and to think constructively.

Chapter IX "The Future"

1. Helps to City Administration.

Murray Seasongood, ex-mayor and long time civic leader of Cincinnati sees four helps to the city administration of the future. Local bureaus of research; city, county or regional planners; city managers; mechanical appliances.¹ Through them may be expected to come a better city. Boston has begun to employ some of these aids to progress and betterment.

2. Bureau of Research.

In 1932 the Boston Municipal Research Bureau was hatched. It is not a department of the city administration: on the contrary it is distinctly an independent organization. The Boston Real Estate Exchange and the Boston Chamber of Commerce were largely responsible for its inception. For the first year of its existence the executive secretary of the Civic Bureau of the Chamber of Commerce was at its head. Recently an able and experienced research worker from another large city has been made its secretary and the organization promises to be of enormous value to the city. During Mayor Curley's administration there was a total lack of cooperation between the Mayor and the Municipal Research Bureau, in fact there was more or less open warfare between the two. The cause

1. Seasongood, Murray: "Local Government in the United States"
p. 104

Chapter IX "The Future"

1. Ways to City Administration

Survey suggested, however and long time
civic leader of Cincinnati sees four paths to the city adminis-
tration of the future. Local business of research; city, county
or regional planning; city managers; municipal institutions.
Though they may be expected to come a better city. Boston
has begun to employ some of these aids to progress and better-
ment.

2. Bureau of Research

In 1938 the Boston Municipal Research
Bureau was founded. It is not a department of the city adminis-
tration; on the contrary it is strictly an independent or-
ganization. The Boston Real Estate Exchange and the Boston
Board of Commerce were largely responsible for its foundation.
For the first year of its existence the executive secretary of
the Civic Bureau of the Chamber of Commerce was at the head.
Essentially an aide and experienced research worker from another
large city has been made its secretary and the organization
promises to be of enormous value to the city. During Mayor
Curley's administration there was a total lack of cooperation
between the mayor and the Municipal Research Bureau. In fact
there was more or less open warfare between the two. The cases

was twofold. In the first place the Research Bureau was organized partly by the initiative of the real estate interests whose bête noir was Mayor Curley. And the particular troubles of the city during the period 1932-1933 were financial - calling for, said the real estate man and bankers, "retrenchment." Now the particular kind of retrenchment they meant was the doing away with unnecessary positions and the cutting of wages. Mayor Curley could not accede to such demands without falling down on his political obligations. Therefore the Research Bureau was limited by the situation to throwing wrenches in the Mayor's spending plans.

When Mayor Mansfield took office in 1934 he was faced with a particularly difficult problem. In his campaign he had stressed the fact (?) that about half of every tax dollar went for graft and that consequently the city was being saddled with an unnecessarily high tax rate. If the statement was true Mayor Mansfield should not have too hard a time keeping the tax rate down or even reducing it. However, after the new mayor had been in office two months and while he was undergoing his baptismal experience at making a budget, he announced that he foresaw a tax rate considerably higher than anything Boston had been saddled with previously. At the same time, Mayor Mansfield took a very important step: he called in a member of the Boston Municipal Research Bureau and a representative of the Finance Commission to go over the 1934 budget estimates with him. Fortunately in the preceding year, the Research Bureau had managed to pry from the then Mayor Curley

was involved. In the first place the Research Bureau was organized partly by the initiative of the real estate interests whose best man was Mayor Curley. And the particular troubles of the city during the period 1922-1923 were financial - calling for, said the real estate men and bankers, "retrenchment." Now the particular kind of retrenchment they meant was the going away with unnecessary positions and the cutting of wages. Mayor Curley could not accede to such demands without falling down on his political obligations. Therefore the Research Bureau was limited by the situation to throwing wrenches in the Mayor's spending plans.

When Mayor Mansfield took office in 1924 he was faced with a particularly difficult problem. In his campaign he had stressed the fact (?) that about half of every tax dollar went for profit and that consequently the city was being saddled with an unnecessarily high tax rate. If the statement was true Mayor Mansfield should not have too hard a time keeping the tax rate down or even reducing it. However, after the new mayor had been in office two months and while he was undergoing his practical experience at making a budget, he announced that he foresaw a tax rate considerably higher than anything Boston had been saddled with previously. At the same time, Mayor Mansfield took a very important step: he called in a member of the Boston Municipal Research Bureau and a representative of the Finance Commission to go over the 1924 budget estimates with him. Fortunately in the preceding year, the Research Bureau had managed to get from the Mayor Curley

the right to examine the detailed budget estimates of the city, as proposed by the various department heads and as amended by the mayor. At that time several members of the Research Bureau had worked night and day on this material, familiarized themselves with it and even had made an independent report to the Legislature. In fact the Research Bureau had discovered ways and means to save the city about a million dollars. So when Mayor Mansfield called them in to help him, the material was ready (for Mayor Curley had of course refused to make any serious changes in his budget). Glaring examples of padded payrolls and unnecessary positions were laid before Mayor Mansfield. Recent newspapers tell the story of men being dropped from the payroll, positions abolished and wages reduced. This means in different words the discharging of certain men who did nothing but collect their pay, the amputation from the city's bodily mechanism of some sixth fingers and otherwise frivolous appendages and the bringing of certain wages classes into line with what private employers pay.

Unquestionably at the root of this pruning is the advice of the Boston Municipal Research Bureau. No new mayor of the city of Boston at this time, even granting he had the wish to do so, would have been able to make such an effective start without the information that was furnished by the Research Bureau. The writer doubts if there existed in 1932 more than a dozen people in the City of Boston who had any comprehensive knowledge of the leaks in the city administration. To have such a constantly growing body of information available

the right to examine the detailed budget estimates of the city, as proposed by the various department heads and as amended by the mayor. At that time several members of the Research Bureau had worked night and day on this material, familiarized themselves with it and even had made an independent report to the Legislature. In fact the Research Bureau had discovered ways and means to save the city about a million dollars. So when Mayor Mahanfield called them in to help him, the material was ready (for Mayor Curley had of course refused to make any serious changes in his budget). Giving examples of padded payrolls and unnecessary positions were laid before Mayor Mahanfield. Recent newspapers tell the story of men being dropped from the payroll, positions abolished and wages reduced. This means in different words the discharging of certain men who did nothing but collect their pay, the amputation from the city's bodily mechanism of some sixth fingers and otherwise frivolous appendages and the bringing of certain wages classes into line with what private employers pay.

Undoubtedly at the root of this pruning is the advice of the Boston Municipal Research Bureau. No new mayor of the city of Boston at this time, even granting he had the wish to do so, would have been able to make such an effective start without the information that was furnished by the Research Bureau. The writer doubts if there existed in 1932 more than a dozen people in the City of Boston who had any comprehensive knowledge of the tasks in the city administration. To have such a constantly growing body of information available

to all who are interested by an independent organization, is bound to promote the city's best interests. In the election of 1933 one candidate for mayor wrote his platform very largely from the recommendations and findings of the Research Bureau.¹ Other candidates called upon the Bureau for information.

If the present mayor and future mayors continue to use the Research Bureau instead of abusing it, Boston may yet find itself among the top ranking cities in the quality of service rendered to its citizens.

3. City, County and Regional Planning.

The record of Boston's planning in the past has not been exemplary. If planning had been practiced by the fire department, fire stations would not have been built as they have been - simply because a horse-drawn apparatus had existed before in that particular location. Street widenings would have been undertaken years ago and at less cost to the city if the situation had been properly analyzed. To be sure, Boston has had a City Planning Board, but city administrations have rarely availed themselves of it. When recently the White Fund was used to build a Prado in the north end, the whole proposition smacked of a wild desire to spend money that was burning a hole in the politicians' pockets, rather than a thought out plan of wide-spread benefit. To be sure the particular alley that was widened and beautified with consequent light and air let in, did benefit. But a city grade school lost most of its play-yard in the process! Planning?

County planning is practically non-existent. The

1. Henry Parkman, Jr.

to all who are interested by an independent organization, is bound to promote the city's best interests. In the election of 1933 one candidate for mayor wrote his platform very largely from the recommendations and findings of the Research Bureau. Other candidates relied upon the Bureau for information. If the present mayor and future mayors

continue to use the Research Bureau instead of abusing it, Boston may yet find itself among the top ranking cities in the quality of service rendered to its citizens.

3. City, County and Regional Planning.

The record of Boston's planning in the past has not been exemplary. If planning had been practiced by the fire department, fire stations would not have been built as they have been - simply because a horse-drawn apparatus had existed before in that particular location. Street widenings would have been undertaken years ago and at less cost to the city if the situation had been properly analyzed. To be sure, Boston has had a City Planning Board, but city administrations have rarely availed themselves of it. When recently the White Fund was used to build a bridge in the north end, the whole proposition smacked of a wild desire to spend money that was burning a hole in the politicians' pockets, rather than a thought out plan of wide-spread benefit. To be sure the particular alley that was widened and beautified with consequent light and air let in, did benefit. But a city grade school last west of its play-yard in the process! Planning?

County planning is practically non-existent. The

Metropolitan Planning Division has been mentioned.¹ The state via the legislature and the Metropolitan District Commission plan and maintain various projects and services in Boston which in some cities would be county concerns.

The Emergency Planning and Research Bureau, organized by architects and engineers of Boston to aid in helping unemployed members of these professions, has worked up a considerable body of plans and studies. These relate to proposed rehabilitation of depreciated properties and districts as well as to the normal extension of public improvements in Boston. Much of their material is valuable to the sociologist and welfare worker.

The remaining problem is planning for slum clearance. This has a vital connection with the "new deal." The belief is widespread that if the building industry could be set in motion our economic troubles would briskly disappear. Whether this be true or not, pressure is apparent from Washington to encourage building both public and private. Mass housing for low rents is being subsidized in the states where there is permissive legislation, by the government policy of 30% gift and 70% loan. A unit has been proposed for East Boston and strenuously opposed by owners of slum property. Whether the housing is good or bad, the tide is definitely running toward governmental expenditures in this field. England has started a five year program for slum clearance which calls for the demolition of 210,000 houses and a quarter of a million new dwellings to be built. Our own federal government has

1. See Chapter II, Section 7, supra.

Metropolitan Planning Division has been mentioned. The state
via the Legislature and the Metropolitan District Commission
plan and maintain various projects and services in Boston
which in some cases would be county concerns.

The Emergency Planning and Research Bureau

organized by architects and engineers of Boston to aid in help-
ing unemployed members of these professions, has worked up a
considerable body of plans and studies. These relate to pro-
posed rehabilitation of deteriorated properties and districts
as well as to the normal extension of public improvements in
Boston. Much of their material is valuable to the sociologist
and welfare worker.

The remaining problem is planning for
slum clearance. This has a vital connection with the "new
deal." The belief is widespread that if the building industry
could be set in motion our economic troubles would quickly dis-
appear. Whether this be true or not, pressure is apparent from
Washington to encourage building both public and private. Mass
housing for low rents is being subsidized in the states where
there is permissive legislation, by the government policy of
50% gift and 50% loan. A bill has been proposed for East Boston
and strenuously opposed by owners of slum property. Whether
the housing is good or bad, the tide is definitely turning
toward governmental expenditures in this field. England has
started a five year program for slum clearance which calls for
the demolition of 250,000 houses and a quarter of a million
new dwellings to be built. Our own Federal government has

allocated \$100,000,000 for low cost housing operations and it would be very strange if Boston did not choose to accept some of the money available. However, the point to be stressed is that planning for the city's housing needs should be done in advance. The north end and the south end have lost from one fifth to one quarter of their population in the last ten years. Trends of this sort should be thoroughly studied before blindly planting a municipal housing venture.

In the hands of an honest and intelligent administrator planning of all sorts can be utilized to much better advantage than it has been in the past decade.

4. Possibilities of City Manager.

There has been no serious attempt to introduce the city manager into Boston. Whether the tone of government would be appreciably raised is therefore unpredictable. From the experience of other cities it is pretty plain that even where the city manager is opposed and thwarted by local politicians he saves the city more than his salary. In many cities the fruits of city managership have been sweet - except to the politicians. Since Boston does not seem to contain any large element campaigning for the city manager plan it is probably expedient to omit discussion of its possibilities.

5. Mechanical Appliances.

In general politicians oppose all labor-saving devices. Anything that tends to take away jobs tends to reduce the number of places into which the politicians' constituents may be placed. Cincinnati had no traffic lights

allocated \$100,000 for low cost housing operations and it would be very strange if Boston did not choose to accept some of the money available. However, the point to be stressed is that planning for the city's housing needs should be done in advance. The north end and the south end have lost from one fifth to one quarter of their population in the last few years. Trends of this sort should be thoroughly studied before considering planning a municipal housing venture.

In the hands of an honest and intelligent

administrator planning of all sorts can be utilized to work

better advantage than it has been in the past decade.

4. Possibilities of City Manager.

There has been no serious attempt to introduce the city manager into Boston. Whether the form of government would be appreciably raised is therefore unpredictable. From the experience of other cities it is pretty plain that even where the city manager is proposed and thwarted by local politicians he saves the city more than his salary. In many cities the fruits of city manager have been sweet - except to the politicians. Since Boston does not seem to contain any large element campaigning for the city manager plan it is probably expedient to omit discussion of its possibilities.

5. Technical Assistance.

In general politicians oppose all labor-saving devices. Anything that tends to take away jobs tends to reduce the number of places into which the politicians' constituents may be placed. Cincinnati had no traffic lights

until 1926 for this reason.¹ In Boston photostats and mechanical billing devices have gone unused for similar reasons. Not that you can place your finger on the public utterance of a responsible official to that effect, for you probably can not. But if you go to a department head and ask why he has never requested some mechanical device he raises up a screen of fictitious reasons which are to the tune of "impractical", "expensive", or "not suited to our needs." Behind this of course lies the plain fact that machines displace men. Installation of labor saving devices means getting rid of men and women and one of the cardinal rules of politics is to find jobs for your friends, never lay them off.

So as with other things, the temper of the mayor and the extent of his political obligations are all important in this matter of bringing the city mechanically up to date.

6. Cooperation between Departments.

Have you had the experience of seeing a newly paved street all hacked up by trenches within a few weeks of its completion? Probably the city had by two separate administrative and legislative decisions decided to install new pavement and a new sewer system and there being no one to coordinate the two projects the wrong one came first.

Shall the purchasing department and the departments for which it buys develop a better liasion? Much of the discussion of whether Boston has been plundered by graft and corruption or simply has been a victim of wasteful

1. Seasongood, ibid. p. 102

2. Seasongood, ibid. p. 102

3. Chapter IX, Section 3, ibid.

until 1928 for this reason. In Boston photographs and mechanical lifting devices have been used for similar reasons. Not that you can place your finger on the public utterance of a responsible official to that effect, for you probably can not get it you go to a department head and ask why he has never requested some mechanical device he raises no screen of official reasons which are to the tune of "impractical", "expensive", or "not suited to our needs." Behind this of course lies the plain fact that machines displace men. Installation of labor saving devices means getting rid of men and women and one of the cardinal rules of politics is to find jobs for your friends, never lay them off.

So as with other things, the temper of the mayor and the extent of his political obligations are all important in this matter of bringing the city mechanically up to date.

8. Cooperation between Departments.

Have you had the experience of seeing a newly paved street all hacked up by trenches within a few weeks of its completion? Probably the city had by two separate administrative and legislative decisions decided to install new sewer and a new sewer system and there being no one to coordinate the two projects the wrong one came first. Shall the purchasing department and the departments for which it buys develop a better liaison? Much of the discussion of whether Boston has been hindered by graft and corruption or simply has been a victim of wasteful

spending centers on this question. In the past the door has been left open and political favorites have stolen the horse with the most amazing regularity. The Mohawk Packing Company scandal is an excellent example.¹ The purifying of the purchasing department and the coordination of all the departments will be a testing block for all future mayors.

7. Rapid Change in the Field of Corporation Law, Home Rule, and Housing.

Textbooks written twenty years ago on the subject of municipal corporation are practically obsolete today.² Home rule is not Boston's yet; police, health and taxation are still very much in state hands. But the new charter proposals will bring some changes. Boston and the metropolitan cities are buying the Boston Elevated railway as has been pointed out in Chapter VIII. Whether the added services and duties that the city may undertake will add to the power of the politicians and will be conducted on a low plane is problematical. Possibly with tax rates that all but break the taxpayers' backs an informed and active public may arise which will improve the tone of city government.

Housing as a city activity is on the horizon. Vienna and Cologne regard it as essential a function as the giving of water, fire or police services. As stated in an earlier paragraph, the P. W. A. is a potent influence for innovation in the city's field of action.³ State or municipal law will regulate rents, charges, capital structure, rate of return and methods and areas of operation if Boston goes into

1. Supra, p. 43

2. Seasongood, ibid. p. 122

3. Chapter IX, Section 3, supra.

100

spending centers on this question. In the past the door has been left open and political favorites have stolen the horse with the most amazing regularity. The Mohawk Packing Company scandal is an excellent example.¹ The purifying of the purchasing department and the coordination of all the departments will be a testing block for all future mayors.

V. Resid Change in the Field of Corporation Law.

Home Rule, and Housing.

Textbooks written twenty years ago on the subject of municipal corporation are practically obsolete today.² Home rule is not Boston's yet; police, health and taxation are still very much in state hands. But the new charter proposals will bring some changes. Boston and the metropolitan cities are buying the Boston Elevated railway as has been pointed out in Chapter VIII. Whether the added services and duties that the city may undertake will add to the power of the politicians and will be conducted on a low plane is problematical. Possibly with tax rates that all but break the taxpayers' backs an informed and active public may arise which will improve the tone of city government.

Housing as a city activity is on the horizon. Vienna and Cologne regard it as essential a function as the giving of water, fire or police services. As stated in an earlier paragraph, the F. W. A. is a potent influence for innovation in the city's field of action.³ State or municipal law will regulate rents, charges, capital structure, rate of return and methods and areas of operation if Boston goes into

1. Supra, p. 43.
2. Seasongood, ibid. p. 122.
3. Chapter IX, Section 3, supra.

housing.¹

8. Faint Hope of Civic Education.

Some writers are preaching that the hope of the future lies in civic education. Government should be taught to the youngest (they say) and must continue through high school and college.² This method of inculcating civic interest and intelligence is more wished for than it is practiced. Boston's schools are not picking up the idea. Courses in government particularly local government in the colleges of greater Boston are not largely attended. Boston University, Boston College and Northeastern offer practically nothing in the field of municipal administration. Apparently the use of experts in the city government is going to be foregone or else we must import them. And the matter of an intelligent, civic-minded population is going to be left to chance.

9. The Portents.

Looking back over the more important influences on Boston's government it would seem to all focus on the mayor himself. With an honest, intelligent and energetic mayor in office we may hope for progress in the same direction that Cincinnati, Rochester, and some of the European cities have gone. The mayor may take the city along a path from which not even a corrupt successor can entirely withdraw. The present incumbent has started auspiciously.

1. Seasingood, ibid. p. 125

2. Ibid. p. 134

SUMMARY

Approaching the subject of municipal government with a hasty view of the political configuration of the city, (Chapter I), the author has proceeded in the chapter on metropolitan relationships to discuss Boston as it is affected by State and County units. The author has then backtracked into Boston's colonial days and in historical fashion carried the city's framework of government through its various changes.

Chapters IV and VI discuss first the general administrative work of the city, then one angle of it, Finance. In Chapter VII an attempt has been made to improve upon the existing order of things.

In "Graft, Corruption and Waste" (Chapter V) some general considerations on the subject are followed by specific instances.

For the most part discussion of activities has been limited to those performed by public (government) departments and boards. Chapter VIII by reviewing the whole range of facilities in two related fields in some measure shows the interlocking of public and private agencies.

Lastly in Chapter IX some considerations for the future are offered.

SUMMARY

An introduction to the subject of municipal government with a history view of the political development of the city. (Chapter I), the author has proceeded in a logical and systematic relationship to discuss Boston as it is affected by state and county units. The author has been particularly interested in the colonial days and in historical factors causing the city's growth of government through its various changes. Chapters IV and V discuss first the general administrative work of the city, then one angle of it, Finance. In Chapter VII an attempt has been made to leave you with the existing order of things. In "Graft, Corruption and Waste" (Chapter V) some general considerations on the subject are followed by specific instances. For the past part of a century of political development has been limited to those performed by public (government) departments. Chapter VIII by reviewing the whole range of activities in the related fields in some measure shows the interlocking of public and private activities. Lastly in Chapter IX some considerations for the future are offered.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. Books

- Ernst, Carl W. "Constitutional History of Boston, Massachusetts"
 - Boston 1894. p. 98-113; 166-173.
- Griffith, Ernest S. "Modern Development of City Government"
 - Oxford University 1927. Book II, Chapter XII.
- Huse, Charles P. "The Financial History of Boston"
 - Harvard University Press 1916. Entire book;
 excellent but only goes down to 1909.
- Koren, John "Boston: 1822-1922"
 - City of Boston Printing Department 1922.
 Portions on charter changes.
- Lodge, Henry Cabot "History of Towns: Boston"
 - Longmans, Green & Company, New York 1902.
 Chapter XI.
- MacDonald, Austin F. "American City Government"
 - Thomas Y. Crowell Company 1929.
 Chapters VI, VIII and XVIII.
- Mathews, Nathan Jr. "The City Government of Boston"
 - Rockwell and Churchill 1895.
 All. Valuable on problems of 19th century Boston.
- Maxey, Chester C. "Readings in Municipal Government"
 - Doubleday & Page Company. 1924 Chapters II and
 XVII.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. Books

- Gray, Carl. "Constitutional History of Boston, Massachusetts". Boston 1964. v. 88-118; 166-178.
- Griffith, Ernest S. "Modern Development of City Government". Oxford University Press 1927. Book II, Chapter XII.
- Hess, Charles F. "The Municipal History of Boston". Harvard University Press 1916. Antiquarian book; excellent but only goes down to 1805.
- Foran, John. "Boston: 1822-1922". City of Boston Printing Department 1922.
- Portions on water changes.
- Lodge, Henry Cabot. "History of Town of Boston". Houghton, Green & Company, New York 1900.
- Chapter XI.
- Macdonald, Austin W. "American City Government". Thomas Y. Crowell Company 1929.
- Chapters VI, VIII and XVII.
- Waters, Nathan Jr. "The City Government of Boston". Houghton and Ginn 1905.
- iii. Valuation of problems of 19th century Boston.
- Maxey, Chester C. "Boschons in Antiquarian Government". Doubleday & Page Company, 1924. Chapters II and XVII.

Maxey, Chester C. "Urban Democracy"

- D.C. Heath & Company 1929. Chapter XIV.

McClintock, Miller "Problem of Fire Waste and Insurance Rates
in Boston". - City of Boston Printing Department
1929. Part III, Chapter XV.

Munro, W. B. "The Government of American Cities"

- MacMillan Company, New York 1928.

Chapters I-V, VII, XII, XIV-XV, XVIII.

Seasongood, Murray "Local Government in the United States"

- Harvard University Press 1933.

Lectures IV and V. Latest views.

Steffens, Lincoln "Autobiography"

- Harcourt Brace & Company New York 1931

Chapters XXXV and XXXVI.

Studenski, Paul "The Government of Metropolitan Areas in the
United States" - National Municipal League 1930

Chapters I, III, XIV-XVI, XIX. Invaluable on the
creation and functioning of metropolitan organizations.

Warner, Sam B. "Crime and Criminal Statistics in Boston"

- Harvard University Press 1934

All. Demonstrates futility of trying to arrive at
conclusions from statistics.

Willoughby, W.F. "Principles of Public Administration"

- John Hopkins Press 1927

Part IV "Finance" Chapter XXVIII.

Maxey, Chester C. "Urban Democracy" - H.C. Heath & Company 1929. Chapter XIV.

McMillan, Walter "Principles of Fine Arts and Insurance Rates in Boston". - City of Boston Printing Department 1929. Part III, Chapter XV.

Watts, W. R. "The Government of American Cities" - MacMillan Company, New York 1928.

Chapters I-V, VII, XII, XIV-XV, XVII.

Reynolds, Murray "Local Government in the United States" - Harvard University Press 1933.

Lectures IV and V. Latest views.

Steffens, Lincoln "Autobiography" - Harcourt Brace & Company New York 1931.

Chapters XXXV and XXXVI.

Stoddard, Paul "The Government of Metropolitan Areas in the United States" - National Municipal League 1930.

Chapters I, III, XIV-XVI, XIX. Invaluable on the creation and functioning of metropolitan organizations.

Warner, Sam A. "Urban and Criminal Statistics in Boston" - Harvard University Press 1934.

III. Demonstrates utility of trying to arrive at conclusions from statistics.

Wilkinson, W. F. "Principles of Public Administration" - John Hopkins Press 1937.

Part IV "Finance" - Chapter XXVIII.

2. Pamphlets, Booklets, Reports etc.

Acts of Massachusetts General Court. 1924. Chapter 479.

Annual Reports of City of Boston Departments 1912-1933.

Annual Reports of Private Hospitals

Boston Finance Commission Reports

Boston Health League Pamphlets

Boston Chamber of Commerce Reports

Boston Municipal Research Bulletins and Briefs

City Council Document "Boston Organization and Administration"

"City Record"

"Citizens' Handbook" (Women's Municipal League)

"Directory of Social Agencies Boston 1932"

Good Government Association pamphlets

"Health and Wealth" L.F.Dublin

"Mothers and their Babies cared for at the Boston City Hospital"

H.W.Bridges

Newspaper files (Transcript, Monitor, and Herald)

"Physicians Handbook" Massachusetts General Hospital

Radio speeches of Henry Parkman Jr. 1933

"Social Statistics" Boston Council of Social Agencies.

BOSTON UNIVERSITY



1 1719 02556 3448

